

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 410 376

CE 074 377

TITLE Adult Learning: A Key for the 21st Century. CONFINTEA V Background Papers (Hamburg, Germany, July 14-18, 1997).

INSTITUTION United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization, Hamburg (Germany). Inst. for Education.; German Adult Education Association, Bonn (Germany). Inst. for International Cooperation.

ISSN ISSN-0342-7633

PUB DATE 1997-00-00

NOTE 233p.

PUB TYPE Collected Works - Serials (022) -- Reports - Research (143)

JOURNAL CIT Adult Education and Development; spec iss 1997

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC10 Plus Postage.

DESCRIPTORS Access to Education; Adult Education; *Adult Learning; Adult Literacy; Aging (Individuals); Cooperative Planning; Correctional Education; Distance Education; *Education Work Relationship; Educational Change; Educational Environment; *Educational Finance; Educational Needs; Educational Planning; Educational Practices; Educational Quality; Educational Technology; Empowerment; Environmental Education; Equal Education; Foreign Countries; Global Education; Government Role; Government School Relationship; Health Education; Health Promotion; Information Technology; *International Cooperation; International Educational Exchange; Labor Force Development; Literacy Education; Migrant Education; Minority Groups; Multicultural Education; Nonformal Education; Refugees; Special Needs Students; Womens Education

IDENTIFIERS Nongovernmental Organizations

ABSTRACT

The following papers are included: "Foreword" (Jakob Horn, Paul Belanger); "Internationalization and Globalization" (Ove Korsgaard); "Adult Learning and the Challenges of the 21st Century" (Marc-Laurent Hazoume); "Diversity in Adult Education: Some Key Concepts in Minority and Indigenous Issues" (Linda King de Jardon); "The Culture of Peace: The UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization) Perspective" (David Adams); "Literacy on the Eve of CONFINTEA: Observations, Questions and Action Plans" (Jean-Paul Hautecoeur); "Learning Gender Justice: The Challenge for Adult Education in the 21st Century" (Carolyn Medel-Anonuevo); "Adult Education and the Changing World of Work. Focal Points of Change" (R. Barry Hobart); "Environmental NGOs (Nongovernmental Organizations) and Adult Education as 21st Century Partners in Civil Society--from the Local to the Global Level" (Rene Karottki); "The Environment: A Unifying Theme for Adult Education" (Walter Leal Filho); "From Words to Action: Environmental Adult Education" (Darlene E. Clover); "Environmental Adult Education: A Factor in Sustainable Development on the Eve of the 3rd Millennium" (Adoum N'Gaba-Waye); "Health Education and Health Promotion" (Health Education and Health Promotion Unit, Division of Health Promotion, Education and Communication, World Health Organization); "Population Education for Adults" (O.J. Sikes); "Adult Learning, Media, Culture and New Information and Communication Technologies" (Chris Cavanagh); "Adult Education and Aging. Trends and Critical Issues" (Paul Belanger, Rosa

+++++ ED410376 Has Multi-page SFR---Level=1 +++++

M. Falgas); "Moving across Borders, Cultures and Mindsets: Prospects for Migrant and Refugee Education in the 21st Century" (Carolyn Medel-Anonuevo); "Education in Prisons: Key Words for Freedom" (Marc De Maeyer); "Economics of Adult Education and Training" (Albert C. Tuijnman); "Economics of Non-Formal Education" (Manzoor Ahmed); "Enhancing International Cooperation and Solidarity" (Paul Fordham). Also included is "Adult Learning: Empowerment for Local and Global Change in the Twenty-First Century: A Discussion Guide." (MN)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

ED 410 376

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

☒ This document has been reproduced as
received from the person or organization
originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to
improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this
document do not necessarily represent
official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND
DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL
HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

CA McINTOSH

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC).

**ADULT
LEARNING
A KEY FOR
THE 21ST
CENTURY**

**HAMBURG
14-18 JULY '97**



DOZ DWV

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

**SPECIAL ISSUE
OF ADULT
EDUCATION
AND
DEVELOPMENT**

2

CE 074 377

CONFINTEA V
BACKGROUND PAPERS



CONFINTEA V

BACKGROUND PAPERS

SPECIAL ISSUE OF »ADULT EDUCATION AND DEVELOPMENT«

Joint publication by the Institute for International Cooperation
of the German Adult Education Association (IIZ/DVV), Bonn
and the UNESCO Institute for Education (UIE), Hamburg

ADULT EDUCATION AND DEVELOPMENT

is a half-yearly journal for adult education in Africa, Asia and Latin America. At first, in 1973, the journal was intended by the German Adult Education Association (DVV) to help keep in touch with past participants in DVV further training seminars and to support the work of projects abroad. Today, the journal is a forum for dialogue and the exchange of information between adult educators and authors in Africa, Asia and Latin America, both among themselves and with colleagues in the industrialized nations. It is intended to disseminate and discuss new experiences and developments in the theory and practice of adult education. The main target group consists of adult educators working at so-called middle levels in teaching, organization or administration. Increasingly, staff in related fields such as health education, agriculture, vocational training, cooperative organizations etc. have been included, as their tasks are clearly adult education tasks. We also aim at adult educators at higher and top levels, academics, library staff and research institutions both in Africa, Asia and Latin America and in the industrialized nations.

We herewith invite adult educators from all parts of the world to contribute to this journal. Articles should bear a considerable reference to practice. All fields of adult education and development can be treated, i.e. adult education should be regarded in its widest sense. We kindly ask you to send us articles of about 1500 words; footnotes should be used as sparingly as possible.

Responsible for contents are the authors. Signed articles do not always represent the opinion of the German Adult Education Association. You are invited to reproduce and reprint the articles provided acknowledgement is given and a copy is sent to us.

ADULT EDUCATION AND DEVELOPMENT is published by the Institute for International Cooperation of the German Adult Education Association (IIZ/DVV).

Address:

Institut für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
des Deutschen Volkshochschul-Verbandes (IIZ / DVV)
Obere Wilhelmstrasse 32 · D-53225 Bonn

Director: Jakob Horn

Editors: Heribert Hinzen / Michael Samlowski

Secretariat: Gisela Waschek

Composition, Layout, Repro: DK Kierzkowski, Bonn

Printer: Thenée Druck, Bonn

ISSN 0342-7633

INSTITUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION OF THE GERMAN ADULT EDUCATION ASSOCIATION
INSTITUT DE COOPERATION INTERNATIONALE DE LA CONFEDERATION ALLEMANDE POUR L'EDUCATION DES ADULTES
INSTITUTO DE LA COOPERACION INTERNACIONAL DE LA ASOCIACION ALEMANA PARA EDUCACION DE ADULTOS
ИНСТИТУТ ПО МЕЖДУНАРОДНОМУ СОТРУДНИЧЕСТВУ НЕМЕЦКОЙ АССОЦИАЦИИ НАРОДНЫХ УНИВЕРСИТЕТОВ

**INSTITUT FÜR INTERNATIONALE ZUSAMMENARBEIT
DES DEUTSCHEN VOLKSHOCHSCHUL-VERBANDES e.V.**



Foreword	5	
 <i>Theme 1:</i>		
Adult Learning and the Challenges of the Twenty-First Century		1
Ove Korsgaard		
Internationalization and Globalization	9	
Marc-Laurent Hazoumé		
Adult Learning and the Challenges of the Twenty-First Century	29	
Linda King de Jardón		
Diversity in Adult Education:		
Some Key Concepts in Minority and Indigenous Issues	43	
David Adams		
The Culture of Peace: The UNESCO Perspective	53	
 <i>Theme 2:</i>		
Improving the Conditions and Quality of Adult Learning		2
Note	59	
 <i>Theme 3:</i>		
Ensuring the Universal Right of Adults and Out-of-School Youth to Literacy and Basic Education		3
Jean-Paul Hauteœur		
Literacy on the Eve of CONFITEA:		
Observations, Questions and Action Plans	63	
 <i>Theme 4:</i>		
Promoting the Empowerment of Women through Adult Learning		4
Carolyn Medel-Añonuevo		
Learning Gender Justice: The Challenge for Adult Education in the 21st Century	81	
 <i>Theme 5:</i>		
Adult Learning in a Changing World of Work		5
R. Barry Hobart		
Adult Education and the Changing World of Work:		
Focal Points of Change	93	
 <i>Theme 6:</i>		
Adult Learning in the Context of Environment, Health and Population		6
Four Perspectives on Environmental Education for Adults	113	
René Karotki		
I. Environmental NGOs and Adult Education as 21st Century.		
Partners in Civil Society — from the Local to the Global Level	114	
Walter Leal Filho		
II. The Environment: A Unifying Theme for Adult Education	117	
Darlene E. Clover		
III. From Words to Action: Environmental Adult Education	120	
Adoum N'Gaba-Waye		
IV. Environmental Adult Education: A Factor in Sustainable Development on the Eve of the 3rd Millennium	123	

	HEP/HPR/WHO	
	Health Education and Health Promotion	129
	O.J. Sikes	
	Population Education for Adults	135
7	<i>Theme 7:</i>	
	Adult Learning, Media, Culture and New Information Technology	
	Chris Cavanagh	
	Adult Learning, Media, Culture and New Information and Communication Technologies	143
8	<i>Theme 8:</i>	
	Adult Learning and Groups with Special Needs	
	Paul Bélanger in cooperation with Rosa M. Falgás	
	Adult Education and Aging. Trends and Critical Issues	161
	Carolyn Medel-Añonuevo	
	Moving Across Borders, Cultures and Mindsets: Prospects for Migrant and Refugee Education in the 21st Century	165
	Marc De Maeyer	
	Education in Prison: Key Words for Freedom	172
9	<i>Theme 9:</i>	
	The Economics of Adult Learning	
	Albert C. Tuijnman	
	Economics of Adult Education and Training	189
	Manzoor Ahmed	
	Economics of Non-Formal Education	199
10	<i>Theme 10:</i>	
	Enhancing International Cooperation and Solidarity	
	Paul Fordham	
	Enhancing International Cooperation and Solidarity	209
A Discussion Guide	Adult Learning: Empowerment for Local and Global Change in the Twenty-First Century	231
	List of Authors	241

Foreword

The Fifth International Conference on Adult Education, Hamburg 1997, directly follows on from the tradition of the earlier world conferences held in 1949 in Elsinore, 1960 in Montreal, 1972 in Tokyo and most recently in 1985 in Paris. These meetings were also concerned with assessing the contemporary situation of adult learning and looking to the future, generally the next decade. This time the field to be covered is even larger — «Adult Learning: A Key for the Twenty-First Century», with far-reaching goals such as

- » 1. To **acknowledge** the critical **importance of adult learning**;
2. To **forge** worldwide **commitments** to the right to learn of adults;
3. To **exchange** experience on present provision and needed improvements;
4. To **recommend** future **policy and priorities** and adopt a **Declaration on Adult Learning** and an **Agenda for the Future**;
5. To **promote** international **cooperation**. « (UNESCO, 1996)

The anticipated outcomes of the Conference are vast, and the preparations that went into it were similarly far reaching and intensive. We shall mention only two here: firstly, the regional conferences that were held in 1996 and 1997, at which regional development trends and priorities were pooled, analysed and discussed. Secondly, something should be said about the preparations of the actual content: the Conference focuses on ten themes, to be treated in their respective working groups. These were preceded by preparatory meetings and a number of drafts of working documents for the various themes.

This collection brings together the documents of most of the working groups. It will be made available to all participants in Hamburg so that they will have an overview of the current state of discussion before and during the sessions. 20,000 copies of the journal «Adult Education and Development» will be published during autumn 1997 containing the thematic papers, together with other major outcomes of the Conference, principally in order to reach many of the adult educators who were not able to come to Hamburg. That will be one important step towards a follow-up strategy.

Almost all of the papers were written especially for CONFITEA, partly as a result of a lengthy process of thorough discussion and agreement. Unfortunately, not all the papers for the working groups were produced, or were not delivered in time.

This volume is a further significant product of the very fruitful collaboration between our two Institutes in recent years. Many people have helped to bring it about. We should like to acknowledge their work and offer them our thanks.

Jakob Horn, Director
Institute for International Cooperation
of the German Adult Education
Association, Bonn

Paul Bélanger, Director
UNESCO Institute for Education,
Hamburg

Technical note:

The second theme, «Improving the Conditions and Quality of Adult Learning», includes five sub-themes (namely «University», «Research», «Documentation», «Educational Politics» and «Monitoring of Adult Learning», which represent transversal areas of action and reflection within the overall field of organized adult learning. Consequently, there is no chapter in this publication on theme «2» even though the sub-themes mentioned above will be the object of specific working groups during the Conference.

In order to include a specialized introduction to theme 9: «The Economics of Adult Learning», we have included abridged versions of relevant contributions drawn from the International Encyclopedia of Adult Education and Training, edited by A.C. Tuijnman, with the kind permission of Pergamon.

Additionally we publish «Adult Learning: Empowerment for Local and Global Change in the Twenty-First Century. A Discussion Guide» in order to stimulate and orientate the deliberations on the essential issues.

Because of the extremely short time available for preparing this issue in three languages, working without original documents from a variety of sources in different languages, neither we as editors nor our translators were able to trace the original version of every single quotation in every one of the documents mentioned. They therefore had to make their own translations in some cases, even though they knew that authorized translations must exist in the relevant languages. In these cases, we add an explanatory «Our translation» to the reference.



CONFINTEA V

THEME 1:

***Adult Learning
and the
Challenges of
the Twenty-First
Century***

Ove Korsgaard

Internationalization and Globalization

1

Globalization — A New Word

«When the rhythm of the drum beat changes, the corresponding dancing steps also change». So tells an African proverb. The word globalization indicates that the rhythm of the drum beat is changing. At all the regional UNESCO conferences leading up to Hamburg, globalization has been a key word. A quotation from the African declaration, made at the regional conference in Dakar in 1996, summarizes the general trend: «The globalization of exchanges and the resulting interdependence, like the competition for acquisition of the excellence that it engenders, nurture the prodigious development of science and technology and make knowledge and intelligence the materials and tools at the same time.»¹

The word globalization has not been used at the four previous conferences about adult education. Why, then, has it been incorporated in the Fifth International Conference? Is it that globalization has become a fashionable word? Or is it that adult education is now being confronted with new issues which are best addressed by using the concept globalization?

This paper does not try to cover all aspects of the connection between adult education, democracy, citizenship, civil society, empowerment and peace. On the basis of the last two years' discussion in the Association for World Education, it looks first and foremost at new aspects caused by globalization.²

Internationalization and Globalization

There is an important difference between the two concepts: international and global. Historically and conceptually the word international is connected with the word national and is based on the assumption that the decisive actors on the international scene are stable national states. For example, the UN and UNESCO are premised on the fact that it is the national states which are the legitimate foundation of these institutions.

The word global on the other hand is not counterpoised in the same way, but is contrasted with the word local. The global and the local are mutually deeply connected, which is expressed in the slogans »Think globally — act locally« and »Think locally — act globally«.

We may distinguish between the increased internationalization of economic intercourse, and the emergence of a qualitatively new global economy. The world-wide international economy is one in which the principal entities are nation states; it involves the growing interconnection between national economies. Interconnections are of the »billiard ball« type; international events do not directly penetrate and permeate the domestic economy, but are reflected through national policies.

Economic globalization on the other hand involves qualitative change towards a system in which distinct national economies are subsumed and re-articulated into the system essentially by international processes and transactions.

The international system becomes autonomized as markets and production become truly global. Whereas intensified economic interdependence involves more of the same in the sense that economic intercourse between national economies increases, true economic globalization invokes a qualitative shift towards a global economic system that is no longer based on autonomous national economies but on a consolidated global marketplace for production, distribution and consumption. Here the global economy dominates the national economies existing within it.³

Information Technology and Globalization

Trends towards globalization are transforming in very uneven ways finance, currency, trade, employment, social systems, communication, modes of living,

the formation of societies, the deep-rooted structures underlying national societies, governance patterns — and adult education and training.

In particular, the progress of information technology seems to be a decisive force behind globalization. As a result of extensive technical investment the cost of storing a given unit of information, of processing it and of transmitting it over intercontinental distances has declined by factors of a million to one hundred million — efficiency gains that appear to be the most radical in all of economic history to date. The inherent capacity for handling massive amounts of information is both enabling and requiring global economic activities to be organized on a global scale. The process is breaking down the barriers between national economies, diluting their separate identities and inducing an unusually rapid shift in their internal patterns of employment. It has different effects on men and women, the rich and the poor, the industrialized and the less industrialized.

1

In the global market economy the importance of world trade continues to grow, and multinational companies whose turn-over often exceeds the economic resources of small domestic economies are gearing themselves to global business strategies; every day on the international money markets, hundreds of billions of dollars are traded, only a fraction of which goes into trade in commodities. Financially speaking there is already **one world**.⁴

The global »flow« of capital weakens the possibility that a nation state can carry out an economic policy based on national premises. Increasingly, national governments are unable to control the international capital which, with supersonic speed, crosses their borders. To compensate for this loss of political capability, new international institutions have been created in order to regulate and coordinate economic policy, for example the World Trade Organization, the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank, the Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries and the European Union.

But at the same time as regional economic blocks and regional integrative mechanisms are being worked out, regional, national and ethnic differentiation and tensions are reappearing. The rapid expansion of communication and transport is not only making a global economy, it is also breaking down traditional economic and social structures.

Skyscrapers and Shanty Towns

Globalization has redrawn the world economic map. New centres of vigorous growth based on world trade have emerged in the Pacific rim. On the other hand whole regions are being economically and politically marginalized. Globalization is clearly an uneven process, accompanied by fragmentation and marginalization.

The majority of women and men in the world do not participate in the industrial heartland of nations and regions. Many of them subsist in the »shanty-town economy« in the shadows of the cities.

Fragmentation and marginalization are also beginning to make an appearance in the wealthy industrial countries. Through the process of international competition, social policies and employment protection regulations are being cut back, and the number of the unemployed and the »working poor« is increasing.

Globalization tends to break down the division of the world into North, South, East and West, and instead to produce a dual-economy system all over the world. Each nation, each region and the world in general consists of skyscrapers and shanty towns, existing side by side. They are not separate and exclusive ways of life, but integrally bound up with one another, different manifestations of an integral reality: a global skyscraper and shanty-town economy.⁵

Population Growth

In the age of globalization another phenomenon is occurring of comparable magnitude and significance. The demographic momentum that already has been established will produce a historically unique surge over the next few decades. It took all of human history up to 1800 to reach the level of one billion people and roughly 125 years to add the second billion. According to some estimates, there will be at least 8.7 billion people alive in 2025, compared with 5 billion today.

That there is a tension between economic globalization and population growth is evident. So far at least, economic globalization has first of all produced wealth in the Western industrial societies. In these societies population is stationary or may decline, while for example Kenya's population will be three times today's in 2025. It is difficult to imagine that social coherence will be preserved de-

cade after decade with economic growth occurring at the top of the prosperity pyramid and population growth at the bottom. Those societies that do not produce a more equitable pattern of development will be in serious trouble, and the world as a whole will be very insecure if too many of its societies fail to achieve basic standards of equity.⁶

Sustainable Development

The challenge for the twenty-first century is to find the way between Rio and Copenhagen, between the environment and social development, between the Earth Summit and the Social Summit.

At the World Summit on Social Development, held in Copenhagen in 1995, it was for the very first time in history decided to eradicate poverty. The Summit made a political, ethical, social, and even an economic statement: it is now an imperative of humankind to eradicate poverty.

The economic demands of this fundamental requirement are impressive. It is without any doubt necessary to achieve a more equal distribution of the prosperity in the world, but simple redistribution policies do not give an acceptable outcome. There are too few rich and too many poor for any feasible amount of generosity in the form of income or wealth transfers to be the basic answer. Adequate standards of equity will have to be achieved through broadly distributed growth.

But at the same time the World Summit on Environment and Development, held in Rio in 1992, made it clear that it is necessary to change the forces that are moving the world towards the destruction of the natural resources of our planet. Not only will unlimited material growth produce a still greater deterioration in global ecology, but sufficient resources simply do not exist for the world's population to adopt ways of life comparable to those in First World societies. Ecological problems highlight the new and accelerating interdependence of global systems and bring home to everyone the depth of the connection between personal activity and planetary problems.

The problems of the environment are different for the rich and the poor, for men and for women. The high income countries reduce sustainability by their unrestrained demand for ever higher production of a resource-intensive, polluting character, with the accompanying damage that this causes. In poor coun-

1

tries, the demand for food and fuel by the rapidly growing and poor population leads to deforestation, soil erosion, silting, and depletion of water supplies. The poor not only contribute to local environmental degradation, but also suffer most from it.⁷

It is women, certainly in the poor countries, who are most affected by environment degradation. Therefore, the link between women's empowerment and the development of new values in relation to the environment is critical. There is a strong argument for women to be placed at the centre of development in the twenty-first century. Another key to the next century seems to be a radical lifestyle change in the developed countries. A de-emphasis on continual economic accumulation will almost certainly be necessary if the ecological risks we now face are to be minimized.⁸ The ecological risks place mankind in a new form of togetherness. It will not extinguish the conflict between rich and poor but will define it in a new way based on global limits as a common denominator.

As Jacques Delors says in «Learning: The treasure within», «The truth is that all-out economic growth can no longer be viewed as the ideal way of reconciling material progress with equity, respect for the human condition and respect for the natural assets that we have a duty to hand on in good condition to future generations».⁹

Adult Education and Training

What is the role of adult education and training within a context of globalization? How is adult education affected by the process of globalization?

In many countries, from Japan to Sweden, the same conclusion is to be heard: If we are to compete, to develop, to survive, the most critical resource to rely on is people's talent and energies. All nations are faced with the fact that knowledge seems to be an ever more decisive factor in industrial production and global competition.

A great number of national and international reports point to education and training as a key factor in global economic competition.

The White Book from the European Commission on «Growth, Competition and Employment. Challenges and Ways into the 21st Century» (1993) stresses

the importance of a massive effort in the field of education and training. It is pointed out that competition especially demands the fundamental ability to acquire new knowledge and new skills, e.g. »to learn to learn all through life«. The fundamental qualifications today comprise: »The ability to develop oneself and function in a complex environment with a high degree of technology«.

Another White Book from the European Commission on »Teaching and Learning. Towards the Knowledge-Based Society« (1995) makes it clear: »The countries of Europe today have no other option. If they are to hold their own and continue to be a reference point in the world they have to build on the progress made along the road to European Union by more substantial investment in their knowledge base«.

»Agenda 2000« from the Swedish Ministry of Education (1994) also places importance on highly developed human capital as a key factor in greater international competition. »Knowledge and competencies are the most important prerequisites for successful change. Knowledge will be the most important means to promote Sweden's competitiveness. The culture of learning must characterize our society«.

Also in Japan, education and training are placed on top of the political agenda. According to Professor Yoshio Katagiri, education is today the matter of most concern for parents and children in Japan. They live in a so-called »education-record society« where the »entrance exam war« governs their lives.¹⁰ In Japan, about 50% of the adult population take part in adult education and training.

Education and training have increasingly become the principal forces for each individual, enterprise and nation, because:

- education is a decisive factor for income and employment possibilities throughout life;
- education is a key variable for the competitiveness of enterprises on the global market;
- education is of overwhelming importance in determining each nation's position in global competition.

The concept of education and learning throughout life has emerged as one of the keys to the twenty-first century. Education which hitherto has been con-

nected to a certain phase in life has now become a lifelong necessity. This implies that the whole lifespan, which so far has not been given priority in educational policies, has now become the cornerstone in the renewal process of society. Adult education is now part of continuing education and lifelong learning.

Worldwide, participation in adult education and training is highly differentiated on class, gender, race, and ethnic lines as there is a correlation between the levels of prior educational attainment and participation in adult education and training. Unless adult education and training consciously counter the trend they could be contributing to creating even greater differentiation in the society.

Historically, there are two different and important theoretical and ideological stands which argue for lifelong learning. The concept was introduced by UNESCO in the late 1960s and it was related to a humanistic tradition and connected with democracy and self-development. Around 1980, however, the position of UNESCO was clearly weakened and the OECD obtained an increasing influence on educational policies, especially in Western countries. The new understanding of lifelong learning was based on a neo-liberal concept regarding education as an investment in »human capital« and »human resource development«. The theory of human capital expressed a view concerning the economic reasons for adult education and training, but had almost nothing to say about democracy and social justice. The humanistic and democratic tradition was more or less replaced by a version framed within a new politico-economic imperative.

In the 1960s the pressure for an expansion of educational opportunities had strong social roots. A more even distribution of investment in education would equalize individual earnings. This assumption was important because it linked the economic justification for education reform with social demands for equal opportunity. Greater equity in educational opportunity was seen as a major leveling force in society. It was democratization through education. In policy documents from various countries written since the 1980s, the erosion of a commitment to equality and the total dominance of the economic imperative is very evident.

Another significant shift between the 1960s and the 1990s is the use of the terms adult education and training. In the 1960s they coexisted as two separate tracks barely communicating with one another. The former was concerned mainly with democratic, political and cultural issues, whilst the latter was focused on work-related skills training. But in the 1990s, at least in some parts of

of the world, adult education and vocational training are not any longer seen as discrete entities. This move to integration is in UNESCO expressed in the use of the term »adult learning«.

The current discussion about education accentuates highly developed human capital, science and technology to support economic restructuring and greater international competitiveness through increased productivity. The fact that adult education and training are increasingly governed by economic goals makes it necessary to consider the traditional link between adult education, citizenship, democracy and civil society. There is every reason to place renewed emphasis on the political and moral dimension of education. Globalization calls for new forms of cooperation, democracy and global governance; although generally acknowledged, in a world of competitiveness among distinct nation states they are as yet only weakly developed. But as described by the Lisbon Group, the logic of globalization ipso facto demands, in the long term, certain limitations of the mechanisms of competition as a unique principle for modern societies.¹¹ According to such views, adult education should not only have competition, but also cooperation as a goal. Lifelong education and education for life are not necessarily the same.

Education for Democratic Citizenship

Globalization forces us to rethink what we take for granted. It is necessary to review some issues in the relation between capitalism, the nation state, democracy and citizenship.

The emergence of the modern understanding of citizenship in the West was associated particularly with the advent of capitalism and of centralized nation states in the sixteenth to seventeenth centuries. Citizenship was finally given voice as a massively influential political concept in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries by the events of the English, American and French Revolutions. The »natural rights« and »Rights of Man« announced by these revolutions, their concepts of »liberty, equality and fraternity« and their attempts to found the modern nation state constitutionally on the will of the people helped to construct the modern Western conception of citizenship.

In his classical study »Citizens and Social Class« (1963) T.H. Marshall outlined three phases in the development of citizenship from the sixteenth to the twentieth centuries: first civil rights, then political rights and then social rights.¹²

1

The dominant paradigm of citizenship was developed in the postwar West through various forms of »national functionalism«. This concept refers to the functional interdependence or symbiosis which was developed and maintained between the major societal sectors — namely the economy, polity and culture — and their systems of institutions in modern society. Another way of referring to this type of societal arrangement is to see it as a de facto »national social contract«. The contract was formed between democratic nation states and the nationally based and organized industrial capitalist economies to which they played host.¹³

Both the welfare state and the welfare market were central to this accommodation. Capitalism would undertake to deliver employment and income, in return for various state services. The state would undertake to produce and reproduce a healthy labour force with relevant skills via an educational and welfare state.

Marshall acknowledged the underlying tension or »war« between capitalism on the one hand and democratic citizenship and social justice on the other. Nonetheless, he also implied that the accommodation between capitalism and democracy in the postwar period represented an event of historical and lasting significance for modern Western society. The »war« could be controlled, the warriors pacified and capitalism »civilized«.

However, evidently the »war« is not over. The globalization of economies makes it more difficult to sustain regulation-models which are based on the welfare-state and Keynesian policies, which have underpinned economic policies since World War II, especially in Western Europe. Keynesianism was premised on the idea that national economies were real. The acceleration in globalization since the mid-1970s has nevertheless caused a loss of effectiveness of national policies in the sphere of welfare.

Given the failures of the welfare state, arguably a new social contract is needed between capitalism and its host societies.

Looking to the future, it is reasonable to assume that a large part of the future politics of social citizenship will be concerned with an attempt to repair these arrangements at the national state level. In addition, new sorts of functional and social contract arrangements at local, regional and global levels are likely to be sought and to be developed.

Citizenship is an important concept in the late twentieth century. Whether in the form of democratic movements, or of nationalist movements, the historic changes set in motion since the late 1980s in Eastern Europe, Latin America and South Africa have been produced largely by movements of citizens striving to realize or to redefine their citizenship rights and citizen community.

In Western Europe the increasing economic, legal and political integration of the European Community is beginning to challenge national sovereignty and citizenship. In addition, it is also beginning to involve the creation of a new transnational European level and sphere of citizen's rights, institutions and community. In North America the meaning of US citizenship is being challenged in many states, not least in California, by the massive growth of the Spanish-speaking population. Elsewhere in North America, Quebec separatism continues to challenge Canadian nationhood and citizenship.¹⁴

Feminism involves demands for women's rights and social justice — and many of these demands are indeed claims against the state, for instance demands for the satisfaction of basic welfare needs. But many are also calls for equality within the state, the market and civil society, demands for equal citizenship in all arenas and at all levels. However, the primary thrust for equity and social justice for women cannot be divorced from other inequities based on race, ethnicity, class, or geography. They are all interconnected.¹⁵

Feminism in modern society challenges the masculine structures of the state, market and civil society; it challenges men in modern society to recognize the existence of the patriarchal order and of the manifold ways in which they both dominate women's lives and benefit from so doing. Advancing the cause of women's equality challenges men to accept a duty to change themselves and to change their ways of relating to women in order to honour those rights. In effect feminism challenges men to accept a duty to act against the patriarchal order in which women are second-class citizens and to act for equality, a society of equal citizenship.

Also the ecological movement is concerned with the politics and morality of duty. Of course it champions rights, and it does so in two distinct registers. In the first register ecology champions the rights of non-humans (animals, the environments, nature etc.). Nature's rights thus imply duties for humans. Ecology thus addresses itself to the often agonising debates and struggles within and between modern states and societies, and indeed within each indi-

1

viduel, between on the one hand human needs, desires and rights and on the other hand duties we impose on ourselves by our recognition, such as it is, of the rights of the non-human.

In its second register ecology champions nature and the environment on behalf of posterity. Thus generations of humans as yet unborn are assumed to have rights to an environment at least as resource-rich and as undegraded and undamaged as the one the present generation inherited. The »rights of future generations« are thus deemed to impose duties of environmental »stewardship« on all individuals, communities, organizations and nations. Like nature, future generations cannot reciprocate the performance of duties. It seems reasonable to argue that in this way an intergenerational moral relationship or community exists in human affairs. This implies that all explicitly or implicitly purely intra-generational conceptions of social justice of the proper distribution of ecological and other forms of welfare must incorporate an inter-generational element which imposes a set of unreciprocated duties on the present generation to provide ecological welfare to future generations.

Ecology challenges the dominant paradigm of citizenship. It expands the sphere of our relevant civil society and citizenship in two ways: it expands this sphere beyond the national state level to the global level and to other ecologically relevant levels from the global to the local; also it expands it beyond the present generation and requires us to consider the inter-generational dimension of our sociality and our moral and citizenship duties.¹⁶

In the early twenty-first century the politics of citizenship will need to go beyond the nation state and the welfare state. They will need to grasp the emerging structural complexity and the new post-industrial and post-national dynamics influencing citizenship, from family and local levels to the transnational level and the inter-generational sphere. They will need to transform the general nature of citizenship to ensure that women become full and equal participants at all levels in all spheres.

The new agendas for politics regarding citizenship in the future must, of course, continue to be concerned with nationally defined citizenship and with the future of the welfare state. But they also need to be sensitive to these new developments.

The period in which it was possible to conceive of citizenship in general and social citizenship in national and welfare state terms has clearly come to an

end. New positive myths and ideals of citizenship rights are developing, such as those involving notions of »the Earth's rights«, the »rights of the unborn« and »global citizenship«. They enrich and complicate the more conventional modern myths and ideals relating to citizenship, such as those involving notions of human equality, of place and territorial identity, of nation and heritage.

These new ideals of citizenship open up possibilities of slowly dissolving the historical connection between nation state and »civil citizen«. Such a development would nourish the concept that it is not only national solidarity which counts but also the global entity.

Adult Learning and Democracy

The concepts of the nation and of democracy have been considered cornerstones in modern societies. Historically, the modern type of democracy was born within the frame of a nation state. The national struggles for freedom in the 19th and 20th centuries were fought in the belief that democracy, human rights and social justice are central elements in the establishment of a sovereign state.

Traditionally, adult education and popular education have played an important role in many democratic movements, connected more with social, political, cultural and personal development than economic development. In the 1970s and 1980s adult and popular education played a crucial role in national and democratic movements within countries such as the Philippines, Chile, Hungary, Poland and South Africa.

From the beginning in UNESCO there was a close connection between adult education and popular education. In the very first article of the Constitution establishing UNESCO, paragraph 2(b), a direct reference was made to popular education, asking the new UN organization and the Member States to »give fresh impulse to popular education and to the spread of culture«.¹⁷

Democracy and the possibility to learn, individually and collectively, have been seen as closely interrelated. It has been a fundamental idea that democracy in the very last instance is built on adult and popular education.

In the liberal tradition adult education is primarily concerned with individual self-empowerment. The goal is to empower the individual's character, abilities

1

and capacities with a sense of unique personal meaning. Adult education means bringing out the individual nature in each man and woman to its true fullness and so bringing about the expression of their individual uniqueness. Education involves personal transformation and change. In this education reveals itself to be a human endeavour in which education and change are dynamically dependent, for without education there can be no change and without change there can be no education. In the educational encounter between the individual and other persons, knowledge and understanding are passed on in such a way that they develop a life of their own in the unique experience of the individual person while at the same time bringing about a transformation of how the individual sees the world, and hence feels about it.

In the communitarian tradition adult education is seen as an attempt to empower the »community«, the »people«, the »folk«, or the »class«. Adult education has to create a strong sense of utility and initiate a process of nation-building. Both the workers' educational movements in different countries and the Folk High School movements in the Scandinavian countries were based on a strong communitarian ideology. The former emphasized the working class as the community, the latter the nation and the »folk«. Because democracy has to be built within a community, adult and popular education should not only strengthen the individual as a human being, but also individuals as »political animals«. For the last 200 years the nation state has been seen as a necessary community for democracy.

Today, we are witnessing two powerful processes: one towards the market economy and the other towards democracy. But the nation state is not solid frame it was before. New democracies are being built within nations at a time when the nation state is becoming less important because global economic forces are inclined to minimize national borders. South Africa, for example, needs to recognize differences amongst its diverse population of 40 million people who speak eleven languages, who have been systematically organized along racial lines, and who vary widely across divisions of culture, gender, social class and religion.¹⁸

The changing relationship between economy, democracy and adult education also creates new problems in old democratic nations. According to professor M. Welton, Canada is in the midst of convulsive changes which have brought liberal democracy, the liberal tradition of democracy, and the liberal tradition of adult education into deep crises: »The two crises — of liberal democracy and of adult education — are inextricably linked«. Canadian adult education

has traditionally been concerned with issues of social action and public responsibility, and for much of the 20th century contained »moral alternatives to the market«. But this tradition has been weakened.¹⁹

What is the future of this tradition in the age of globalization? Is it still important to differentiate between education for economic development and education for democratic development?

According to the Peace Prize winner in 1991, Aung San Suu Kyi, of Burma, democracy is essential if sustained human development is to be achieved. »The true development of human beings involves much more than mere economic growth. At its heart there must be a sense of empowerment and inner fulfilment«. ²⁰ To support such a sense has to be an important aim of adult learning.

Adult Learning and Civil Society

The process of democratization is much more than democratic elections. Democracy represents also a value system in which each person has equal rights and where those who rule follow a generally accepted code of behaviour. It involves a respect for and adherence to the rules of the game in the sense that not just a top-down approach and mentality prevail, but also that there is room for a bottom-up approach, i.e. that the ordinary person in the local society can influence the agenda, can dismiss the rulers and keep them responsible and accountable.

Democracy is not only a legal system but a way of life. In other words: democracy depends on a living civil society. The conception of a civil society as a separate area in relation to the market and the state is as old as modern society but the understanding of what is meant by the civil society has changed through history.

The modern understanding of the concept came from the commoners' fight against the nobility and absolute monarchy. The civil society became a category of liberty. For liberals the state should only regulate the competition among individuals for their private goods. The liberal conception of the state forbids the state from having a public notion of good or from using its power to impose some concept of good on its citizens.²¹

It was not possible for all to accept the liberal model, which was built on an alliance between the market and the civil society against the absolute power

1

of the state. From the beginning of modern democracy there was also a communitarian model based upon the idea that a democratic society can only rest on publicly practised citizens' virtues. In the very end the prerequisite for both the market and the state is non-economic ties of confidence and solidarity.

In other words, democracy depends on moral virtues. To build a society is an art which does not originate from the state or from the market but from citizenship of the civil society. The key institutions of society, especially the educational system, have to support this art; if they do not, democracy will be destroyed.

The working class could not accept the liberal model of the civil society. This class regarded the market as a destructive force, so that it was not first of all the state but the market which should be tamed.

Within socialism, this perspective led to two different standpoints. One was expressed in the conception that the civil society was a bourgeois phenomenon which should be given up. There were only two sectors in society: the market and the state. According to this model, socialism and the state are two sides of the same coin, namely state-socialism.

The second standpoint was that the civil society, also for socialism, was an important concept. First and foremost, it was Antonio Gramsci who pointed out the importance of keeping the civil society as an independent category in socialist thinking. But this three-pole model had great difficulties within socialism, in standing up against the two-pole model. It was not only in communist ideology and practice that the civil society went out sight. Also in social-democratic welfare states it was difficult to attach an ideological and practical meaning to civil society. For many years, therefore, civil society was out of the theoretical limelight.

But in the 1980s, the concept had a revival. Impulses for this came foremost from critical intellectuals in Eastern Europe and South Africa. They found in the concept a positive framework for self-definition in opposition to the totalitarian state systems. Vis-à-vis the all-encompassing state, the dissidents tried to create a free space where they could live as citizens outside the shadow of the totalitarian state.

Also in different kinds of communitarian thinking, the civil society became an important concept in the 1980s. For the communitarians, the civil society be-

comes the place where the individual and society are mutually committed in a morally obligated community.²²

Today, it is widely accepted that the quality of democratic governance depends on the working together of two sides: on one side there is the nature of state institutions and the responsiveness and accountability of state officials; on the other there is the nature of civil society and its ability to exert control over the state apparatus. To do that depends very much on a dynamic and vigorous public sphere.

The public sphere is a central element of civil society. The distinction and the relationship between public and private spheres has been problematized by feminists in important ways. It is through institutions both in the »public« and »private« domains that members of civil society can engage in informed public debate and action upon matters of common concern, including the way in which power is distributed and developed within society.²³

There are wide variations in the ways people relate to the public sphere that are shaped by their cultur, gender, race and class in relation to society. In some societies only certain categories of citizens are entitled to such participation. But meaningful democracy presupposes the ability of all people to pool their limited resources, to form and develop ideas and programmes, put them on the political agenda, and act to support them.

Democracy depends on the favorable organization of civil society. For it is in the learning life of associations, organizations, movements and study circles that common problems, which reverberate first in individual life histories, are distilled and transmitted in amplified form to the public sphere.

Up to now the public sphere and the civil society have been based on the »international culture of the nation states«: the public sphere and the civil society have been seen as phenomena connected to a nation state. In view of globalization, the public sphere and the civil society have to globalize too, and have to find new channels and forums for communication and cooperation.²⁴

Increasing globalization is clearly a two-edged sword. On the one hand, it is quite obvious that it removes competence from the national context, and that globalization in this way undermines the institutions which hitherto have been used for communication, cooperation and social integration.

1

On the other hand, globalization perhaps opens up new possibilities for democratic influence on essential common issues which in their nature are about the framework of the nation state. Employment questions, for example, are no longer domestic problems. They have to be dealt with internationally and related to environmental issues and gender relations. Attempts to democratize are therefore forced to work for the establishment of global democratic structures, including international organs for the civil society.

The decisive question is, of course whether democracy can develop outside the shell in which it was born, namely the nation state. According to the pessimists, the relationship between democracy and the nation state is so close that democratization of international structures and institutions is bound to fail. According to the optimists a new understanding of democracy and sovereignty is in the making.

But one thing is sure: if democracy is to transcend the framework of the nation state, there must be a development of a global public sphere and a global civil society. It demands international civil structures and corresponding public experience facilities.

Such structures are hardly present in the international political process. It is first and foremost on the economic and technological level that global integration has taken place. But it cannot be in the interest of civil society to leave the regulation of this integration to market forces alone or to the naked competition between states. Instead, the fight must concern itself with the establishment of as comprehensive a global structure as possible.

Although the networking of a global civil society so far rests on a weak and insecure foundation, an increasingly internationally linked movement of Non-Governmental Organizations works from a global point of view when it deals with human rights, ecology, indigenous knowledge, social relief endeavours, and social and economic justice issues. They constitute an effective pressure group in individual areas of politics. They form the organizational core of a global civil society with a version of a global citizenship.

Today, »globalization from below«, to use Professor Richard Falk's term, is proceeding faster than one would have thought a few years ago.⁴⁵ Many of the same ideas about the local and the global are erupting all over the world. Local citizens' movements and alternative institutions are appearing to meet basic economic needs, to preserve local traditions, to establish ecological chains,

and to struggle for human rights and dignity. More and more people are crafting their own strategies for survival and development, and in the process are spinning their own transnational webs to embrace and connect people across the world.

People's participation in the economic, social, political and cultural transformation of the world is the central issue of our time. This can only be achieved through adult learning: of the people for the people and by the people.

Notes

1. Declaration on Adult Education and Lifelong Learning, from UNESCO's regional conference in Dakar, Senegal, 14-18 October 1996.
2. The Association for World Education has during the last two years organized several seminars about Theme One of the UNESCO conference: »Adult Learning and the Challenges of the Twenty-First Century«. The two main seminars were held in Gerlev, Denmark, 28-30 August 1996 and in Sopron, Hungary, 1-4 September 1996. Part of the discussion will be published in a book »Adult Learning and the Challenges of the Twenty-First Century«, edited by Ove Korsgaard, Denmark (forthcoming July 1997).
3. Holm, Hans-Enrik and Sorensen, Georg, *Whose World Order? Uneven Globalization and the End of the Cold War*, Westview Press, 1995.
4. Steinbruner, John D., *Global Economic Power and Cultural Dominance: Where Does the West's Power End?* From a speech made at the Development and Peace Foundation Symposium on The Politicization of Culture, held 9-10 December 1996, Düsseldorf, Germany.
5. Walters, Shirley (ed.), *Globalization — Rethinking Adult Education and Training: Impacts and Issues*, ZED Books, London, 1997.
6. Steinbruner, John D., *Global Economic Power and Cultural Dominance: Where does the West's Power End?*
7. *Our Creative Diversity. Report of the World Commission on Cultures and Development*, UNESCO Publishing, Paris, 1995.
8. Giddens, Anthony, *Modernity and Self-Identity. Self and Society in the Late Modern Age*, Polity Press, Cambridge, 1991.
9. *Learning: The Treasure Within. Report to UNESCO of the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century*, UNESCO Publishing, Paris, 1996.
10. Katagiri, Yoshio, *Japanese Education in the Development of Economics*, in: *The Bulletin of Aichi University of Education*, Vol. XXXVV, Kariya, Japan, 1991.
11. *Lisbon Group: Limits of competition. Towards a new world contract*, Paris, 1995.
12. Marshall, T.H., *Citizenship and Social Class*, in: *Sociology at the Cross Roads*, Heinemann, London, 1993.
13. Roche, Maurice, *Rethinking Citizenship. Welfare, Ideology and Change in Modern Society*, Polity Press, Cambridge, 1992.
14. *ibid.*

1

15. Walters, Shirley and Manicom, Linzi (ed.), *Gender in Popular Education*, CACE Publication, Zed Books, London, 1996.
16. Roche, Maurice, *op.cit.*
17. Bélanger, P. and Mobarak, H., *UNESCO and Adult Education*, in: *The International Encyclopedia of Education*, Pergamon Press, Oxford.
18. Walters, Shirley, (ed.), *Globalization... op.cit.*
19. Welton, Michael R., *The Bitter Politics of Canadian Adult Education*, in: *Journal of World Education*, 2/1995.
20. *Our Creative Diversity, op.cit.*
21. Korsgaard, Ove, *Civil Society and World Education*, in: *Journal of World Education* 2/1996; Korsgaard, Ove, *Kampen om lyset. Dansk voksenoplysning gennem 500 år*. Gyldendal 1997.
22. Korsgaard, Ove, *Adult Education, Democracy and Globalisation*, in: *Journal of World Education* 2/1995; Korsgaard, Ove, *Kampen om lyset*. Gyldendal 1997.
23. Giddens, Anthony, *The Transformation of Intimacy*, Polity Press, Cambridge, 1992.
24. World Assembly Edition, *Citizens Strengthening Global Civil Society*, CIVICUS, Washington, 1994.
25. Falk, Richard, *The Infancy of Global Civil Society*, in: Lundestad and Wastad, *Beyond the Cold War: New Dimensions in International Relations*, Oslo, 1992.
26. Association of World Education statement after Gerlev and Sopron Seminars. Nabudere, Dani W., *Journal of World Education* 3/1996.

Marc-Laurent Hazoumé

Adult Learning and the Challenges of the 21st Century

1

At the end of the second millennium, humanity still faces the task of overcoming numerous fundamental problems and major challenges. Given all the conflicts and wars that are raging across the globe, all the misunderstanding and mistrust between peoples, the widespread intolerance and growing racism, and the destruction of the notion of work, seen in concrete terms in the rising number of people who are unemployed, the greatest challenge is still unquestionably education, and especially the education of adults for peace and democracy, which will be of significant political importance in the 21st century. It is therefore necessary to examine these notions, and to set out some points of reference, in order to demonstrate how education for democracy and the creation of a culture of peace can enable people to face challenges effectively and to give meaning to their lives. However, we shall not here suggest that there is a dichotomy, which we regard as incomprehensible, between the concepts of peace and democracy, but shall try as far as possible to show that the concept of democracy derives from that of peace and is at the same time its essential basis, since all the components of democracy to be considered below necessarily come together in it. Moreover, as UNESCO states, the culture of peace is »a set of convictions, a morality and an individual and collective state of mind, a way of being, acting and reacting... It has close links with democracy and development, which are preconditions for moving from a culture of war to a culture of peace.« (Our translation)¹ Similarly, »the culture of peace rests on values, attitudes, behaviours and ways of life that re-

inforce non-violence and respect for the basic liberties and rights of every person. It is seen in the proclamation and acceptance of everyone's right to be different and to live in peace and security within his or her community.« (Our translation)²

- What are the components of the concept?
- To what do the components refer?
- What do they mean for adult education?

In arriving at a definition of the notion at issue, it is important to specify who are to be the recipients of the education to be given, to be clear about the target public, so that the content of that education can be defined in terms of the information to be provided and the education and training to be given.

1. The Components of the Concept of Democracy

The notion of democracy is made up of a number of elements that we might define as a »multiple total«. This is not only, as Özlem Ünlühisarcikli says, citing Mayo, »liberty and justice for all... an economic system of private enterprise or of socialism«³ or, more restrictively, »freedom of criticism of authority with the right to organize in opposition to authority«.⁴ Democracy is thus not only political. It goes much further. This brings us therefore, in consequence, to the suggestion that the following subdivisions make up the concept and are elements of the components of it that we have given above. We refer in particular to:

- political democracy
- economic democracy
- social and cultural democracy

However, the notion of democracy also calls for that of development. This cannot in our view be considered a component of the concept of democracy, given the fact that its own definition has multiple facets, like that of democracy. We then have to examine the relationship between the two, to reveal the impact each has on the other in the march towards democratization and the building of peace.

1.1 Political Democracy

For various political, social and economic reasons, the concept of democracy arises in all discussion nowadays, in the countries of both South and North. The »political democracy« element also appears to be linked to the relationships governing governments and the governed, rulers and the ruled. It always refers to people's quest to realize themselves without severe external constraints, and to their wish to be able freely to take part in improving their social environment. To the notion of liberty could be added elements such as equal consideration for all social groups and equality between individuals.

In the context of explaining the concept of political democracy, the notion of liberty might be related to what may be called »freedom of expression« or, more precisely, »democratic communication«. In fact, while the act of communicating implies the establishment of a relationship with someone, or merely the communication of something to another person, the qualification of the action as »democratic« strengthens the political desire to make the communication relevant. If carried out in this way, it should lead at the political level to genuine mutual understanding and a sharing of responsibilities between all social groupings, between »a minority of people prepared to operate successfully in this new world environment, which depends upon access to knowledge and technology, and a growing majority of others who are at the mercy of events«. ⁵ Democratic communication, as relevant communication that provides validation, must also bring about greater participation in civil life and effective understanding among citizens of the political actions that they take. It also gives them the ability to oppose anything which is inimical to justice or infringes people's basic rights. Lastly, it means »citizens' participation in the framework of an uninterrupted process of dialogue, discussion and agreement on the decisions affecting their lives«.

However, if democratic communication is to be relevant, the question of language, which is at the heart of its validity, must be solved correctly. The medium used must indeed be understood and accepted by everyone. This means that attention has to be given to language development so that a literate environment is created that favours not only the sharing of communication but also a knowledge of rights and duties via the written word. »...linguistic diversity cannot be viewed merely as an obstacle to communication between the various groups; rather, it should be regarded as a source of enrichment...«. ⁶ In short, »the advent of a culture of peace is indicated by sharing and free circulation of information. Secrecy, restrictions on the freedom of information and

1

expression, and the use of knowledge in the exclusive service of profit and power are the marks of a culture in which the »other« is perceived as a target for exploitation or as a potential enemy.«⁷

Another feature of political democracy is that it takes into account all social groups, including equality between the genders. It also addresses the issue of minorities and the recognition of their basic rights.

We must also mention the rights and responsibilities of civil society, »...the idea of having many independent foci of self-organization within society, through which people can work collectively to solve their own problems, which can act as channels of popular opinion and pressure upon government, and which can serve as protection against its encroachments.«⁸ Communication, which must inevitably lead towards the attainment of liberty, and hence democracy, can thus take concrete shape through civil society.

1.2 Economic Democracy

Economic democracy could be understood as the opportunity for people to organize their economic lives. It also means the promotion of endogenous development. If development is not endogenous, as UNESCO stresses, »it is in danger of going against the traditional cultural and economic context of everyday life, even of overturning it«. Democracy presupposes reinventing the concept of work in a context of reciprocal exchange so that everyone, while recognizing the value of his or her immediate surroundings, can play a part in development and realize himself or herself fully through the task to be done. Economic democracy thus linked to development could be understood in its totality as the desire to distribute equitably the goods produced by all members of society. And if development is not committed to this purpose, »it is in danger of perpetuating injustices, leading to violent conflicts«. Moreover, »if it is not sustainable, it is in danger of damaging or even destroying the existing environment and social structures«.

While economic democracy sets out to achieve genuine development, this will not only be economic. It has to aim at human development which is more global and concerns men and women in all their dimensions. It includes, as the UNESCO Inter-Parliamentary Conference has stated, »...access to knowledge, health, a clean physical environment, preservation of cultural heritage, shared

community life, democratic freedoms and other choices. « Such » human development is a process of enlarging people's choices. In principle, these choices can be infinite and can change over time. But at all levels of development, the three essential ones are for people to lead a long and healthy life, to acquire knowledge and to have access to the resources needed for a decent standard of living». ⁹ When the economic democracy element leads to human development, its entire meaning appears to be devoted to the concept of Democracy and seems, so to speak, to be the most important of the elements since it includes both political democracy and the fight against poverty, and the social and cultural element.

1.3 Social and Cultural Democracy

Democracy implies achieving and strengthening social and cultural rights.

The Right to Education

No democracy can in fact develop without sharing knowledge with all the social groups that are said to be deprived. This sharing will relate not to what they already know and, as we are aware, deserves to be developed, but to new knowledge. Education for all, as UNESCO has emphasised, is «an indispensable prerequisite for fulfilling all the other preconditions for a culture of peace». But for such sharing, and the necessary equity in education, to be established, other conditions have to be met, among them the effective resolution of the language question yet again. The right to education also means, in fact, the development of languages, which must in due course lead to the gradual creation of a literate environment, which is the path to eradicating illiteracy. Mastery of knowledge in all fields will not otherwise be achieved.

The Right to be Different

The right to be different calls for the recognition of the diversity of cultures — all cultures — and for the spirit of tolerance, which will logically lead to a dissipation of the social scourges alluded to above, i.e. racism, tribalism, xenophobia, exclusion, prejudice, etc. This means tolerance towards the cultures of »others«, and especially their recognition as entire cultures. This is one of the fundamental principles on which UNESCO bases its actions, namely »non-violence and respect for human rights; intercultural understanding; tolerance and solidarity; the sharing and free circulation of information; and integral participation and independence for women«.

The Right to a Decent Standard of Living

Social and cultural democracy also means people's right to a decent standard of living, which presupposes the fight against poverty, as poverty can generate violence. Its eradication implies that all its causes can be eliminated. The fight is thus a cultural struggle in the sense that it has to transcend habits and even taboos: it is also economic because it has to give citizens the necessary means of survival and the intellectual capacities to participate in the development process.

The Right to Health

Social and cultural democracy also requires that the right to health protection and a healthy environment should be respected. The issue of the environment is still a crucial problem for humanity at the present time, especially when the struggle for survival is seriously threatening the inheritance of the Earth. It is no longer possible to remain silent on the devastation that some rich countries are inflicting in this field on the poor. Are they unaware, or is their purpose purely and simply exploitation? Seen objectively, the destruction of one country in order to build up another damages democracy through its inconsistency, and must be eradicated at all costs.

The question is, for example, how participation in development, the right of association, the right to education, the recognition of all cultures, the right to a healthy environment, the right to health protection, etc., can be promoted without it. It is a commonplace that any democratic system rests ultimately on dialogue. That presupposes that any decision about life and the well-being of citizens has to be mutually desired and accepted.

»The more say people have in the direction of policy, the more likely it is to reflect their concerns and aspirations.... democracy relies on debate, persuasion and compromise.... democracy guarantees basic freedoms.... democracy allows for societal renewal.«¹⁰

All these arguments very clearly demonstrate the close links between the notions referred to above and that of democracy. All the rights mentioned above as sub-components of the concept can only be promoted through dialogue and in an environment of freedom. By way of example, cultural development needs citizens to be able both to appreciate and question their cultures. Only democracy can enable them to do so.

Democracy depends on the culture of peace, of which it is a basic component. And when democracy becomes effective, it enables peace to be achieved.

Obviously, there can be no democracy, nor a desire for peace, without the conscious and willing support of the citizen, who must, as we have just said, be both its promoter and main protagonist.

2. Adult Education for Democracy and Peace

Education cannot be seen in isolation, that is, without the support and participation of the entire population. It must not be a requirement for only certain social classes. Education for democracy and the culture of peace has to involve the whole of society, including a section that appears already to possess knowledge, and always to have grasped and mastered everything. What is happening today in the world — namely wars, encroachments on human rights, persistent conflicts linked to prejudice, racism and the promulgation of laws that reinforce exclusion — proves that these scourges hardly derive from the political will of the poor, as they are always their victims. The process of education for democracy and the culture of peace involves all social groupings. «It is a complex process that takes place on many different levels and is linked to learning for collective action.» But while this education has to be carried out within states, it is equally applicable between countries. They have to learn to live in harmony and mutual respect as «the consolidation of peace concerns all countries, whatever their level of development».

2.1 At the Political Level

Any attempt to promote democracy and peace must initially take into account everyone's right to information: to accessing and disseminating information. That is a fundamental principle of civil society. The target recipients of education for democracy are therefore not only the most culturally and economically deprived sections of society. For everyone it consists of understanding one's rights and obligations. This might take concrete shape through political structures that already exist or have to be jointly created by everyone. This means that tools of communication such as the media have to be open to all social groups. How often does one see, on television screens in both South and North, all the protagonists in a political or economic argument come together to put their points of view?

The role to be played by the media is certainly that of information and education so that «the enlightened participation of the people in state affairs and

1

the functioning of society» does have an influence on all the democratic structures which are being set up or which already exist. That is the question today, and democracy will only develop if justice and equity are ensured and truly democratic communication is created which recognizes people's values, as a prelude to fruitful discussion and mutual understanding between all citizens. Combating cultural and political exclusion means giving all citizens the chance to educate themselves and to master written communication so that they can better inform themselves and participate. »What does it matter if people are free to place their voting papers in the ballot box... if they are still underinformed and not qualified to answer the question?« Indeed, while the appropriate organization of the means of communication and effective affirmation of the political will to eradicate illiteracy brings about dialogue between citizens so that they can decode everything that had previously seemed out of reach of their understanding, there is an objective justice that takes into account the fact that equal consideration should be given to all. When the eradication of illiteracy leads to dialogue through the channels of specific linguistic media peculiar to different populations, justice is also being applied, because equal consideration is thereby given to all social groups, including minorities, by means of their basic characteristic, i.e. language. Such are the political challenges facing adult education. They are closely linked to economic issues, through which development, the essential basis of democracy, will have to be achieved.

2.2 At the Economic Level

The question of democracy cannot be raised without reference to that of the economy, which is closely associated with it. Between the two notions, there is, indeed, »an inextricable relationship, not of cause and effect, but of effective source on the one hand, and mutual precondition on the other....«¹¹ Any action that works towards development reflects the way in which the individual participates in building the nation. »A proper concept of democracy can only lead us to development. Democracy stresses freedom; development stresses the indispensable preconditions for this freedom, which engender freedom thanks to a proper conception of equality.«¹²

The concept of development seems primarily and essentially to be associated with a category of countries throughout the world that are moving towards development, »developing countries«. Such a position largely derives in our view from a political or ideological position as there has been a tendency to

compare situations in which ways of life, and the organization of space and culture are in total conflict. However, «underdevelopment, which is our present state of development, does not mean absence of development. It is, rather, a twofold development in which an endogenous form of development is matched by an exogenous form that crushes the endogenous without ever being able to replace it. There is a constant process of stratification between the exogenous and endogenous. That is the situation in every African country where there is twofold, distorted and unfocused development»¹³ Thus it is really merely a problem of organization and choice of development policy. Moreover, if we question the currently accepted definition, this is in relation to the economic situation of the so-called developed countries, even though enormous scientific and technological progress has been and still is being made. Given the continually rising number of people unemployed, the steep rise in poverty and the rediscovery of illiteracy in the so-called «developed» countries, it seems inadequate today to claim that the notion should still be applied exclusively to so-called «developing» countries.

Development, as we understand it, is anything that advances the individual through the qualitative transformation of his or her immediate environment, a transformation of which the main purpose is simply to provide him or her in due course with a better standard of living in economic or human terms. The development process «must first and foremost make room for an awakening of the potential of the beings who are both its initial protagonists and its ultimate targets: human beings — and not only those who live today but also those who live on earth tomorrow»¹⁴ For this reason, decision-makers have to encourage individuals to develop their personal skills by providing lifelong education, the underlying purpose of which must be the eradication of illiteracy. Thus, literacy work must respond to the needs of adults and be functional. In the light of the «globalization» to which all nations are now subjected, adults must be capable, together with their fellow citizens, of taking concerted action to face the new challenges arising from this new political and economic reality, making use of suitable technical and intellectual techniques. They must be able, in participating in urban affairs, to put across their views on the better management of economic life. Decision-makers must decide, together with the whole of civil society, on the best ways of attaining these objectives. Such action opens the way to the real development of democracy, which remains the corner stone of development. For people to be able to organize economic life and to put across their views while setting them in the context of the whole, requires real freedom, freedom of action, freedom to launch initiatives, freedom to take common decisions. Citizens, decision-ma-

kers and the civil society, all those concerned, have the right and the obligation to demand of themselves and others that urban affairs should be managed »transparently«, without equivocation. Democracy means what it says when everyone, according to their understanding, acquires the freedom and the power to control and to demand answerability. Any restriction on this freedom infringes and threatens to emaciate and nullify democracy. Development will be mortgaged if citizens do not have adequate means to give meaning to their lives, or if decision-makers do not, together with the whole of society, establish effective structures to eradicate all the factors that cause poverty.

2.3 At the Social and Cultural Level

Given all the causes of violence and the manifestations of racism in many countries and the drafting of ambiguous laws on what is termed »immigration«, education should serve to strengthen the political will of the one side, and the understanding of the other, in respect of the questions raised. A similar movement should facilitate communication and make it more democratic.

By means of enhanced information, adults should also be given the opportunity and the freedom to concern themselves with improving their health within a healthy immediate environment. Many illnesses today are the tragic consequence of a serious degradation of our own surroundings and our behaviour. The notion of social democracy is seen clearly in the sharing of responsibility between the minority and the majority so that their respective rights and obligations are recognized and preventive measures implemented against ill health.

The promotion of culture and national culture(s) is a right, and is an integral part of democracy. As R. Stavenhagen has stated, »a truly multicultural education will be one that can address simultaneously the requirements of global and national integration, and the specific needs of particular culturally distinct communities, both in rural and urban settings.«¹⁵ This requires every citizen to become imbued with the culture of the »other« as well as his or her own. But, if culture is to be valid, it must be achieved in freedom, and hence in a context of true democracy. »Cultural freedom... is a collective freedom. It refers to the right of a people to follow a way of life of its choice. Cultural freedom guarantees freedom as a whole. It protects not only the group but also the rights of every individual within it.«¹⁶ As with any freedom, adults need to learn to discover and assume cultural freedom in order to grasp the need and impor-

tance of promoting it in their adult lives. Because of their involvement in people's behaviour towards nature and in the exchanges between nature and humanity, culture and the environment are so inextricably linked that they are continually influencing one another. The way in which nature is seen and experienced necessarily affects the way in which the individual experiences his or her culture. As Bessita rightly reminds us, »Environmental education that does not take into account both the relationship between people and nature and their wellbeing will find it difficult to achieve its goal.«¹⁷ Until now, in fact, as UNESCO emphasises, »Humanity's relation to the natural environment has so far been seen predominantly in biophysical terms, but there is now a growing recognition that societies themselves have created elaborate procedures to protect and manage their resources. These procedures are rooted in cultural values that have to be taken into account if sustainable and equitable human development is to become a reality.«¹⁸

1

Adults cannot be taught how to experience their culture or how to discover it. They are already immersed in it every day. Their essential task is to internalize it effectively through an acute awareness of its importance in relation to their own lives and the cultures of others. Support should be given, for example, to the systematic preservation of historic sites and any significant remains; the recognition of the value of culture through all the arts, without exception, should be part of any development programme so that material and human resources are truly devoted to it and adults are better able to give it its necessary importance while being, as we have said, the repositories of all forms of culture. The essential character of learning, that is to say, overcoming all contemptuous one-sidedness, is found here too because it demonstrates the rights and obligations of each beneficiary of education for democracy.

Conclusion

Thus, information and education at the different levels to which we have alluded, through the various components of the concept of democracy, cannot be realized if adults do not themselves have an environment that favours relevant communication and reflects a democratic situation that encourages integral development. No educational programme, however perfect, can bear lasting fruit unless it touches on what gives individuals their values and makes them human, i.e., freedom. And we can therefore say that political, economic, social and cultural questions cannot be resolved in a society unless democracy is at the heart of their implementation: full and unrestricted democracy cover-

ing all of society. But we also know that this cannot be built without struggle and pressure. The role of the civil society therefore becomes significant and it must, as Mintombu rightly states, »work effectively to reduce all forms of natural and social inequality. And the more this adjustment, this reduction and rapprochement takes effect, the more it will lead us to the very heart of democratic practice: the favouring of the interests of the majority, or the greatest number.«¹⁹

If such a situation comes about, it goes without saying that it will also open the way to a more general situation, that of peace, which adults must also make their own. Peace is not an abstract notion, but it rests firmly on the capacity of each individual to want to recognize and to be persuaded of the existence of the »other« through the rights which they enjoy (the rights to free speech, to civil participation, to work, to the eradication of inequalities, especially between men and women, etc.). All the violence in the world today surely arises from the absence of such an environment, despite the political arguments with which it is often surrounded in order to justify it. Not to wish in consequence to set out on this path by transforming oneself politically is to deny one's own ability to make democracy an everyday reality, even though one may think one has created it oneself. There is therefore no peace without democracy, and no democracy without peace. For the establishment of a culture of peace, this intrinsic relationship calls for education for democracy in all departments. As Johan Galtung states, »To understand peace and violence we need to consider basic human needs — for survival, wellbeing, freedom and identity.«²⁰ He also says that »development aims to promote those needs: violence insults them: peace preserves them.«²¹ It therefore seems obvious to us that education for peace, if it is to be a barrier to war and violence of any sort, calls above all for a struggle for development, which can only come about under democratic conditions, the lack of which is the objective cause of the absence of peace.

No democracy can claim to be developing without a satisfactory resolution of the questions of illiteracy, culture, health, the environment, work, and so on. The social, economic and cultural situations that we see today clearly demonstrate that democratic culture will not be achieved until there is a will or a deep desire among some people to promote a viable democratic environment, and among others to recognize the true significance of this so as to make this political will capable of promoting participation and sharing. In our view it is therefore not a matter of »democratizing democracy«, as has been suggested, as that would suppose that it already truly existed, or that certain fringe groups in

the world were, a priori, interested in introducing such a concept. Deciding to encourage the development of democracy means accepting that others will play a part in building the nation, and sharing goods with the most deprived, the very people whose lives suffer all the ills to which we have made allusion because of a lack of democracy, and who render its very existence illusory.

Education for democracy and the culture of peace cannot develop and become a permanent feature unless it contributes to a real awareness, in all societies, of the political and social problems facing humanity in its quest for a better life. This awareness sets the concept of education in the context of a completely new vision which is not, in Vivian Forrester's words, »a second-hand gadget«, especially when it is, as she says, »lifelong education«.²²

1

Notes

1. Report on action undertaken in the Culture of Peace Programme, para. 7, p. 2., UNESCO, 1996.
2. Towards a World Culture of Peace, working document drafted for the Culture of Peace Programme (CPP), UNESCO, 2nd International Forum on a Culture of Peace, Manila, the Philippines, Nov. 1995.
3. Ünlühisarcikli, Özlem et al., *Adult Education and Democratic Citizenship*, p. 67., Institute of Pedagogy of Wrocław University, Wrocław, 1995.
4. *idem.*, p. 68.
5. UNESCO Inter-Parliamentary Conference on Education, Science, Culture and Communication on the Eve of the 21st Century, Final Document, p. 4. para. 7., Paris, 1996.
6. Learning: The Treasure Within, Report to UNESCO of the International Commission on Education for the 21st Century (the Delors Report), UNESCO, Paris, 1996, p. 46.
7. *idem.*, p. 3.
8. Beetham, David and Boyle, Kevin, *Democracy: Questions and Answers*, p. 107, UNESCO, Paris, 1995.
9. UNDP, quoted in the Delors Report, UNESCO, p. 7, p. 79.
10. Beetham, David and Boyle, Kevin, *op. cit.*, p. 3, p. 4, p. 5.
11. Aguessy, H., Seminar on Democracy and Illiteracy in Benin, Communication, p. 3, Final Report, Cercle béninois de sociologues, anthropologues et ethnologues, Dec., 1992.
12. *idem.*
13. *idem.*, p. 4.
14. Mayor, F., quoted in the Delors Report, *op. cit.*, p. 87.
15. Delors Report, p. 231.
16. UNESCO, *Our Cultural Diversity*, p. 15, report of the World Commission on Culture and Development, Paris, 1996.

17. Bessita, B., Contribution de l'Eglise catholique à l'éducation environnementale au Tchad, Proceedings of the Journées de réflexion sur l'éducation environnementale comme moyen de lutte contre la désertification au Tchad, p. 111, N'Djamena, August 1996.
18. UNESCO, op. cit., pp. 17-18.
19. Mintombu, M., quoted by Hazoumé, Marc-Laurent, Plurilinguisme et communication démocratique, p. 99, 1995.
20. Galtung, J., Interview in The UNESCO Courier, p. 4, January 1997.
21. idem.
22. Forrester, V., Economic Horror, p. 168, 1997.

Linda King de Jardón

Diversity in Adult Education: Some Key Concepts in Minority and Indigenous Issues

1

It is perhaps in education more than in any other field of human activity that the rights and wishes of indigenous peoples and minority cultures have been consistently denied and repressed. History and the colonial legacy are full of examples of children being beaten for using their native languages in schools, of whole families being disfunctionalized as they saw their children and grandchildren being transported to obligatory state boarding schools to learn national ways and official languages, and of ridicule and scorn being poured on those, who, their languages often being unwritten, could not read and write, let alone pronounce, the words of the national state languages. Yet if we dismiss these issues as concerns of the past we are committing an injustice to the minorities and indigenous peoples of the world. For while diversity and multiculturalism are key concepts in the discourse of international society as we move towards the 21st century, the educational issues posed by these phenomena are far from being resolved.

Ethnic diversity is in one sense a product of the modern political organization of the nation state. If the utopia of the nation state did not exist, or if there were an equivalency between ethnicity and nationhood, the categories of mi-

norities or indigenous peoples would not exist either. By the same token, there would be no educational systems seeking to mould national identities on a monoethnic cultural basis. But in virtually every country in today's world there is a situation of plurilingualism and pluriethnicity, leading to an educational demand for diversity and respect for difference. In some countries ethnic groups have lived together more or less peacefully for hundreds of years, in others, there has been a permanent distrust and conflict fostered by ignorance and racism. In many industrialized countries, the recent growth of migratory movements has, moreover, resulted in a situation whereby the dominant national model of education is discordant with the beliefs and cultural systems of new groups of people inhabiting the same national territories. This has led in some countries to responses such as multiculturalism and the concern for an equality that goes hand in hand with diversity, and yet in others to ethnic exclusion with refusal to recognize equal validity and participation of second and third generation immigrants in national life and citizenship.

Four key concepts in relation to adult education and diversity are discussed in this paper: 1) the concept of minorities, 2) the concept of indigenous peoples, 3) multiculturalism, 4) the issue of language; these are examined both in terms of their defining characteristics and usage and in the context of international declarations and agreements which deal with diversity as it relates to education.

The Concept of Minorities

There is a sense in which minorities defy definition and a further sense in which it is right that this should be the case. Minorities may be defined by descriptive factors such as language, tradition, custom, religion, belief, political organization, etc., yet this does not fully explain their category as «minority». In addition, the concept of minority implies a particular set of relationships both to other groups within a nation state and with the group in power. It implies a «minority» share in decision making and influence, and a marginality with regard to other groups in society. It suggests a notion of recognized and assumed difference, and a reaction to that difference of either inclusion or exclusion, both in varying degrees.

It is virtually impossible to talk about minorities and minority issues without touching on the key issue of identity, both of group and self, as a defining

factor. But we should be aware that identity is not static and is a concept used by individuals and groups to manipulate and negotiate perceived goals. Identities are multifaceted, and specific identities may be called upon to justify specific beliefs or to gain acceptance in specific social groupings. Ethnic identity in particular is open to multiple interpretations of history, of future action based on a common past, of ethics and notions of truth, and the fundamentals of what is right and wrong in any given society.

Responding to the dilemma posed by the existence of minorities in nation states, the United Nations system, as the key international forum, has debated and provided guidelines on several issues, and in the context of this discussion, on education.

In 1992, the United Nations General Assembly approved the »UN Declaration on the Rights of persons belonging to National, Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities«, in which it specifically proposes that »States should where appropriate, take measures in the field of education in order to encourage knowledge of the history, traditions, languages and cultures of the minorities existing within their territory. Persons belonging to minorities should have adequate opportunities to gain knowledge of the society as a whole.« (Article 4 subparagraph 4) This declaration was the first universal standard-setting instrument dealing specifically with the rights of minorities. However, UNESCO many years earlier and in specific relation to international practice referring to the education of minorities had in 1960, in the Convention against Discrimination in Education, included the following clauses:

»(...) it is essential to recognize the rights of members of national minorities to carry on their own educational activities, including the maintenance of schools and depending on the educational policy of each State, the use or the teaching of their own language«, providing, it states, that that does not mean that »a) this right is exercised in a manner which prevents the members of these minorities from understanding the culture and language of the community as a whole and from participating in its activities or which prejudices national sovereignty, b) the standard of education is not lower than the general standard laid down or approved by the competent authorities and c) that attendance at such schools is optional.« (Article 5 subparagraph 1c)

While most of the declarations, conventions and recommendations of international bodies in regard to education focus almost exclusively on minority rights

1

relating to universal schooling, in 1993 the recommendations of the »Special Rapporteur to the UN Subcommission on Minorities« made specific reference to adult education:

»For the long term prevention of ethnic and religious hatred, and intolerance, measures should be taken to ensure that the substantive content of childhood and adult education is fully in line with the requirements of the Universal Declaration on Human Rights Article 26.2, the Convention on the Rights of the Child Article 29(1)b, c, and d, and the International Convention for the Elimination of all forms of Racial Discrimination (Article 7).«

UNESCO's most recent statement on the education of the future, containing the findings and recommendations of the International Commission on Education for the 21st Century, reiterates the underlying tension that governs minority relations with nation states and hence with the educational philosophies which they adopt:

»Education for pluralism is not just a safeguard against violence but an active principle for the enrichment of the cultural and civic life of present-day societies. Between the extremes of abstract and over-simplifying universalism and a relativism which makes no higher demand going beyond the horizon of each particular culture, one needs to assert both the right to be different and receptiveness to universal values (...) the danger that minorities might become isolated should constantly be borne in mind: what must be avoided is a misplaced intercultural egalitarianism that would imprison some minorities in linguistic and cultural, thus economic, ghettos.«¹

Indigenous Peoples

Indigenous peoples are not minorities although they share certain forms of marginalization with minority groups. In recognition of this fact, the UN Commission on Human Rights has set up two distinct working groups that deal with on the one hand, minorities, and on the other, indigenous peoples. Ironically, but perhaps correctly so, neither entity has been able to establish universal definitions of either of these concepts since they elude for the most part the necessary simplification implied.²

Having said that, most would agree that the concept of indigenous peoples has come about as a result of colonization and conquest, while that of minorities does not necessarily imply a historical subordination. The term comes from the Latin *indigenae*, which was used to distinguish persons born in a particular place from others who arrived from elsewhere; the French term *«autochtone»* deriving from the Greek root, has a similar connotation. Obviously, indigenous peoples did not refer to themselves as such, and the term is one used by Europeans to denote the Other, the different, the discovered, the encountered, the colonized and the subordinated. Indigenous peoples, as they still do today, referred to themselves with their own names: as Mayas, Zapotecs, Aymaras, Samis, Inuit, or any other of the myriad of world cultures. Only recently have they, on the basis of new forms of political organization at national and international level, come to refer to themselves generically as indigenous peoples, as they recognize key problems which they share and which have arisen in similar historical circumstances.

Obviously, not all peoples who share a common ethnic origin and territory correspond to the notion of indigenous; indigenous peoples imply non-state peoples, and peoples participating usually in non-industrial modes of production. However, in contrast to minority groups, they share common ancestral territory that is ethnically delineated. These are usually specific ancestral territories within the national territory which are distinct from the general territory inhabited by the majority of the population.

The ILO Convention No 169 of 1989 on Indigenous and Tribal Peoples is the only international legal instrument referring specifically to indigenous peoples. It makes a distinction between indigenous and tribal peoples on the following grounds:

The first category refers to «peoples in independent countries who are regarded as indigenous on account of their descent from the populations which inhabited the country, or a geographical region to which the country belongs, at the time of conquest or colonization or the establishment of present state boundaries and who, irrespective of their legal status, retain some or all of their own social, economic, cultural and political institutions» (Article 1(b)). The second refers to «peoples in independent countries whose social, cultural and economic conditions distinguish them from other sections of the national community and whose status is regulated wholly or partially by their own customs or traditions or by special laws or regulations.» (Article 1(a)).

Convention 169 ratifies the rights of indigenous and tribal peoples to self-definition, and as the recent report by the Chairperson on the Working Group on Indigenous Peoples testifies, the distinctions between the two are somewhat blurred and remain a semantic choice for the peoples involved whether to refer to themselves as tribal or indigenous. The ILO nevertheless identifies tribal peoples on the whole with Asia and Africa and indigenous peoples with the Americas, Australia and New Zealand. However, much of the most recent thinking produced by the UN Working Group on Indigenous Peoples in consultation with the indigenous peoples of the world has led them to the conclusion that it has become increasingly difficult to define the concept of indigenous people and that there can be no one exclusive definition. The term must be self-directed. In other words, the argument put forward by many indigenous peoples is that such definition-seeking leads nowhere. Subjective self-identification is, they maintain, the most appropriate criterion for definition.

Six articles of Convention 169 refer to education (Articles 6-21) and various others to training (21-23). The emphasis is on the peoples' participation in the design of a system appropriate to their needs, traditions and cultures. Subparagraph 3 of Article 27, for example, recommends that: »Governments shall recognize the right of these peoples to establish their own educational institutions and facilities, provided that such institutions meet minimum standards established by the competent authority in consultation with these peoples. Appropriate resources shall be provided for this purpose«. Article 31 also calls for measures to be taken to educate the members of the dominant society, to eliminate prejudice and to provide information on the indigenous cultures.

There are currently some 5000 different indigenous and tribal groups in the world, comprising in total almost 300 million people, living in around 70 countries³. Together they account for 4 per cent of the world's population although in the countries where they live this figure may represent the largest share of any group in the national population. The indigenous population of Guatemala for example, is 59% of the total population and roughly the same percentage is applicable to Bolivia. In countries with large indigenous populations, moreover, there is a definite correlation between ethnicity, poverty and lack of access to basic services including education.

The only place in the United Nations system where indigenous peoples have an established right to speak on behalf of their peoples is in the Working Group on Indigenous Peoples. After almost a decade of activity, this produced

the Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, where part IV, focusing exclusively on education establishes the right of indigenous peoples to create and maintain their own educational systems and institutions whilst not being denied access to all levels and forms of education. The Draft Declaration has yet to be ratified by the UN General Assembly.

Multiculturalism

The term multiculturalism has come to be used as a cover word describing a policy that seeks to recognize and respect diversity. It has been most frequently used in regard to the education system, where it is common to talk about multicultural classrooms, multicultural approaches to teaching and multicultural curricula.

Broadly speaking, one can distinguish between three aspects of the concept of multiculturalism.⁴ In the first place, there is the demographic-descriptive usage referring to the existence of diverse linguistic, cultural, ethnic, and religious groups within the broader national society. Secondly, the term is used in an ideological-normative sense referring to the existence of ethnic diversity and also the rights of those ethnic groups to participate equitably in society on the basis of their group identity. This approach is ideologically counterposed to approaches such as assimilationism, which considers that ethnic and cultural differences are transitory and may, particularly through education, be gradually eradicated leading to a homogeneous national identity. It goes without saying that multiculturalism also runs counter to the differentialism approach of which the extreme forms are those of apartheid, ethnic cleansing, and ethnic exclusion. Finally, multiculturalism has a programmatic and political aspect referring to those policies and actions which have been developed to manage ethnic diversity in national contexts and which is of particular relevance in the educational sphere.

It is useful to make this distinction between the varying aspects of multiculturalism since, in general, countries make varying commitments to the concept. While some acknowledge the desirability of multiculturalism on an ideological or normative level, they are slow to translate this into practical programmatic initiatives. Other countries are at the forefront of the multicultural debate with clear public educational policy on this issue. And yet other countries reject the notion of multiculturalism on the grounds of national unity and social cohesion. It must be mentioned also that some ethnic groups themselves reject the

1

concept of multiculturalism as a whitewash for deeper internal colonialism within countries or as a form of categorizing »the Other« that equalizes all situations. Some indigenous peoples, for example, argue for a legal-political status based on ancestral rights linked above all to territorial claims, distinct from that of more recent immigrants to the region, who represent the face of contemporary ethnic diversity in many countries.

The Issue of Language

Language is central to any discussion regarding diversity since it is the means of expression in and between groups practising the same language use. Language establishes a boundary both real and imaginary between one's group identity and the Other: real, because it limits comprehension between cultures that do not share the same language, imaginary, because it is not fixed in either time or space, for languages change when they come into contact with other more »powerful« ones or when groups move out of their traditional geographical territory.

Language as either a shared remembrance or as the current practice of a particular group is an intrinsic part of ethnic identity in that it marks off natural and symbolic boundaries. When boundaries have no »natural« basis, the symbolic boundary is more important, as in the case of supposed language differences between neighbouring linguistic communities that have a predisposition to misunderstand on the basis of difference.

In today's world there are very few countries which can claim to be monolingual. Most nation states encompass within their borders several languages. Others, like India or Nigeria have many hundreds of different languages spoken within their national territory. But even though many languages may be spoken in a specific nation state usually only one or two of these have status as official languages, and thereby become majority as opposed to minority languages in the political sense. Over 5000 different languages are spoken currently in the world, but of these only 5% are actually official languages; 95% of the world's languages belong in fact to linguistic minorities,⁵ although obviously not 95% of language speakers worldwide.

The category of linguistic minority will shift in time and space. To take just the example of Chinese, with all the Chinese variants in the world, over 1000 million people speak Chinese. The majority of these people will live on the Chi-

nese mainland where Chinese is the majority language, but in other countries such as the United States, Chinese, where spoken, will constitute a minority language in the face of the majority language, English.

Although there are more than 40 states with two or more official languages, the majority of the world's states are in fact monolingual in the sense of recognizing only one official language. This makes for a situation whereby in any one nation state there may be many linguistic minorities, whose languages may indeed be more widely used in different regions but which do not have the legal authority of the majority or official language. This situation is intrinsically linked to the educational system for the choice of language infers a power and prestige through its use for formal instruction. Not only is there this symbolic aspect, referring to status and visibility, but language is also the central means through which groups transmit their ideas and collective representations of the world to each other and from generation to generation.

The United Nations declaration on minorities specifically refers to the question of linguistic minorities:

»Persons belonging to national or ethnic, religious and linguistic minorities have the right to enjoy their own culture, to profess and practice their own religion, and to use their own language, in private and in public, freely and without interference or any form of discrimination.« (Article 2, subparagraph 1)

Furthermore, the declaration states that:

»States should take appropriate measures so that, wherever possible, persons belonging to minorities have adequate opportunities to learn their mother tongue or to have instruction in their mother tongue « (Article 4, subparagraph 3)

In 1996, the Universal Declaration on Linguistic Rights, produced by the World Conference on Linguistic Rights in Barcelona, made language communities and not nation states the focus of its recommendations. In this regard it recognized the problems created by the formal territorial divisions that have often divided language communities between separate countries.

The declaration makes a distinction between the different kinds of linguistic minorities in relation to nation states. On the one hand, referring to migrant communities, it states:

1

»This Declaration considers that persons who move to and settle in the territory of another language community have the right and the duty to maintain an attitude of integration towards this community. This term is understood to mean an additional socialization of such persons in such a way that they may preserve their original cultural characteristics while sharing with the society in which they have settled sufficient references, values and forms of behaviour to enable them to function socially without greater difficulties than those experienced by members of the host community.« (Article 4 subparagraph 1)

On the other, referring to language communities with traditionally defined territories, which are in practical terms principally indigenous peoples, the Declaration proposes that:

»All language communities have the right to decide to what extent their language is to be present, as a vehicular language and as an object of study at all levels of education within their territory: preschool, primary, secondary, technical and vocational, university and adult education.« (Section 11: Article 24)

Conclusion

As the Delors Report stated so succinctly, pluralism should be an asset rather than a problem to be solved. The central issue is how to achieve a balance between universality and difference, how to recognize diversity while yet promoting social cohesion, and above all how to avoid the pitfalls of ethnic extremism in which tolerance and understanding are obliterated in the struggle for supremacy. In other words, how to enrich rather than destroy each other both in the context of national societies and in the global scenario. The world is a mosaic of cultures and peoples, whose shifting boundaries create and recreate countries, nations and identities, and which provide a never ending challenge for educators. That is one of the most important realities facing adult education in the context of the 21st century and one which demands international solidarity.

Notes

1. Learning: The Treasure Within, UNESCO, Paris, 1996, pp. 59-60.
2. United Nations 1996 E/CN.4/Sub.2/AC.4/1996/2.
3. Indigenous and tribal peoples and the ILO, International Labour Office, Geneva, 1994.
4. See Multiculturalism: A Policy Response to Diversity, MOST Programme Secretariat, UNESCO, Paris, 1995.
5. Language, Literacy and Minorities, Minority Rights Group, London, 1990.

David Adams

The Culture of Peace: The UNESCO Perspective*

1

In 1992, in what can be seen as a reactualization of UNESCO's Constitutional mandate to construct the defences of peace in the minds of men and women, the Culture of Peace Programme was proposed by UNESCO as a contribution to the peace-building activities of the United Nations system. Peace-building, at that time, was undertaken primarily in situations following violent conflict and was described as «comprehensive efforts to identify and support structures which will tend to consolidate peace and advance a sense of confidence and well-being among people.» Since then the concept has evolved to apply to countries at all stages of development, including countries emerging from violent conflict, countries in transition, and countries of wealth and power which should engage in demobilization and defence conversion. In addition to its relevance for post-conflict situations, it may provide for the prevention of violent conflict in situations where such a potential exists.

All of the fields of competence of UNESCO, education, science, culture and communication, have been engaged in the Organization's transdisciplinary approach to the culture of peace. In addition to many activities on inter-regional and global levels which are based in one or another of these fields, specific national culture of peace programmes have been developed in post-conflict peace-building situations. They were launched in 1993 and 1994 in El Salvador and Mozambique as a complement to United Nations peace-keeping operations. Later, in 1995 and 1996, national programmes and related activi-

ties were initiated in Burundi, Rwanda, Somalia, Guatemala, Congo, and the Philippines, among others, in situations which could be considered as much preventive as post-conflict.

The fundamental principle of a culture of peace was put into practice in the initial programmes in El Salvador and Mozambique: the transformation from conflict to cooperation through a process of dialogue leading to cooperation for shared goals of human development. This principle, although originally employed in post-conflict situations, is equally valid for conflict prevention as well. In fact, it is a fundamental finding of social psychology, replicated in various types of contexts, that the most effective means to end or avoid a conflict is the engagement of the contending parties in collaboration for a shared higher goal. The scope of the programme has been elaborated in a series of international forums and consultative meetings, including the First International Forum for a Culture of Peace, hosted by El Salvador in February 1994 and the Second International Forum, hosted by the Philippines in November 1995.

Since its inception, UNESCO has taught and promoted the basic principles of peace and human rights and disseminated the international conventions of human rights in order to make their provisions known to the widest possible audience. The Organization continues to work in accordance with the principles adopted in its 1974 Recommendation on Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace, and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, recently reviewed and confirmed by the education ministers at the 1994 International Conference on Education. These principles include, among others: a) understanding and respect for all peoples, their cultures, civilizations, values and ways of life, including domestic ethnic cultures and cultures of other nations; b) awareness not only of the rights but also of the duties incumbent upon individuals, social groups and nations towards each other; and c) readiness on the part of the individual to participate in solving the problems of his community, his country and the world at large.

Role of Adult Education in National Culture of Peace Programmes

Education is the key to the task of reconciliation and reconstruction undertaken by national culture of peace programmes. This includes non-formal and informal education by means of mass media and other systems of communication as well as formal systems of schooling.

In keeping with the basic principle of national culture of peace programmes, projects are planned and implemented through a process involving all sides of the conflicts from which the country is recovering. National forums and dialogues to launch such programmes have been held in a number of countries including El Salvador (1993), Burundi (1994), Congo (1994), Somalia (1995) and Sudan (1995, 1996).

Training is a key component of national culture of peace programmes. In order to facilitate the process of cooperation in the development process between former enemies, a priority is placed on the training of «peace promoters», who help them jointly design and implement projects of human development which can produce results of benefit to all. These peace promoters, who may be teachers, journalists, social workers or development workers, are trained to use local as well as universal methods of mediation and conflict resolution. They function for a culture of peace in the same way that literacy promoters are at the heart of literacy campaigns.

What is needed today is a global training effort for non-violent social change that transforms conflict into cooperation for human development. Both through formal schooling and through the popular media, people need to learn the skills of dialogue, negotiation and consensus. One might call these skills the «second literacy» which, in its own way, is as important for future generations as reading and writing. While the contents of the educational messages must be based on universal principles, they must at the same time develop out of traditions and experiences of the people concerned as they struggle to make development democratic and participatory. The linkage of actions for a culture of peace to the process of development assures that they will contribute to the drastic reduction of poverty and exclusion, which most often lie at the roots of violent conflict.

By promoting a culture of peace, the process of peace-building can be extended to the prevention of violent conflicts. Prevention is the key, as problems are more difficult to solve after they have reached a stage of crisis. Although action taken to prevent conflict is often invisible and unrecognized, in the long term, it is more economical and sustainable, and it is a necessary condition for the advances in human development, justice and democracy on which our common future depends.

A culture of peace requires change, not only in institutions but in the minds of men and women, and not only in young people but in everyone. It is an educa-

tional challenge in its broadest sense, involving the values, attitudes and behaviours which determine whether conflicts are addressed through dialogue, compromise and cooperation, or they lead to violence. Hence, the transformation from a culture of war to a culture of peace challenges adult education in all its aspects.

Note

- * This text draws heavily on the report on educational activities in the framework of the UNESCO transdisciplinary project entitled «Towards a culture of peace» which was presented to the United Nations General Assembly, September 1996 (document A/51/395).



CONFINTEA V

THEME 2:

*Improving the
Conditions and
Quality of
Adult Learning*

The theme «Improving the Conditions and Quality of Adult Learning» will be divided into the five sub-themes

- University
- Research
- Documentation
- Educational Politics
- Monitoring of Adult Learning

Due to this diversity, there is no single background paper available even though the sub-themes listed above will be the object of specific working groups during the conference. To guide discussions in any or all of them, papers may be distributed at the conference itself.

2



CONFINTEA V

THEME 3:

**Ensuring the
Universal Right of
Adults and Out-Of-
School Youth to
Literacy and Basic
Education**

Jean-Paul Hauteceœur

Literacy on the Eve of CONFINTEA: Observations, Questions and Action Plans

3

An attempt is made here to present, in three parts, the state of literacy and basic education on the eve of the International Conference on Adult Education, using the preparatory documents for the Hamburg Conference drafted in the regional conferences and at UNESCO¹:

- The first part, »Observations and Interpretations«, looks at the ways in which account is taken of the recent development of literacy in the relevant professional contexts. The observations will be limited to two regions, Africa and Europe, which were selected because of their dissimilarity. We shall examine whether views converge.
- The second part, »Questions and Tensions«, asks what the major issues are that are today motivating and discouraging those involved in literacy and basic education. There is talk of a literacy crisis. What are the relevant questions, the tensions, and the intentions as they are expressed (or suppressed) by those working in the various regions?
- In the third part there is an attempt to provide an overview of the »action plans« that are both declarations of principle and intent, and pragmatic guidelines for action.

Observations and Interpretations

In Africa

According to delegates to the African Regional Preparatory Conference for the International Conference on Adult Education (UNESCO, Dakar, October 1996), the absolute priority remains the struggle against poverty. Among the greatest challenges facing Africa, »the major challenge remains the universalization of basic education for all«, including adult literacy.

The overall socioeconomic context in the African continent, termed »mal-development«, is extremely unfavourable to the implementation of the Action Plan drawn up at the Jomtien Conference (Education for All, 1990). Regret is expressed over the following endogenous and exogenous factors:

- a general state of extreme poverty, disturbing demographic growth, and illiteracy rates among the highest in the world;
- negative economic growth, exacerbated by the debt burden, structural adjustment policies, and falling prices for raw materials;
- cumulative national and regional problems: corruption, conflicts and wars, growing inequalities, political instability, etc.

Despite everything, African cultural history hides »considerable potential« which gives reason for hope, particularly in adult education. »Africa has a long tradition in adult education. This whole cognitive inheritance, rooted in local cultures and reflecting African identity, must be given its true value.« The political transition to more democratic regimes and the development of an organized civil society are another factor for hope. Women, especially, are giving a fresh impetus to the desire for autonomy in grassroots communities, which are prepared to play a greater role in societal and public affairs.

Some of the difficulties faced in adult literacy can be summed up as follows:

- The greatest challenges have not yet been met: accessible basic education services; individual participation — particularly among girls and women — and community commitment; relevant programmes and methods; and the retention of what has been learnt and its applicability in everyday life.

- Adult education remains peripheral to education systems, because of a lack of political will, the lack or shortage of institutions, an unfavourable political environment, and hence a general lack of resources.
- There is an absence of coordination between the actors engaged in the work, and a lack of harmonization between sectors and organizations.
- There is no continuity in work on the ground, and no follow-up in the form of post-literacy, which results in relapse into illiteracy.
- Universities do not cooperate, and there is little support given to research, experimentation and vocational training for adult educators.
- Adult educators are too often unpaid volunteers, and are deficient in both numbers and competence.
- There is a shortage of adequate relevant material, particularly in local languages.
- Statistical data and other databases are inadequate; evaluation and follow-up are a rarity.
- Post-literacy infrastructures do not exist, notably libraries and written media; more generally, written environments are rare.
- Insufficient use is made of local languages in literacy activities.
- Gender barriers persist, restricting the participation of girls and women in educational activities.
- There are no bridges between nonformal and formal education.

On the positive side, many of these elements are taken up in the commitment made by African delegates to the development of basic education. Guaranteeing the right to learn is seen as a priority task for the future, for which responsibility lies with the public authorities working together with NGOs, the private sector and the grassroots communities. Such a partnership, which is a pledge of »good governance«, will only be possible in democratic societies which respect diversity and are reinforced by a committed civil society.

In Europe

The Pan-European Barcelona Conference on adult education and training (December 1996) did not once mention the term »literacy« in its final declaration. It spoke of »basic education« in one paragraph dealing with new and old technologies as educational resources and means of information to which all citizens should have access for their technical and intellectual education.

The omnipresent world context of the globalization of trade and communications calls for new capacities to communicate and act on the part of everyone. Basic education is seen as both a necessary adaptation to post-modernism, an initiation into new ways of handling information, and the learning of new skills for effective social participation and solidarity. The right to learn applies to all, and has to be redeemable throughout life.

This complex vision of learning (in place of the traditional linear, universal model of education) »implies a revision of educational policies which will have to widen their perspectives so that they take into account all the different educational agents and give citizens the capacity to develop themselves and the right to learn during the whole life.« Does this mean that the reality and the issue of »functional illiteracy« (a term that is more or less abandoned) is obsolete?

During the Barcelona Conference, there were reminders that the problem of illiteracy in some industrialized countries is not marginal, that it is far more widespread than had been thought, and that it is not on the decline. On the contrary, recent statistical surveys (in the USA, Canada, the OECD countries, etc.) call into question the ability of large sections of the adult population to use written information, to carry out elementary mathematical operations, and to solve simple problems.

Attention was drawn to changes in conceptualization, terminology and pedagogical premises: among them, the desire to abandon the dichotomy between literacy and illiteracy in favour of a continuum of skills, the widening of written media to embrace information and communication techniques and media, the variety of types of basic education in different contexts, and the mutation of compensatory education based on deficits into constructive approaches to useable skills.

Literacy movements in many countries have achieved unexpected ideological, political and professional success, against a background of increasing poverty,

fear of widening gaps in society, and an expanding education and training market. Some countries have set up basic education and training systems, institutionalizing adult basic education under conditions comparable to those of education for young people. Others have encouraged the development of a range of types of basic education, with the lead being taken by the private sector. Yet others have established education schemes which are essentially social and set out to reduce exclusion and to check social tensions.

Although there is still a militant branch of the earliest literacy movements that pursues »popular education« and minority rights, this has been marginalized, and it has also expanded its field of action to the struggle against poverty, racism and sexism, and in favour of cultural expression and community development. Overall, basic education and training has become professionalized and specialized, and is often forced to experiment and to innovate because of competition in a lively market.

3

The Crisis

In a UNESCO working document, Adama Ouane interprets the history of literacy over the last decade as a period of profound crisis:

- A crisis of identity: literacy has suffered from the deleterious effects of conceptual relativism, fragmented interpretation and multiple analogous applications (»literacies«).
- An operational crisis: there has been concern over the poor quality of programmes and practices, the modesty of results, the fall in the motivation of the target publics, the poor participation rates, especially among women, and the deterioration in learning conditions and in the cultural environment.
- A political crisis: literacy has remained peripheral to education policies; the resources allocated to it have been minimal.
- A cultural crisis: literacy has seen incompatibility between what institutions have provided and what individuals and communities were asking for: the latter have different urgent needs and aspire to greater responsibilities, but are still treated as passive actors.

- A sociolinguistic crisis: in multilingual societies, literacy in the official language or languages has remained peripheral to communication in local languages; the liveliness of oral traditions and the poverty of written environments have put up strong resistance to the long-term acceptance of literacy projects.

Moreover, at an opening address to an international seminar on literacy at the United Nations Headquarters, the historian Harvey Graff recalled that one of the great myths behind literacy movements was that of «crisis». «If we look at literacy over 20 odd years,» he said, «I cannot recall a time when literacy has not been in crisis.»² Is this crisis a historical fact or a myth? At all events, literacy is manifestly riddled with questions, tensions and conflicts which need to be clarified.

Questions and Tensions

From the Simple to the Complex

Literacy was founded on a myth, which still survives. It was accorded extraordinary virtues and powers: progress, development, liberation, empowerment, consciousness-raising, equality, democracy, etc. The world could be divided into two camps: underdeveloped/developed, closed/open, pathological/normal («the great divide», according to J. Goody)³. Scholarly analogies and images simplified history and categories, reducing them to a linear, one-dimensional model. Such simplifications have been taken up again by contemporary literacy movements, reinforced by the media.

Then everything became complicated. The initial utopias fell one after the other (to be replaced by another: skills and competition). Literacy has not made countries rich, or the learners, or the teachers. It has often simply been rejected. The functions and uses of the written word have been called into question, the hierarchies of linguistic value and the norms of communication challenged. Popular knowledge, and traditions banished by modernism (or communism), have been rehabilitated and are taking their place in the complex models of post-modernism.

The concept of literacy has been radically relativized. The very existence of illiteracy is queried, and social designations criticized as discriminatory. Doubt has

been cast on the new unifying norms of international measurement and comparison, and on their results. The premises and ideological functions of the »literacy« argument have shifted to present-day economic history (the »global market«), as an alternative to which are offered a sustainable model of human development, different models of learning and intercourse, and less grandiloquent values.

Territories and Functions

Literacy and basic education are divided into a number of sectors — academic, economic, social, civic and holistic — which may be either complementary or antagonistic to one another, or even quite independent. Each has its own functions, which are in competition but come together every so often in an ideological syncretism or an overall organizational model.

In most of its aspects, the academic sector reproduces or prolongs the school system for adults, with andragogical modifications. The official function is to provide a second chance and equity. Its aims are remedial education and qualifications. It promises social status and mobility. But in reality it brings cultural unification and selection; second failure and disqualification; »perennialization« of instability. In a communication to the Barcelona Conference, Serge Wagner summed it up as: »the education system's twin process of systemic discrimination: positive discrimination in favour of the most advantaged, and negative towards the disadvantaged«. ⁴ Literacy and adult basic education were, he suggested, an element in social marginalization. But the education system also tended towards isolation, sometimes becoming a closed world. There was such a thing as academic literacy, which included some and excluded or turned off others. School failure and dropout were also forms of resistance to academic literacy.

The globalized sector of the economy has included the value of literacy in its culture, and this has become a criterion for recruitment and selection of the labour force and for the management of human resources. This economic, ideological, moral and competitive value gives a new meaning to the whole of literacy and basic education policies on the basis of skill, potential and ability in relationships. It has brought about the growth of the private or semi-private education and training market, incorporating or marginalizing other approaches to basic education. It also determines in large measure the social programmes

3

for adults without work, in the form of employability programmes, temporary work placements, etc.

The explicit function of such training is the acquisition of vocational skills, with the aim of improving performance and maximizing the competitiveness of businesses. The implicit functions are selectivity of the labour force, and even discrimination on grounds of age, sex, language and ethnic origin. But the »merchandizing« of education and training has also increased the gap between literacy and basic education on the one hand, and vocational education and training on the other. The former, which is not productive, tends to be devalued and left to the state or the voluntary sector; the latter benefits from massive investment, professionalism and the achievement of results. The gap in society is thereby worsened.

The social sector of literacy and basic education has become a substitute for, or a complement to, the former social assistance programmes in the rich countries. Its purpose is to socialize and restore to the labour market adults who are marginalized for a range of reasons. It is presented as a way into other education and training. Such programmes are often linked restrictively to the payment of social security allowances. They are then rather a means of regimenting the poor (through short-term »training«) than liberal educational provision. Their main purpose is to deal with unemployment and deviance socially, and to forestall the radicalization of social tensions. The image of these programmes is that they are held in low esteem. While they are supposed to encourage participation, they in fact reinforce separation (which is sometimes called »apartheid«).

There is still, sometimes in a new guise, a militant area of literacy identified with civic action. Although it is timidly expressed in the sectors mentioned above, it is above all the preserve of voluntary associations that promote human rights, and the rights of women, minorities and disadvantaged communities. The objective of these NGOs' cultural activities, in the broadest sense, is to improve living conditions. Sometimes, language demands have priority, but generally multiple needs are addressed in their work: health, accommodation, work and civic rights. Literacy consists of changing the relationships with the dominant society and improving the sociocultural environment rather than of individualizing training and forming »illiterate ghettos«.

The militant activities referred to arise from ideals. If looked at critically, they reveal fierce market-based and ideological battles, and isolationist tendencies

that contradict their proclaimed humanistic aims.⁵ NGOs do compete for profit in the wider education and training market. The weaker, »non-profit« bodies, tend to disappear. Insufficient attention is given to the questions of what becomes of the »learners«, whether there are sustainable structural changes that go beyond »innovative experiments«, and whether what is offered is human development or an attempt to influence and control.

Politics

Political issues are always at the heart of literacy. They no longer concern so much the grand historical aims of mass campaigns (moral edification, ideological mobilization and learning for development) as the roles and responsibilities of governments and other social partners, national and local priorities, the size of budgets allocated to basic education and training, the place and rights of minorities in a national entity, the status of minority languages, the rights and roles of women, the political regime and institutional environment of cultural activities, etc.

A major question at the world scale is the power and resources of the state in the face of the hegemony of the global market, including public services, in this case education and culture. On the one hand, poor states cannot maintain the services that were once considered prime needs, for example schools. On the other, the model of the welfare or omnipotent state has broken down and been replaced by a monopoly of a new type, the global market rationalized through a single way of thinking (neo-liberal ideology) and reinforced by the control of information. The field of adult education is thus caught up in the wave of privatizations, and is split into profitable training, and expensive, unprofitable education that is partly or wholly left up to NGOs when the state cannot or will not take it on.

A whole set of key questions are raised, of a philosophical, political and strategic nature. How can the democratic ideals of equal rights for all citizens and equal access to information be guaranteed? Have we to forget utopian democracy and to accept the top-down ideal of the market? Should we be selective rather than egalitarian? To what extent can we bank on the private sector to invest in literacy? What roles must governments and public authorities take on in partnership with the private sector and NGOs? What policies should be adopted towards vulnerable groups? How can the quality and performance of basic education enterprises be guaranteed if is left up to NGOs and local au-

3

thorities? How can the institutional and cultural environment be improved so that it encourages adult education and basic education that are independent of the laws of the market, and so on?

Strategies

Is it still viable to aim at mass literacy for the 885 million adults — 20% of the adult population of the world — who are still illiterate? What have we learnt from earlier campaigns? Should we rather count on the potential, skills and organization of local communities, when the political environment allows, to carry out large-scale literacy activities? Some socioeducational activities carried out by NGOs have proved effective and promising, but how can these be transferred to a larger scale?

Can we still think in uniform terms in the implementation of literacy programmes, or should we distinguish between types, cultural contexts, and «publics»? In what languages should literacy operations be planned? How far is it possible to diversify in multilingual situations, without the risk of reproducing sociolinguistic inequalities and social marginalization? From a democratic, and therefore pluralist, point of view, can power largely be delegated to local authorities without risking a return to traditional autocracy? What place should be given to popular codes and procedures of communication in educational projects, the context of which is post-modernism?

What methods are practicable in order to evaluate the relevance and effectiveness of programmes? What approaches should be used? What data are relevant at the international, national and local levels? What might be the criteria and norms of quality? How can these be established?

While participation in, and appropriation of, education and training projects are recognized as factors crucial to the success of projects, how can we move from centralized programming to decentralized, self-managed practice? While the expression of demand and the construction of provision at the local and area level are to be encouraged, how can administrative divisions be accommodated to integrated projects that cross boundaries? How can the institutional environment be adapted to local initiatives and partnership?

One «risk» of a policy inspired by needs and demand may be the abandonment of the goal of literacy and basic education in favour of economic and

social goals that meet more immediate needs. Are funding bodies and decision-makers prepared to accept such changes? If the main priority at the national or regional level is the struggle against poverty, how can literacy adapt to the goals of people's own development? How far can basic education go along with communities' parallel, or even illicit, initiatives? What type of teacher or trainer is best suited to local conditions? What type of professional organization proves most suitable to guide and support local initiatives?

If it is impossible to ignore new information and communication technologies, what strategies will permit access to tools and networks at least cost? How can best use be made of self-help and cooperative exchange economies to attain the goals of competence and participation in the information market? How can a measure of cultural freedom and social interchange be maintained in the context of the new world communications order? Has this repercussions on literacy strategies?

3

Action Plans

Widening the Field

There is a consensus in all regions that the concept of literacy should be brought out of its corner, and that the field of educational activities should be widened. The view of the International Commission on Education for the 21st Century — learning throughout life and at the heart of society — is widely shared.⁶ The overall vision of the Jomtien Conference — Education for All — is also reiterated (especially in Asia), with the aim of achieving a minimum level of primary education for all, in particular for those girls and women who are furthest removed from it.

The concept of literacy should be widened by reintroducing traditional knowledge and skills, and indigenous languages, into basic education, and by introducing contemporary innovations into methods and means of communication. Basic education and training, for its part, should be opened to the full range of places where it occurs, of persons involved, of responsible agencies, and of social and cultural contexts. It can no longer be considered or planned in isolation, but has to be taken out of its sector and integrated into an overall vision of development that assumes multisectoral approaches and partnerships. It has to make links with primary education and with post-literacy. There

is talk of «open learning systems» that are adapted to suit all educational situations and demands.

New Prospects

There seems to be a universal call for the recognition of a key role for, and for the delegation of more responsibilities to **local communities**. This applies to the participation of learners in project planning, the acceptance of responsibilities by local authorities, and the involvement of community organizations, NGOs and businesses in basic education which is part of local development projects. The key words are: participation, appropriation, relevance and responsibility.

This desire for democracy has explicit cultural effects. **Cultural plurality** must be reflected in the diversity of programmes, operators and participants. Vernacular languages and cultures are to be given their true value, and the cultural rights of minority peoples restated. Traditional learning styles and knowledge have their place in basic education, as do new technologies and pedagogical innovations. In Africa particularly, «the importance of African cultures and values» is stressed.

The development model pursued brings together values of respect for cultural differences, the democratic principles of the diversity and equality of all citizens, and of participation, the implementation of basic human rights — the right to learn, the right to work, the right to be different and the right to information — and the overcoming of barriers that prevent participation in public life. In place of economic globalization, **sustainable endogenous development** is proposed, and in place of the laws of the market, social priorities and ecological concerns. In Europe, basic education is no longer only associated with employability in the primary labour market, but also with alternative models of socioeconomic organization that are linked to the revaluing of useful work, service to the community and local development.⁷

In Asia and Latin America especially, demands for equity for girls and women are subordinated to a broader view of initiatives for women. In basic education, this can mean looking for novel types of learning, teaching styles and organizational structures.

Policies

Adults' right to education must be enshrined in states' constitutions and be the subject of specific legislation. The resources allocated to basic education must be increased, and the continuity of budgets guaranteed by a percentage

levy on GDP (the Indian model). In Africa, it is recommended that »absolute priority be given to the struggle against poverty and that basic education for all be placed at the heart of this approach.« In Latin America, there is an emphasis on improving the quality of basic education and enhancing its goals, which aim at letting citizens develop a critical spirit, and acquire attitudes and skills that are of use in building democratic societies in a healthy environment. In Europe, the right to basic education is linked to access to modern information media and subsequent education and training that threaten to become a »source of new exclusions and to create a gap between the social sectors in a country«.

3

Given the risk of abandoning basic education to the market, the state **must accept the main responsibility** for the planning and coordination of literacy activities, which should not be entrusted to a single department or a single partner. This responsibility is exercised above all in the realms of legislation, distribution of resources, application of the principles of justice and equity, coordination of partnerships, institutional arrangements to encourage local action, and monitoring of the quality and outcomes of public operations.

The responsibility of public authorities is **shared** with organizations in the civil society, the private sector, international NGOs and local authorities, which must nevertheless »undertake to let the communities concerned appropriate activities begun jointly« (Africa).

The need for **cooperation** on a regional scale and between all those involved in literacy is particularly stressed in Africa, where there is a call for cultural synergy in order better to recognize the values of African identity in the challenges posed by the globalization of trade. In Latin America, there is a reminder that international cooperation must respect the autonomy and priorities of each country. In Europe, the response to the globalization of the economy calls for international solidarity. There must be greater regional solidarity between Eastern and Western Europe.

Strengthening of Programmes

Learners are at the heart of the literacy process. They must be involved in all stages of learning.

Programmes must be diversified according to the needs and demands of the communities and social contexts. Community participation approaches should be encouraged to ensure that learners become the owners and take responsibility.

Contrary to the wishes of those who want to be autonomous, literacy must be part of an integrated learning system that embraces formal and nonformal approaches and establishes bridges between them. It must lead to universal primary education. Open learning systems should link it to other educational pathways.

In order to make it easier for people to have a share in success, learning objectives must be practical and easily attainable, and must match learners' aspirations.

If teaching approaches and learning tools are to match learners' needs, they must incorporate their knowledge, skills and languages. For girls and women, they must aim at goals of autonomy and strengthening of capacities.

Learners' own imagination can advantageously be employed in situations of extreme poverty in order to enhance the learning environment at low cost.

There is a universal call for a solid body of research in order to improve learning materials and practices, to follow up innovative experiments, to enhance evaluation; to create reliable databases, and more generally to provide a better assessment of the impact of literacy on social change and development.

It is expected that the universities should become more involved through research and the training of teachers and animators. Fundamental research is particularly necessary for a better grasp of traditional knowledge, and of local languages and cultures.

Evaluation must be an integral part of programmes, and be carried out by internal and external evaluators.

Notes

1. The principal documents used for this overview are the declarations issued by the UNESCO regional conferences (with the exception of that for the Arab States, which was unavailable), working documents for preparatory seminars for the Hamburg Conference, and publications in preparation. The more numerous references to two regions are due to the author's special knowledge (Europe) and the differing quantity of documentation available on the other regions. The quotations with no reference to a source are drawn from the regional reports.
2. Graff, Harvey J., *Literacy: Myths and Lessons. Adult Literacy: an International Urban Perspective*. Conference Proceedings, United Nations Headquarters, 3-6 August 1992,

New York, The City University of New York/The Literacy Assistance Center Inc. / UNESCO, New York, 1994, p. 16.

3. Goody, Jack, *The Domestication of the Savage Mind*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1984.
4. Wagner, Serge, *Alphabétisation, formation de base et pays industrialisés*. Unpublished communication at the Barcelona Pan-European Conference, 12-14 December 1996.
5. Marushiakova, Elena, Popov, Vesselin, *The Gypsy Minority in Bulgaria*, in: *Haute-cœur*, Jean Paul (Editor), Alpha 97. Basic Education and Institutional Environments, UNESCO Institute for Education, Hamburg, 1997.
6. *Learning: The Treasure Within*, Report of the International Commission on Education for the 21st century, Paris, UNESCO Publications, 1996.
7. This theme has been frequently treated in the earlier publications in the ALPHA series of the UNESCO Institute for Education, edited by the author.

3



CONFINTEA V

THEME 4:

**Promoting the
Empowerment
of Women
through Adult
Learning**

Carolyn Medel-Añonuevo

Learning Gender Justice: The Challenge for Adult Education in the 21st Century

4

Emerging as one of the key priorities during the 1990 Jomtien Education for All Conference, women's education has sustained its visibility as a critical development concept. As a result of international conferences and the 1995 Beijing World Conference on Women, the discussion that has been generated has led to a deeper reflection of the interconnections of women's education and empowerment.

Several years of rich discussions across the regions conducted in a variety of languages, covering a range of arenas from schools to trade unions to political parties to social movements to the home, encompassing different themes from literacy to sexuality to migration, have helped not only in clarifying the issues but also in constructing a critical framework on women's empowerment and the role of education in this process.

Building on previous work at the UNESCO Institute for Education (UIE) and the more recent International Seminar-Workshop on «Promoting the Empowerment of Women Through Adult Learning», this paper outlines and elaborates on some elements of this framework. Due to limits in space and time, the pa-

per is not able to cover all the existing materials that have emerged and therefore should be read as a preliminary and partial attempt to synthesize some of the existing discussions.

A. Revisiting the Empowerment Framework

The Beijing Platform of Action is held together by the key term »empowerment« yet in different parts of the document, one glimpses the diverse conceptions of the word. It is equated with individual self-reliance in some parts, and elsewhere there is talk of collective strength. Are these notions contradictory and therefore exclusive of each other?

Longwe (1997) differs from a conservative view, which has a purely economic and individual approach, and looks at empowerment as »women's capacity to make the best of their own lives«, and from a radical view, in which empowerment means »generating enough political mobilization and organization so that we are in a position to take«. She explains that in the traditional point of view, a woman can be empowered if she has access to literacy, education, productive skills and capital, which will then pave the way for her to get ahead. This however is a limited view as it is based on »the advancement of the individual without any societal perspective of the problem. It is concerned with enabling women to advance within the present society, rather than through structural transformation« (Longwe, 1997).

The alternative view, on the other hand, puts emphasis on women collectively coming together »to recognize and address the gender issues which stand in the way of their advancement« (Longwe, 1997). Empowerment in this context, involves the transformation of patriarchal society through a »process of enlightenment, conscientization and collective organization« and therefore necessitates collective action by women to discard the patriarchal beliefs and attitudes they have learned in their schools (Longwe, 1997).

In contrast to schooling for self-reliance, education for empowerment as elaborated by Longwe (1997) concretely allows women to learn the following:

- »1. think and work collectively with others, instead of working as an individual to compete against others;
2. question the social and political environment, not merely as a given to be understood, but also as an unsatisfactory environment to be changed;

3. look for political interests which underlie apparently technical and neutral explanations;
4. recognize that gender policies do not command political consensus but in fact attract both explicit and covert opposition;
5. question whether public institutions are working in the public interest;
6. develop strategies for working in an area of political conflict and confrontation; and
7. devise strategies to counter covert bureaucratic resistance to gender oriented policies.« (p. 10)

4

While not discounting the role of empowering education to transform structures, one should also be reminded that education involves a cognitive process which takes place primarily at the individual level and that consideration and analysis of this level is also important. The importance of the psychological aspect of empowerment (e.g. the resulting self-confidence or increased self-esteem) cannot be underestimated (Dighe, 1995; Stromquist, 1995) and should also be accorded deeper thought especially in relation to structural transformation. After all, the goal of transformation is not only applicable to societies but should also be relevant to individuals and relationships, especially vis-à-vis power.

Finally, given the centrality of the concept of »power«, it is important for empowering education to look at and discuss the range of meanings of the conceptions of this term as elaborated by Marxists, feminists (through the slogan, »The personal is political«), Foucault, Freire and others to allow us a holistic view that takes into consideration structural and individual levels of power and their different bases.

In this regard, the definition and goals of empowerment vis-à-vis the concept of power, as elucidated by Batliwala (1997) are clear:

»Empowerment is the process — and the result of the process — whereby the powerless or less powerful members of a society gain greater access and control over material and knowledge resources, challenge the ideologies of discrimination and subordination, and transform the institutions and structures through which unequal access and control over resources is sustained and perpetuated.

The goals of women's empowerment are: 1) to challenge and transform the ideology and practice of women's subordination; 2) to transform the structures and institutions which have upheld and reinforced this discrimination — such as the family, caste, class, ethnicity, and the social, economic and political structures and institutions including religion, education systems, the media, the law, top-down development models, etc. and; 3) to gain access and control over material and knowledge resources. « (p. 7)

B. The Main Concerns of Empowering Education

As the above discussion has tried to make clear that the goal of empowerment is the transformation of individuals, relationships, institutions and structures, one can then proceed to the three major concerns of empowering education: 1) access; 2) content; and 3) pedagogy.

1. Democratizing Access to Education

Historically, women have been denied access to schooling, literacy and other educational opportunities. By the use of a host of social, cultural, economic, biological and historical reasons, many women have been discriminated against and effectively denied one of the basic human rights. This has produced a gender gap that continues to be evident whether in school enrolment rates, literacy rates or adult education participation.

For example, out of the almost one billion non-literate population, two-thirds are women.

Using the results of an Adult Education Survey conducted in six Western countries, Valdivielso (1997) explains that while there is very little difference in the participation rates of women and men, a closer look at other variables shows for instance that more men get support from their companies for educational activities and that women use their free time for such activities compared unlike men, who utilize their work time for this.

It is clear from the above study that one can not be contented with participation rates as they are, but must delve more into other factors that can enlighten us beyond the figures. The gender gap is more than an issue of discrepancy in numbers and cannot be reduced to simple unequal access. Berlak (1997), for

example, points out that by questioning the discrimination against women, we are also addressing issues of democracy. She argues that increasing visibility and participation of women in institutions and structures can have both qualitative and quantitative effects on society especially in terms of enlarging the concept of citizenship.

Citing the discussion of an international seminar in Latin America, Berlak (1997) enumerates the issues that need to be confronted for a broader notion of citizenship: «exercise of rights and duties, guarantee of equality in the exercise of rights, establishment of new rights, to be part of the social system, to be able to participate in decision-making, participation in public matters, and to guarantee the participation honoring the differences and pluralities» (p. 3). Given this enlarged definition of citizenship, it is clear that access and participation are just the first step. It is equally important to examine the content of these educational opportunities since women's experiences have shown that such information and knowledge have been used to legitimize gender discrimination and oppression.

2. What are Women Learning?

Schooling for subordination is the term Longwe (1997) uses to describe the process of learning whereby women are taught to accept the naturalness of male domination. Hence feminists have focused their efforts on looking at educational materials and curricula to assess to what extent they contain messages that further reinforce gender stereotypes and offer women limited possibilities. Others have examined what empowering messages such materials contain. It would be difficult for this section to tackle the range of educational opportunities accessible to women and their dominant messages. Instead, examples from only three areas (literacy, workers' education and gender training) will be given.

Alarmed by the large numbers of women non-literates, many countries have embarked on literacy campaigns and programmes that are primarily meant for women. Analysis of literacy primers used in India, for example, shows the dominant portrayal of domestic and reproductive work of women while men are presented as involved in productive work (Patel, 1996). While teaching the women to read and write, the materials also reinforce the traditional gender division of labor and by doing so contribute to the perpetuation of such stereotypes. Furthermore, by making women invisible in the productive sphere, the

materials contribute to the non-recognition and non-valuation of women's contribution to this sphere.

To move away from this stereotype presentation of women in literacy materials, many women's groups have involved the women learners themselves in coming up with materials in which not only the conditions but also the aspirations of women are incorporated (Nirantar, 1996).

The same predominance of certain stereotypes can also be observed in workers' education. Chan (1997) writes that «most educational programmes of unions and social service groups are formulated from the perspective of sponsors or providers and in terms of a deficit model (Wynne 1988). Assumed ignorance in relation to the women's roles as workers and homemakers, and assumed deficiency in terms of loose morals, underlie the practice of education as information, motivation and chastisement. The aims are to equip the women morally and functionally to behave in predefined ways, to impart awareness of their responsibilities and rights as workers, and to convey the benefits of unionization.» (p. 8)

In response to such instrumentalization, Chan (1997) talks of the need for workers' education not only to focus on objective material conditions (which covers conditions of work as well as workers' position) but also to include women workers' subjectivities. For Chan (1997), «it is essential that silenced experiences of emotional subordination, powerlessness and inferiority have to be taken on board in and as educational work.» (p. 11)

The third example of women's educational opportunity is in the area of gender training. One of the most popular forms of disseminating gender issues, it is easily acceptable because of its immediate relevance to development issues. Longwe (1997) contrasts two frameworks, in one of which the definition of gender training is «confined to the perception that gender issues in development are primarily concerned with increasing women's access to resources, based on the understanding of the present gender division of labor, and the gender division in access to productive resources.» (p. 2) By doing a gender analysis of the programmes and situations of communities, one is able to effectively plan how women can gain access. By reducing gender subordination to a technical or access issue, this approach continues to perpetuate existing inequalities.

In contrast, Longwe (1997) describes radical gender training as «concerned with enabling participants to recognize the political and ideological dimen-

sions of gender inequality and address problems on this basis. Gender training is therefore largely concerned with the process of conscientization, enabling participants to step outside of a patriarchal culture and adopt a more feminist consciousness. Conscientization involves the crucial realization and revelation that women's poverty and low status do not arise primarily from their own lack of individual effort, or from lack of literacy or schooling « (pp. 3-4)

The examples above show the competing conservative and empowering content of educational opportunities. It is evident that it is not enough to say that women are provided access to such opportunities. For one could in fact conclude that women are given access to education so that they learn better the traditional roles patriarchal societies have assigned to them. On the other hand, it is crucial to always be reminded that it is still possible to resist this hidden curriculum, whether it be in presenting empowering messages or using empowering processes.

4

3. How do Women Learn? Providing an Environment and Process for Empowerment

If schools teach girls to accept authority and not to question, how do we reverse this process so that women can be liberated and involve themselves in the transformatory process. Transformatory education is a complex process and in this part, only two related elements will be discussed, first, the learning environment and second, the process by which women learn.

Marie (1997) underlines the importance of the learning environment as she explains that «many girls, because it is unsafe in the classroom and/or unsafe in their homes, are unable to concentrate on study» (p. 6) and the consequences for girls who «often leave school with low self-esteem regarding their capabilities, feeling unintelligent and dumb.» (p. 6) The challenge for educators is to ensure a safe environment for girls and women which is free not only from harassment but from all forms of discrimination, which hinders the learning process.

An environment that acknowledges women's experiences is also one that can facilitate the learning process. Marie (1997) points out that «We also need to redefine the concept of mistakes so that women see them not as experiences to be ashamed of or as further «evidence» of their incompetency but rather as «taonga» or treasures that have assisted us to try out new ways and discover newly about ourselves and the universe.» (p. 10)

In this connection, time and emotional space should be allotted to enable women to make the connections between their experiences and the course content (Marie, 1997). Similarly, Chan (1997) narrates how »I have used story-telling-sharing as education in small groups to evoke repressed voices for reconstructing subjectivities: the recollection and articulation of feelings and thoughts associated with experienced subordination for the purpose of recovery, self-definition and self-reconstitution. Narration of lived experiences of anguish and pain, in which the women have been victimized, which they had been made to accept and had suppressed, was encouraged. In this informal conversational mode, connections, new meaning and understandings emerge through listening, questioning and reflecting on each other's stories, and it is this process that contributes to the recovery of the women's authentic realities as they themselves have experienced them.« (p. 11)

The process of empowering learning that has so far been described involves two elements: 1) the need to bring individual experiences to the group and the collective process of understanding and analysis; and 2) the importance of looking at the realm of emotions and psyche and its connection to cognitive processes.

C. Providing an Environment for Learning Gender Justice

The last week of February this year saw 35 women sharing their educational experiences as well as formulating proposals for the Fifth International Conference on Adult Education (CONFINTEA) towards the goal of empowering education. In that meeting, the women agreed that the leitmotif for the fifth theme of the conference (»Promoting the Empowerment of Women Through Adult Learning«) should be »**Learning Gender Justice**« with the following six objectives:

1. to raise the consciousness of girls, boys, men and women concerning gender inequalities and the need to change these unequal relations;
2. to promote gender-sensitive participatory pedagogy, which acknowledges the daily life experience of women and which recognizes cognitive as well as affective outcomes;
3. to educate men and women to acknowledge the serious and adverse impacts of globalization and structural adjustment policies upon human beings in all parts of the world, especially upon women;

4. to adopt policies and take fiscal measures to provide educational opportunities that will enable girls and women to build confidence and develop leadership capacities and management skills; and to advance women's participation in the formal and informal sectors of the economy;
5. to take measures to ensure women's successful participation in adult education by removing obstacles and providing supportive learning environments; and
6. to encourage women to organize as women to promote a collective identity and to create women's organizations to initiate change in the intimate, private and public spheres.

4

The world today is full of despair and destruction, and conservative economic and political forces continue to dominate and rule the lives of women and men. Yet our societies are also full of stories of hope and celebration of how women and men have appropriated spaces of power or resisted the powers that be, and continue to assert the power of the powerless to survive and act. Women and men have to persist in learning gender justice so that the 21st century can be ushered in with more optimism.

This can mean many things. It may mean new knowledge which does not leave women as victims but as survivors, with new-found dignity that comes from collective discussion and understanding of their stories (Marie, 1997); or women having »to develop to develop confidence in ourselves. That translates strategically into accomplishing unity to put ourselves in first place: to overcome the fears, loneliness, suffering, self-complacency and self-compassion, jealousies and competitiveness that lack of self-esteem generate in us... to us to develop our capacities to construct, learn, enjoy, support each other, accede to pleasure and stop just surviving miserably. It is urgent that we deconstruct subordination, overcome the adoration and servitude between genders.« (Montis, 1997, p. 12)

References

- Batiwala, Srilatha, Education for Women's Empowerment — A Perspective Paper. Presented during the Orientation Seminar on «Women's Education Amidst Economic, Social and Political Changes», Hamburg, Germany, November 13-17, 1995.
- Berlak, Miriam, General Outline for the Frame of Gender Training in Political and Trade Union Fields. Paper presented at the International Seminar-Workshop on «Promoting the Empowerment of Women through Adult Learning», Chiangmai, Thailand, February 24-28, 1997.

- Chan, Lean Heng, Women Workers' Education in Malaysia: A Critical Review. Paper presented at the International Seminar-Workshop on «Promoting the Empowerment of Women through Adult Learning», Chiangmai, Thailand, February 24-28, 1997.
- Dighe, Anita, Women's Literacy for Empowerment: The Nellore Experience, in: Medel-Añonuevo, Carolyn (ed), Women, Education and Empowerment: Pathways towards Autonomy, UIE Studies 5, 1995, pp. 39-46.
- Longwe, Sara, Education for Women's Empowerment or Schooling for Women's Subordination. Paper presented at the International Seminar-Workshop on «Promoting the Empowerment of Women Through Adult Learning», Chiangmai, Thailand, February 24-28, 1997.
- Marie, Gillian, The Key Issue of Safety for Empowering Women Through Adult Education. Paper presented at the International Seminar-Workshop on «Promoting the Empowerment of Women Through Adult Learning», Chiangmai, Thailand, February 24-28, 1997.
- Mishra, Renuka, Poverty Alleviation and Women. Paper presented at the International Seminar-Workshop on «Promoting the Empowerment of Women Through Adult Learning», Chiangmai, Thailand, February 24-28, 1997.
- Montis, Malena de, Women and Political Participation: Challenges from the National Coalition of Nicaraguan Women. Paper presented at the International Seminar-Workshop on «Promoting the Empowerment of Women Through Adult Learning», Chiangmai, Thailand, February 24-28, 1997.
- NIRANTAR, Educational Strategies for Women: A Case Study of Mahila Samakhyas, Banda, in: Medel-Añonuevo, Carolyn (ed), Women Reading the World: Policies and Practices of Literacy in Asia, UIE Studies 6, 1996, pp. 37-47.
- Patel, Ila, Analysis of Total Literacy Campaign Primers, in: Medel-Añonuevo, Carolyn (ed), Women Reading the World: Policies and Practices in Asia, UIE Studies 6, 1996, pp. 89-96.
- Stromquist, Nelly, The Theoretical and Practical Bases for Empowerment, in: Medel-Añonuevo, Carolyn (ed), Women, Education and Empowerment: Pathways towards Autonomy, UIE Studies 5, 1995, pp. 13-22.
- Walters, Shirley, Democracy, Development and Adult Education in South Africa. Paper presented at the International Seminar-Workshop on «Promoting the Empowerment of Women through Adult Learning», Chiangmai, Thailand, February 24-28, 1997.
- Valdivielso, Sofia, Participation in Adult Education in Western Countries. Paper presented at the International Seminar-Workshop on «Promoting the Empowerment of Women through Adult Learning», Chiangmai, Thailand, February 24-28, 1997.



CONFINTEA V

THEME 5:

*Adult Learning
in a Changing
World of Work*

R. Barry Hobart

Adult Education and the Changing World of Work. Focal Points of Change

The Main Issues to be Discussed

This theme will focus on the most significant principles and practices that relate adult education to the world of work. In so doing, it will address principles and practices that relate specifically to the world of work, principles and practices that relate to the endeavours of education itself, principles and practices that relate to the responsibilities of the political arena with respect to adult education, and principles and practices that relate to the broad social responsibility of adult education. The following important questions will be addressed:

World of Work

1. What are the changes in the world of work that must be addressed by adult education to ensure the genuine implementation of lifelong learning, life-long career development and lifelong employment?
2. How can adult education cooperate with the world of employment and economic production to ensure the relevance, and employability, of human resources?

3. How can adult education support the development of democracy in the workplace through the collectivisation of employees, the appropriate role of unions, and the development of participatory management?
4. How can adult education encourage the assumption of responsibility by the various entities within the world of work for the protection of the environment?

Education

1. How should adult education articulate with general education, technical and vocational education, higher education, and with training within the workplace in order to support the maintenance of people as effective and efficient employees within the world of work?
2. How should adult education support the initiatives of non-formal education, small business enterprise and the self-employed with respect to the employment of people and to the effective and efficient performance of employees within the productive process?
3. What teaching/learning strategies need to be supported, or developed and implemented, by adult education to increase its contribution to the efficiency of the world of work and to the fair and just distribution of the wealth generated by the world of work?

Political

1. What are the policies and legislation that need to be developed and implemented by governments to support the universal availability and effectiveness of adult and continuing technical and vocational education?
2. How can adult education for the world of work be co-ordinated effectively among the various ministries within a government that have some responsibility for training and employment (such as ministries of education, vocational education, higher education, employment, rural industries, tourism, etc.) and with NGOs and other organisations that have political clout?
3. What financial support needs to be given by governments, and other entities, to formal and informal adult and continuing education for the world of work?

Social

1. How can adult education contribute to the removing of the disparities of economic return from employment — among countries and within countries — stemming from such factors as sex discrimination, exploitation of the disadvantaged, the internationalising of work, the restructuring of economies, migration, etc.?
2. How can adult education for the world of work contribute significantly to the social effectiveness, social responsibility, personal actualisation and empowerment of people within the arena of work?

5

The Galaxy of Issues

Encompassing these broad spheres of concern is a galaxy of issues. These can best be analysed by focusing on five principal entities. These five principal entities are:

- (1) the learner
- (2) the teaching /training provider
- (3) the employer
- (4) the unions, and
- (5) the government

These five entities constitute the partners within this area of human endeavour. Thus, it is a shared responsibility.

(1) The Learner

It is not often that consideration of this area of education starts with the learner. That is unfortunate for it is the nature and needs of the learner, and the competencies that the learner must possess for effective and efficient performance within an occupation, that principally determine the content of the learning programmes, and the strategies needed to deliver them.

Learners within adult education programmes designed for the world of work must be thoroughly prepared for them. Much of this **preparation** occurs within the sphere of **general education**. Fundamentally, it must:

- provide for the **personal development** of the learner
- develop **self-learning skills**
- engender **generic knowledge, skills and attitudes**
- assist the learner to make a wise and satisfying **career choice** through such programmes as career education, and, of enormous importance
- the early learning experience must be such a self-fulfilling experience that the person becomes **committed to lifelong learning**

Education is the process of personal development through the harnessing of cognitive competencies. All learning, whether of a general nature or more specifically focusing on clearly defined tasks (sometimes called training), should lead to a greater realisation of a person's potential. Adult education will fail to meet its objectives if the early learning experiences of a person are not self-fulfilling. This is a major responsibility of general education. An essential outcome of such education is the commitment of a person to lifelong learning. Without such a commitment adult education programmes will be offered in vain. Curiosity demonstrates that learning is an intrinsic enjoyment of human beings. Early learning needs to foster and reward that curiosity. To be efficient in doing so, that learning must develop self-learning skills that enable a person to pursue lifelong learning.

Lifelong Learning

The world of work is in a constant state of flux and change. Technological development is introducing new skills and making others redundant, the high rate of unemployment is demanding new training and retraining, the shift from rural to urban employment requires a change in competencies and life style, migration and the displacement of peoples around the globe need a re-orientation to a different sphere of the world of work; all these, and other factors, demand commitment to and provision for lifelong learning. In technical and vocational education this is often called »recurrent education«. In a holistic concept it is termed »Adult and Continuing Technical and Vocational Education«. Whatever may be the terminology, the goal is essentially the same. The world of work requires that its participants must be given the opportunity for constant personal and vocational development if we are to avoid the plague of unemployed and redundant workers. But lifelong learning requires personal commitment and motivation, which will only come from such learning being rewarded.

Effective Vocational Guidance

The orientation to the world of work that includes effective vocational guidance needs to begin at the very early stages of general education and to proceed throughout general education. But it must also be available within adult education, where vocational choice is increasingly a part of the whole of a person's career.

All this indicates the need for a person to be oriented to the world of work, and prepared for it, well before entering it. Such an orientation is a gradual process and requires much more than the development of specific skills, and the specific knowledge and attitudes that relate to those skills. It requires the development of appropriate attitudes, of expectations that are realistic, of a career choice that is in harmony with the person's potential, personal desires and characteristics, and of self-directed learning skills that enable the person to engage in lifelong learning. An important strategy for attaining these ends is that of K-12 **career education**. This is the education that introduces the child to the world of work, in a very mild way, in *kindergarten*, and increases that exposure through the general-schooling years until they are over. Programmes for this type of development need to be implemented the world over.

5

Employment Status

The nature of the learner's employment determines a considerable number of other factors relevant to effective programmes of adult education for the world of work, taking into consideration the specific situations of the

- unemployed
- precariously employed
- regularly employment
- self-employed
- employed in the informal economy

Career Status

Much has been said and written about adult and continuing technical and vocational education; not as much has been done to provide for it. Nevertheless, job change is becoming essential for most people and the prospect of

working in five or more different occupations in a life time is becoming the norm. This obviously has significant implications for the establishing of career paths and for the obtaining of sufficient experience within an occupation to be able to move up into senior management positions.

The globalisation of work, the continual restructuring of economies, the greater mobility of workers, the urbanisation of societies, and other such factors, also impact upon career prospects. These make recurrent education for the world of work, and lifelong learning, essential. However, the curriculum content and teaching/learning systems essential for this area of education, in many parts of the world, are not well developed.

Social Issues

The following suggest the many social issues that impact on the adult's ability to learn, and availability for the teaching/learning programmes provided.

- The traditional perceptions of appropriate roles for **females in the world of work**, and, consequently, of appropriate teaching/learning programmes in technical and vocational education for females, are being vigorously challenged, the world over, and are changing. The content of learning programmes, the strategies for delivery of such programmes, and the teaching/training personnel involved, all need to be brought into scrutiny by this challenge, and appropriately changed.
- With the globalisation of the workplace, **cultural realities** among the workers need to be accommodated in ways that minimise hostility and conflict and that encourage appreciation and respect for cultural differences. This respect for cultural differences must also characterise the teaching/learning programmes. The increasing mobility of workers in the world today requires adult and continuing technical and vocational education to assume a high degree of responsibility for engendering appreciation of and respect for the different cultures among its learners.
- Economic, political and social factors are causing increasing **migration of workers** around the world. The flow-on of this phenomenon to adult and continuing technical and vocational education is considerable. Language programmes must be offered. Programmes leading to the understanding of the culture and customs of a particular community, need to be available

to migrants. The need to **measure prior learning and experience and accredit them**, is increasing. Bridging courses, and skill-upgrading courses need to be developed in order that communities gain a maximum of benefit from migration and that migrants are able to prosper in their new environments.

- The physically handicapped, the elderly, the infirm, the mentally retarded, people that are **disadvantaged** with respect to learning, must command our attention. Sensitivity to the particular needs of these people, rather than the neglect of them, is increasing in most societies. As we make progress in this area of human concern, adult and continuing technical and vocational education must develop teaching/learning programmes and strategies that enable such potential learners to broaden and deepen their aspirations and achievements within their social and economic contexts.
- The tragedy of human conflict has always lead to the **displacement of people** from the security of their social and physical environments. This tragedy has not decreased in the latter half of this century. Thus, the significant needs that such persons have for the education and training that allows them to be socially, economically and politically effective in their new environments, will not decrease. Further, the learning programmes that support such people need to include provisions for psychological support to enable them to adjust as effectively as possible to their changed, and often, tragic conditions.
- In a significant number of work environments, the potential of some workers to progress in their work contexts is inhibited by their being locked into such a **low status** that it disallows advancement. The slow but perceptible change in this reality demands that adult and continuing education for the world of work develop programmes that allow such people to realize a greater part of their potential than hitherto.

(2) The Teaching/Training Providers

This focal point embraces formal technical and vocational education institutions, private technical and vocational education providers, training units within government and non-government organisations, community education centres, and supervisors and others who must assume some training responsibilities as a part of their occupational profile. In the light of the fact

5

that the success of teaching/learning programmes is highly dependent upon the effectiveness of teachers and trainers, there is a great need for the provision of effective teacher training and trainer-training programmes. For those whose primary occupational responsibilities are not training, but who nevertheless have some responsibilities for training, programmes to assist them with these training responsibilities will need to be delivered through strategies that accommodate the other demands and commitments that such people have. Competency-based vocational teacher education and trainer-training delivered through a modular system, offer potential in this area.

Technical and Vocational Education Institutions

There is a universal need to lift the status of these institutions within the educational arena. This is directly dependent upon the status and value of technical and vocational education itself being lifted within societies as a whole. A significant factor in achieving this goal is to establish a much closer articulation between technical and vocational education and university education than exists in most countries at present. Coupled with this is the need to establish better economic rewards for undertaking technical and vocational education programmes. Again, the teaching personnel within these institutions need to be well qualified and to have had significant and relevant world of work experience. Further, they need to keep their knowledge and skills up to date by periods of further experience within the world of work. Many of these institutions suffer from insufficient resources to purchase the complex and expensive equipment needed for their workshops and laboratories. Thus, a close liaison with employing institutions in the work of work needs to be established so that effective on-the-job experience programmes for students may be worked out cooperatively between the education institution and the employing enterprise.

Industry Training Institutions

A closer partnership between these institutions and formal technical and vocational education institutions needs to be established so that trainers within these institutions may draw upon the pedagogical knowledge and experience of technical and vocational education teachers and the formal technical and vocational education institutions may draw upon the machinery and equipment within the enterprise organisations as appropriate and coordinate with

them the on-the-job experience programmes for technical and vocational education students. The training personnel within these institutions frequently lack sufficient pedagogical knowledge and experience for designing and applying the essential principles of effective and stimulating teaching/learning programmes. Thus, the need for better trainer-training programmes in most countries is considerable.

Community Education Institutions

These institutions, where they exist, are an essential part of effective adult education. They need to be extensively developed as a means of supporting the adjustment of new-comers into a community. These people include migrants and displaced persons and their families, as well as rural groups shifting into an urban community. The programmes these institutions offer can be extensive, and the delivery of them can often be more flexible than that of the programmes in formal educational institutions. Frequently the teaching/training personnel within these institutions are part-time, possibly unpaid volunteers. However, they need assistance in developing effective pedagogical skills if they are to fulfil their mandates effectively.

Private Education/Training Providers

These providers of education for the world of work have a valuable role to play. However, they need sufficient supervision by the appropriate authorities to ensure that their standards meet the needs of the employing world. Again, it is essential that the teaching/training personnel within them are adequately trained in both the necessary pedagogical knowledge and skills, and in the occupational skills relevant to the teaching/training programmes offered.

Articulation of General Education with Technical and Vocational Education

The constant change in the knowledge and skills required for a particular occupation, and the need for frequent change in employment, makes it imperative that a person has the basis for developing further knowledge and skills as quickly and effectively as possible. This requires a sufficient knowledge base for developing an understanding of other related areas of knowledge, that is,

«generic knowledge» which includes, among other things, basic scientific, mathematical, and technological principles. This is why the increasing articulation between general education and technical and vocational education is so very important. However, the challenge to the training and education world is to present this knowledge with relevance in order to motivate the learner to absorb and retain it.

With the phenomenon of job change and the restructuring of economies, a greater emphasis is being placed on the need for generic knowledge, skills and attitudes that are essential to the transfer of learning, and these must be developed in the general education process. Again, as mentioned above, orientation to the world of work through career education programmes needs to be established within the general education context. Many countries have seen the need to develop vocational education programmes within the general education arena in order to equip people more effectively for the world of work. These developments require a close articulation between general education and technical and vocational education.

Articulation of Technical and Vocational Education with Higher Education

For genuine career paths to be established, and for the developing to a maximum of the potential of individuals, higher education around the world must become more open in its recognition of prior learning and in its accrediting of learning gained from programmes offered in other institutions that are not part of the higher education arena. This presents the challenge of developing instruments for the valid and reliable assessment of experiential learning. The resistance of higher education in many countries to this greater degree of articulation with other educational institutions stems frequently from tradition, conservatism and the desire to preserve status, rather than from genuine educational concerns. That resistance needs to be removed if genuine lifelong learning is to be established around the world.

Small Business Enterprise Supervisors/Employers

The non-formal sector is a very significant employing sector within most economies. Consequently, it must be supported by both governments and the educational entities within a country. The educational programmes developed for this sector must be characterised by relevance to the sector and must be offered through teaching/learning strategies that accommodate the problems

and difficulties encountered by potential learners within it. Flexibility and self-paced learning must characterise these programmes.

Flexible Learning Systems

If we are to apply credit for prior learning; if we are to allow for open entry and increased access to learning; if we are to encourage lifelong learning and recurrent education; if we are to support a career path that is supported by both horizontal and vertical occupational development and change; then the curricula needs to be modularised in such a way as to allow meaningful entrance to and exit from the learning process. This, of course, cannot be applied to all curricula as it would destroy the logic of important areas of inter-related learning. However, it could be applied much more extensively than it is at present. The time and energy needed to restructure curricula in this way is often lacking; and also the skills to do so.

5

Distance Education

For many reasons a person may need to study by distance education — especially in the area of continuing education. Not all teaching/learning institutions, by any means, can offer distance education programmes. They are costly to develop, and require considerable skills in both their development, application, and administration. Therefore, institutions that do not offer distance education must be willing to credit the work done by students through distance education. For this to occur, the distance education open learning institution must present programmes of the highest standards and demonstrate clearly that they apply rigorously valid and reliable evaluation procedures.

While we should not reinvent the wheel with respect to distance education, we must also be very careful to adapt resources and strategies to the particular context in which they are to be applied. Nothing is more frustrating and destructive to distance education than the use of programmes that do not fit the particular situation in which they are being applied.

Competency-Based Education

This is a means of education and training that places emphasis on measurable outcomes and allows for considerable flexibility in the methods used to attain those outcomes. It stresses the need for mastery, and the public disclosure of

the intended outcomes, before the student engages in the learning process. While this method of learning is by no means the panacea to all human ills in the area of learning, it does have great potential, if used well, for promoting self-directed learning and providing for such learning from a distance. Around the world, competency-based education is coming to the fore. It can be a valuable tool for distance education and provide for an extensive use of technology and local resources. It is far less teacher-dependent than many other systems of learning. In this respect, it encourages the development of self-learning skills. The two main criticisms that have been made of this system are first, that the teacher does not feel comfortable with the new role of a resource person, and secondly, that it is too behaviourist and does not provide for the holistic development of a person. The first problem is of little consequence if we move away in teacher preparation from the traditional model of a teacher — the authoritarian provider of information. The second criticism need not be a reality, but it must be thoroughly taken into account. It is true that the whole is more than the sum of its parts. All teaching/learning needs to take that into account. The humanist school of psychology, stemming from the work of Carl Rogers and Abraham Maslow, makes considerable emphasis on this point. So also does adult education in the work of Malcolm Knowles.

Educational Use of the Media

The potential of the media for education and human development is enormous. Tragically, it is often used to incite hatred, play on prejudice, and propagate inaccuracies or deceptions. It tends to be dominated by the need for sensational presentations; and it is not hard to understand why. However, it has considerable potential for use in informal education. It can assist in the learning of a language; in demonstrating skills; in bringing the whole world into a small arena. With satellite television, the potential of the media for supporting the development of the world of work is of primary significance. But the media must be encouraged, in one way or another, to undertake this responsibility with full commitment. In order to support true human freedom, one must resist coercion by politics and governments with respect to the media. On the other hand, the developed world clearly indicates that much more should be done to entice the media to assume the responsibility for the positive and constructive development of human understanding and thinking, whether this relates to the world of work, or to more general social and personal development. The great advantage with television is that it is one of our modern technologies that is available to many people, in developing and developed countries.

Radio has also considerable potential for the undertaking of informal education. This is especially so in such areas as language development, and the imparting of information that does not require visual support. It also has the advantage of being available to a large majority of the world's population.

(3) The Employer

It would seem unnecessary to emphasise the role of the employer in helping to meet the need for effective adult and continuing education for the world of work. Yet, in many parts of the world there is a traditional concept that such education is the responsibility of educational institutions, and of the government. However, it is being increasingly realised that such a narrow concept of those responsible for this area of education, does not meet its needs. The world of work has a very significant part to play. It must be the focus of the competencies needed to perform effectively within employment. These competencies consist of the knowledge, skills and attitudes required. It must provide effective work experience for learners within educational institutions if their learning is to be relevant. It must provide on-going work experience for technical and vocational education teachers and trainers in order to keep their knowledge and skills up to date. It must invest significant resources in education and training in order to maintain the competent work force it needs. It must cooperate with governments so as to support national plans for economic development, one component of which is a well-educated work force. It must cooperate with unions in order to ensure that the social and economic principles espoused by the nation are implemented. It must support its employees to the extent necessary in their pursuit of further knowledge and skills for their personal fulfilment and for their securing satisfying employment. Thus, the employing world is a primary partner in the endeavour to deliver effective and efficient adult and continuing technical and vocational education.

(4) The Unions

Unions have traditionally been concerned for the well-being of their members. As part of this concern they have recognised the primary place of initial and continuing technical and vocational education for the world of work. However, in some parts of the world, elements of the role of unions have been assumed by governments and the society as a whole. This has tended to make

5

them appear redundant. In other parts of the world their existence has appeared to threaten the power of the ruling body. Thus, they have either not been permitted within the workplace, or their leadership has been significantly inhibited in fulfilling their goals. However, they are an essential partner in fulfilling the economic and social responsibility of providing effective and efficient education for the world of work. Thus, their role in this sphere must be recognised and strengthened.

Unions and the Mobility of the Labour Force

Many factors, including the development of a global market, has contributed significantly to the mobility of the labour force. This has important ramifications on the membership of unions. It has also resulted in unions having a more global concern for the well-being of employees who are in particular roles that are significantly related to the world market. The responsibility of unions must, therefore, include engagement in the processes in various countries of recognising and crediting training and experience gained by workers in countries other than the one in which employment is being sought. This recognition of qualifications gained from educational institutions in «foreign» countries is vital to the support of an appropriate global mobility of the labour force. The serious consequences that migrants and displaced persons experience as a consequence of their prior learning and experience not being recognised or credited must be minimised to the extent possible.

The Relationship between Social Partners and the Government

While there are many situations in which unions, employers and government seem to be antagonistic to each other, it has been shown, the world over, that a close cooperation between the two social partners, and respect for each other's role and responsibilities, produces the most positive work climate to implement active policies. The reality of power is manifested in control. Thus, it is the aim of each of these two entities to manifest as much control as possible. However, one needs scarcely to register the fact that an excessive pursuit of control, of power, by either of these two entities is destructive. A cooperative relation between them is much more constructive and productive of healthy outcomes from their exercise of power. Within the arena of education for the world of work, employers and unions tend more and more to assist and cooperate with the government to formulate short and long-term plans for educa-

tion for it, and cooperate in its implementation. Such plans will be limited in their effect if they do not have the acceptance and support of the social partners. Again, government is more likely to provide the resources necessary for such plans to be implemented if it is confident it has the solid support of unions for them.

(5) The Government

Without question, governments are an essential partner in the national responsibility for providing an effective and efficient system of education for the world of work. This includes both preparation for the world of work, and maintaining efficiency within it. Thus, technical and vocational education is included, as well as adult and continuing technical and vocational education, and relevant and effective education for the non-formal sector. Further, the responsibility for pre-vocational education as a vital component of effective education for the world of work is also within its orbit. It must assume a leadership role in this area of social responsibility. It must encourage and support the initiatives of other members of this partnership. It must ensure that all members of the partnership play an active and constructive role. It is the partner that has the primary role of ensuring that efforts within this area of human endeavour are co-ordinated, and that resources are not wasted by unnecessary duplication. It is able to reward human effort in this sphere in a way that encourages participation and initiative by the other partners. It is able to initiate national planning that attends to the disadvantaged, to those with minimal power and thrust in the society, as well as to the design of and commitment to long-term plans for educational development within the nation. The following are some aspects of this responsibility.

Financial Support

While it is undeniable that governments have a primary responsibility for financing education for the world of work, it has been shown that support from the private sector can also enhance significantly the availability and quality of such education. As in many other areas of social responsibility, governments need to support those areas of education that may well be neglected by the society as a whole. These include appropriate education for the disadvantaged and those with minimal clout in the political arena. Governments also have the primary responsibility for financing long-term planning. Much of educa-

tion falls in this sphere. Governments also have the responsibility of financing areas of human endeavour that are difficult to attach to any realistic analysis of cost-benefits, yet are seen to be important components of life. While education for the world of work may be more realistically subjected to cost-benefit analyses, such analyses are still of dubious validity and reliability. Thus, governments must give that financial support to education for the world of work that results in all members of the society developing and maintaining competencies that reflect their potential for productive and satisfying engagement in that world of work.

National Status for Technical and Vocational Education

It is universally recognised today that the status of technical and vocational education within our societies must be lifted if we are to attain the goals of full employment, and maximum and competitive productivity. University education must no longer command such a status as to bias the wage reward structures within the economy. It is imperative that the distribution of the generated wealth of the economy encourages participation in the wide spectrum of education for the world of work, and not just in the narrow sphere of »higher-order« professions. Education for the world of work will not achieve its national goals until technical and vocational education is given the status it needs to attract a sufficient clientele to meet the manpower needs of the nation.

Locus of Control of Technical and Vocational Education within Government

A factor that inhibits governments from giving the co-ordinated support to education for the world of work that is needed is the division of responsibility for this education within a government. Frequently, a number of ministries hold some responsibility in this area. The ministries of education, employment, labour and industry, youth affairs, possibly ministries of rural development, even ministries responsible for prisons and the incarcerated, all these may be responsible for elements of education for the world of work. Their strategies for fulfilling responsibilities must be co-ordinated if maximum productivity of education expenditures is to be achieved.

Legislative Framework to Support Education and Training for the World of Work

There is a healthy development occurring around the world. That is, governments are setting up commissions to recommend the legislative structure needed to support effectively and efficiently all areas of education for the world of work, and to ensure that the various areas of support are co-ordinated. Long-term planning is essential, and it is imperative that such planning is supported by the legislative framework needed to implement it. Governments have the primary role to play in this area of responsibility. This may include all areas of government — national, state, regional, local — depending upon the constitution of the nation. If there are different levels of government involved, it is imperative that these different levels work together to ensure that co-operation and mutual support characterise their individual efforts.

5

Conclusions

Much more could be said about these five different entities involved in this universally accepted responsibility of adult education for the world of work. Enough, however, has been said in this paper to impress upon us the wide spectrum of responsibilities involved, and the need to ensure that all those who are engaged in this area of human endeavour co-ordinate and cooperate in their individual efforts to work together as partners towards achieving the goal of providing for all people effective, efficient and continuing education for the world of work and for the workers themselves. Many questions remain unresolved on how to proceed, but a large consensus is building on the objective of lifelong learning for all.



CONFINTEA V

THEME G

***Adult Learning
in the Context of
Environment, Health
and Population***

Four Perspectives on Environmental Education for Adults

6

The following contributions present four different views on the present status and the proposed future development of environmental education for adults. Based on an analysis of the existing policies according to the work of each author and his/her organization, each paper concentrates on selected key issues and problems of current environmental education for adults. A particular focus is on the various actors at local, national and international level and their role in providing environmental education. In a perspective of developing future policy orientation, a number of successful approaches are identified and new strategies are suggested.

The texts concentrate on the following themes, among others: collaboration between environmental organizations and adult educators for adult environmental learning; the environment as an integrated theme for adult education; education practices for adult environmental learning; and specific African experiences with environmental education.

René Karottki

I. Environmental NGOs and Adult Education as 21st Century Partners in Civil Society — from the Local to the Global Level

1. The Global Scene

Over the past decade, we have experienced dramatic developments in globalization. Before, the dominant actors on the global scene were governments and multinational companies. But as iron curtains fell and global communication intensified, new actors came up, operating in their own third sector, neither public nor commercial. These new actors are rooted in grassroots movements and popular organizations, in the civil society, which used to be present only on the national level. They are now increasingly developing into a global civil society.

As a national civil society is involved in advocacy, innovation and organizing people to address their visions and problems, the global civil society will take a similar role on the international scene. Carried by the increasingly powerful international media, encouraged by a new openness of the UN system and respected or feared by the multinational companies as representing powerful consumer interests, the global civil society has the potential to rapidly develop into a strong third power in global governance.

This development poses several challenges to traditional perceptions among grassroots movements and organizations. One of those is whether the objectives and experiences of citizens and communities in different countries and nations are properly represented on the global scene by increasingly professional international NGOs, which often have a limited democratic basis. Another challenge is how to create a proper and balanced interaction between the global civil society and the private and public sectors respectively, avoiding NGOs being «co-opted» by powerful governments or companies.

Environmental organizations are major players in both the national and the global civil society, and have gained a lot of momentum after the UN Confe-

rence on Environment and Development in Rio, in 1992. They need, however, to develop their understanding of this new role, and in particular they need to reinforce the links from the local to the global and to develop the community base as a powerful international instrument. These needs are shared with other NGOs on the international scene, thus calling for cooperation with NGOs from other areas of activity. In particular, there is a potential for dynamic cooperation with organizations active in adult education.

2. Environmentalists as Adult Educators

The objective of most environmental organizations is to change attitudes and demonstrate alternatives to the present unsustainable development.

The rationale behind these efforts often is found in a combination of traditional indigenous knowledge on the balance between man and nature and modern scientific research on the human impact on the environment. The message is actively disseminated via education, training, campaigns and mass media to the general public and to decision makers with the intention of influencing their attitudes and action. And following this, community oriented environmental groups often organize specific initiatives that mobilize communities to take responsibility for their own situation and to demonstrate alternative solutions and models in practice. In this process, there is a clear emphasis on local decision making and democratic development.

3. Where Environment and Adult Education Meet

When environmental organizations disseminate information and organize community initiatives, they are practising non-formal adult education. Not on a theoretical basis, but as a practical tool. It is however often based on philosophies and traditions, that are characteristic to a particular culture.

In adult education development around the globe, there is an increasing tendency to see adult education as a way of enabling people to develop awareness of themselves as part of a culture, history and society, and encouraging them to play an active role in the community and in the society as such. Looking more into specific curricula and other activities, it is interesting to see that environment and social development play an increasingly important role in adult education.

6

4. The Common Challenges

The adult education activities of environmental organizations and the increasing role of the environment in adult education point to a potential for collaboration that should be explored in the CONFINTEA V process, and further developed and implemented as part of its follow-up, e.g. as joint programmes between adult education and environmental organizations. The future poses several challenges that can be shared among adult education and environmental organizations, from the community level to the global level.

Among those could be:

- a. Planning and implementation of community based activities, in the South and in the North, on adult education and the environment. The activities should focus on e.g.:
 - local mobilization and decision making
 - women's role as environmental educators
 - indigenous knowledge
 - change of attitudes on production and consumption
 - capacity-building among local authorities and CBOs forging alliances between CBO's, local authorities and local enterprises
- b. Joining hands to influence national governments and international programmes to:
 - integrate the environment into adult education
 - use adult education as a tool for promoting sustainable development
 - recognise the special role of indigenous people's knowledge on environmental issues
 - revitalize indigenous adult learning related to the environment
- c. Organization of regional workshops on adult education and the environment aiming at:
 - exchange of experience
 - development of regional cooperation
- d. Refinement and strengthening of the cooperation between adult education and environmental organizations in the context of the global civil society:
 - strengthening interaction between existing networks
 - taking joint initiatives towards or jointly with UN agencies and other multilaterals
 - developing joint understanding on the development of the global civil society, and taking relevant action
 - developing »code of conduct« and methodology on interaction with the public and private sectors

Walter Leal Filho

II. The Environment: A Unifying Theme for Adult Education¹

1. Introduction

The development of adult education in this century, and particularly over the past two decades, has been remarkable. From a rather obscure field of education, where the lack of emphasis had largely prevented developments, the education of adults has today become an area officially acknowledged as important in most countries and to which resources are increasingly being made available.

Despite the perceived value of adult education, there are still various problems associated with its implementation (Leal Filho 1994). One of these problems is the difficulty associated with the choice of elements, from a thematic perspective, which may further the dissemination of innovative, interesting and learner-centred approaches targeted towards the education of adults. Adult education is a vast area, in which items such as literacy, ethics and technology, to name but a few, are important factors in enabling adults to have the skills needed to enable them to seek employment or, as the case may be, to improve their skills and/or employment prospects.

Taking into account the fact that the wide range of themes associated with adult education prevents the reaching of a consensus as to which methods, themes or aspects may be used in providing a sense of consistency, this short paper suggests that the theme »environment« be used as a unifying — but not as an exclusive — theme, whose approach in the context of adult education programmes may help the development of this field in Europe and elsewhere.

2. The Problems

Perhaps the best way of dealing with the need to integrate environmental matters into adult education is to look at the barriers that need to be overcome in enabling it to happen. The development of educational approaches with an

6

environmental component targeted to adults or, in other words, environmental adult education, is a new area, which has to face some problems in both definition and contextualization.

Some of the most common problems likely to be experienced in initiatives aimed at integrating an environmental dimension into the education of adults are²:

- a. lack of tradition: despite the increasing popularity of environmental themes, these are yet to be part of the adult education agenda. The fact that most meetings focusing on adult education fail to address environmental matters, reflects that reality;
- b. lack of acknowledgement regarding its need: although adult education is a well-established field, the same is not one hundred per cent true of environmental education. As a result of the rather reduced degree of information available on environmental adult education approaches in some countries (and here a particular emphasis should be given to developing nations), especially in relation to its benefits, this area is not as yet fully developed;
- c. the choice of a focus: there is a problem related to the theme environment: its diversity. When one speaks about the environment, one may mean »pollution«, »deforestation« or »poverty« among other themes. The result of this characteristic is that many adult education programmes find it difficult to fit things in.

3. The Way Ahead

Progress needs to be made in relation to a wider awareness of the various advantages connected with the introduction of environmental components within the framework of adult education initiatives. For example:

- a. it provides a basis to the understanding of the interconnection between educational and environmental matters and how these affect an individual's life;
- b. it clarifies the impact individuals, as adults, have on the environment and the repercussions their behaviours have on the state of the environment;
- c. it builds an enhanced sense of environmental awareness, whereby people are made conscious of the complexity of economic, social and political

developments in their own lives and in the environment/surroundings where they live;

- d. the environment, as a theme, may provide an umbrella under which matters associated with it such as health and population may be integrated. There is strong evidence that health education and population education may be better delivered through a holistic approach, as opposed to the isolated way in which they are handled in many countries;
- e. it may enable local environmental themes to be approached and local demands for information to be met.

This list of items, which is not intended to be comprehensive, provides an overview of the likely benefits to be acquired through the integration of environmental matters into adult education programmes. It is hoped that these items will be taken into account in drafting future policies and programmes on adult learning, providing an opportunity to move forward in a field where much is said and little has been actually done.

Notes

1. Some ideas discussed in this paper were debated at the UNESCO Pan-European Conference on Adult Education, Barcelona, 12 to 14 December 1996.
2. These problems have been identified from an analysis of the literature on environmental education and European documents on this field (such as the Council of Europe's Declaration on Environmental Education, Council of Europe 1988; and the Commission of the European Communities' Action Plan on Sustainable Development, CEC 1992), from publications related to the education of adults and from the evidence gathered during visits the author has undertaken to environmental education projects and community-based initiatives in various countries in Africa, Asia, Europe, Latin America and the Caribbean.

References

- Commission of the European Communities/CEC, European Community Programme of Policy and Action in Relation to the Environment and Sustainable Development — Towards Sustainability. CEC, Brussels, 1992.
- Council of Europe, Resolution on Environmental Education. Council of Ministers of the Council of Europe. Council of Europe, Strasbourg, 1988.
- Leal Filho, W.D.S., Promoting Environmental Education in Europe. ERTCEE, Bradford, 1994.
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Technological Organization/UNESCO, Intergovernmental Conference on Environmental Education, Moscow, USSR, UNESCO, Paris, 1987.
- United Nations Conference on Environment and Development/UNCED, The United Nations Conference on Environment and Development: A Guide to Agenda 21. UN Publications Service, Geneva, 1992.

Darlene E. Clover

III. From Words to Action: Environmental Adult Education

1. Present State of Environmental Adult Education

Over the past decade, the field of environmental adult education has grown and is taking on new intellectual, emotional and spiritual energy to keep pace with the devastating urgency of environmental problems. The escalation of various environmental problems, their tangible links to other social issues and changes in how humans view the world today have meant the re-conceptualization of environmental adult education which gives greater prominence to the root social, political and economic causes of the environmental situation. However, the majority of all adults are not aware of the basic environmental impact of their own activities. Yet, it is they who are the voters, decision-makers, government and community leaders, and consumers. The planet simply cannot wait for the next generation of young people to apply their environmental knowledge.

2. Characteristics of Non-Formal Environmental Education for Adults

There are obvious challenges that must be recognized and adapted to in working with adults in non-formal situations such as communities. Adults often have less time in which to engage in workshops and seminars due to work and family responsibilities. Also, research shows that they learn more when their experiences are acknowledged and used in the learning process. Therefore, since they carry a variety of real-life experiences, their learning must be pragmatic, experience-based, and quickly accomplished. In addition, adults often have a variety of learning styles that they bring to a workshop or group and their concerns and viewpoints often are completely divergent.

Although environmental adult education is not yet as comprehensively developed as it should be, there is already an important body of experience which can help inform the future development of policy and practice. Around the world, non-formal environmental education practices are being developed that are flexible in order to meet the needs of differing groups, members within these, and their specific situations. Environmental educators have developed

educational practices that have the ability to help people connect with the rest of nature through sensory perception and emotion, which arises from the perception that understanding can flow from feelings and intuitions as much as from scientific knowledge.

Environmental adult education considers the environment in its totality, natural and built, technological and social, and it assists people to make global and local links. It attempts to help people to become more politically literate about the ideologies and systems at work that are contrary to the promotion of a healthy social and natural environment.

6

3. New Models and Practices of Environmental Adult Education

New models of environmental adult education go beyond creating understanding and awareness. Their aim is to build skills, a sense of commitment and responsibility, and ultimately to stimulate individual and collective action. Such programmes link environmental concerns to other social issues and try to bring about social transformation. Environmental education also recognizes that earlier divisions between »North« and »South« or between »developed« and »developing« mask how people of colour, indigenous peoples, the differently abled, and persons of other non-dominant social identities are disproportionately affected by toxic waste, polluted waters and other biospheric contaminants. Furthermore, environmental learning encourages participation and builds a vision in which the contributions of women, men, persons of colour, indigenous persons, the young, the old and differently abled are equally respected. Environmental education explicitly draws from the knowledge of indigenous peoples, those who are most often closest to the land.

There are numerous non-formal environmental adult education practices taking place around the world today: In Hong Kong, community workshops provide an opportunity for concerned adults and community-based environmental educators to discuss local and global environmental issues and to share their educational and community development experiences. The purpose of environmental popular and adult education is to strengthen the educational work of community activists and introduce environmental issues into adult education discourse. In Australia, the study circle method has been expanded to include environmental issues.

4. The Role of Women as Environmental Educators

Women are the first environmental educators, connecting with their children and passing along an understanding of the natural processes which take place around them. They have become increasingly more adept educators, communicators and information specialists vis-à-vis the environment. Women's education methodologies aim at empowering those with little or no power to see that they do have the power to work towards social and ecological changes. Women living in the interior of larger Pacific islands such as Fiji depend on biological resources for health care, medicines, food, fuel and craft materials for their families' and communities' subsistence, and cultural and economic needs. Community education workshops take women into the rainforests to explore their relationships with the ecosystem through experiential exercises.

The Atlantic Women's Fishnet is a network of women in Atlantic Canada which uses popular theatre with men and women in communities as a way to educate about the collapse of the cod fishing industry as a result of corporate drag-netting and government apathy rather than community misuse.

Such environmental adult education methodologies within communities show how the knowledge of others can become a basis to create new knowledge and a new vision of the world. They are processes of learning that begin with the experiences of the learner, involve a high degree of participation and are action-oriented.

5. Suggestions for the Future Development of Environmental Adult Education

In order to further develop environmental adult education, future actions should take place in the areas of:

- training of trainers
- environmental literacy projects
- publication and distribution of educational materials, newsletters, and theoretical papers
- exchange visits of educators internationally
- strengthening of links to universities
- development of electronic networking capacity
- organization of non-formal study circles, summer institutes and workshops
- research projects to further study human/earth relationships in order to strengthen educational practice
- support to women's environmental initiatives and knowledge
- stronger links amongst adult educators and environmental groups

Adoum N'Gaba-Waye

IV. Environmental Adult Education: A Factor in Sustainable Development on the Eve of the 3rd Millennium

6

1. General Introduction

At the end of a century so badly affected by ecological crises, most of which have been knowingly brought about by humanity, and a few unwittingly, environmental education seems in fact to be the key to warning the 21st century against some harmful behaviours that have in the past led to serious damage to the environment. We have only to look at the fall-out from the Chernobyl disaster, the death of the Aral Sea, and the rapid spread of deserts with their trains of human, animal and vegetable victims, to mention only a few well-known examples. While being educators, adults themselves need to increase their skills and abilities in environmental affairs in order to make a greater contribution through lifelong education to the establishment of a genuine dialogue between themselves and the Earth. Environmental adult education must help to bring peoples closer together across socio-occupational, religious and ethnic divides so that the 21st century becomes an era of tolerance and peace that is more conducive to social justice and respect for human dignity, which has been so badly trampled in previous centuries. It must permit and encourage a new awareness of the need to share equitably the natural resources that are available to all, taking into account the egalitarian relationship between men and women.

2. Environmental Adult Education and Sustainable Development in Africa

2.1 Experience of International Cooperation

Since the Rio Conference of 1992, environmental education has seen its role in international cooperation in Africa grow, and environmental education activities have expanded on that continent. Unfortunately, the conceptual bases of this international cooperation are distorted, leading to a confusion between «technical cooperation» and the «process of implanting new scales of values» in Africa. The role and nature of cooperation no longer depend on the precise needs of the populations that are supposed to benefit, but are dictated from outside by people whose knowledge of African reality is frequently limited to consultants' reports written by «experts». If the aim of international cooperation is really to contribute to sustainable development that will profit African populations, those who design the programmes of this international cooperation must abandon their Eurocentric viewpoint.

2.2 The Principles of an Environmental Education that is Appropriate to Sustainable Development

The link between environmental adult education and sustainable development has been particularly accentuated in recent years thanks to the technological explosion that has demanded occupational retraining of adults in many fields, including the planning and use of new, renewable forms of energy such as solar cookers, biogas, photovoltaic cells, etc. Since adults are the main users of the environment through their occupational and leisure activities, they must have access to information that is relevant to the natural resources available. One of the most important aspects of environmental education concerns the energy crisis that is currently brewing in all continents, but particularly in Africa with the drought.

The energy crisis that is blocking African development has no justification if we look at the statistics of world reserves of hydraulic, solar and wind energy, to mention only those that are regenerative. Out of the 50,000 billion kWh/yr of world reserves of hydraulic energy, Africa has at its disposal alone 50%, while Europe only has 3% and the USA 4%. The Zaire, the second largest river in the world by volume of flow (60,000 m³/s) contains over 600 billion kWh of annual reserves, two thirds of current world production. Solar energy can be

used in Africa directly or indirectly according to need. Everywhere in Africa it is possible to create solar power stations that will operate 12 hours a day without interruption, as the sun sheds, on average, one billion kWh of energy on Africa per day. Such installations would enable all African towns and villages to be supplied with electricity, and to draw water from underground tables in order to reafforest arid lands with a view to making them once more fertile for agriculture and grazing, which are the main economic activities in Africa. Thanks to the trade winds that blow along the west coast of Africa, the continent could be supplied with wind energy, which lends itself perfectly to the irrigation of desert and semi-desert areas and the watering of stock.

Despite the vast scale of its resources in new and renewable energy, Africa is still dependent on energy from oil, which it cannot afford. It is important to stress the training of African technical and scientific officers capable of taming the above-mentioned energy sources, without which African development will continue to depend on outside aid.

6

3. Environmental Adult Education on the Eve of the 3rd Millennium

The statistics published in »Die Zeit« (No. 36, 2 Sep. 1994) set world energy consumption at 7804 million barrels in 1993. The same source suggests that 40% of this energy comes from oil, 27% from coal, 23% from natural gas and 7% from nuclear energy. But who consumed how much of this energy? — Europe alone 36%, the USA and Canada 28%, Asia and Australia 25%, Latin America 5% and Africa 3%. A large part of the energy went into the development of strategic arms, seriously threatening the future of the human race. It should not be forgotten that one third of the planet is taken up by arid and desert zones inhabited by one billion people, one fifth of the world population. Almost 70% of these areas are almost uninhabitable because they are devoid of cover.

Some of the causes of this ecological crisis are linked directly with the over-exploitation of the resources of the Earth and toxic industrial waste. Environmental education is hence an absolute imperative that will enable the various communities in our world, which are rapidly changing, to manage their own educational, cultural, scientific and technological resources and to direct them towards a form of development of which they will themselves decide the content and priorities in accordance with their experience and particular ways of life.

4. Environmental Development and Adult Education: Observations, State of the Art and Prospects

4.1 Issues

An environmental approach to adult education does not mean simply transferring technology from industrialized countries to developing countries, or swapping programmes between nations. Above all it is a question of changing mentalities, hence of cultural, social and economic revision. Environmental education for Africa must start with educating people in the North, whose behaviour is one of the factors in the ecological degradation on the continent. As long as Western industries continue to expand the export of African timber, desertification will grow. This is what is happening in Côte d'Ivoire, which today has only 3.5 million ha of forest out of the 15 million that it possessed in 1970. The issues of water, energy, climate and soil differ fundamentally from one locality to another and imply an element of responsibility, enabling each target group to act, and to consider what action to take. It is essential to build environmental education programmes that include provision for voluntary groups, which will leave populations the chance of expressing, agreeing and discussing new proposals, with horizontal approaches rather than vertical, which often contain prejudices. The introduction of improved cooking facilities instead of traditional hearths has, for example, caused additional problems in some African countries. It has taken time to grasp that it is not a question of African women's refusing to use improved facilities that are economical and quick, but of social and cultural attachment to the traditional hearth.

4.2 Methodological Approach

The popular principle of »thinking globally and acting locally« suggested by Agenda 21 is a proposition that we believe to be more appropriate because educational, political and cultural approaches differ from one environment to another. Environmental education must have a local, community and even family dimension, and it is the total of actions taken locally that must lead to the creation of a new educational method, a new mindset that fits in with an international environmental network. Far from being an abstract concept, environmental education is education in a way of thinking that is characterized by deep reflection on the elements on which our existence depends. Some of these elements are vital and deserve to be examined. These are energy, soil types, pollution and cleansing.

Let us try to find out the current state of these resources by examining the behavioural failings found particularly in Africa so that we can suggest some approaches relevant to environmental education.

4.3 Environmental Problems Associated with Energy and Soil

a. Findings

In the Sahel, for example, environmental problems began with chance increases in climatic extremes (low rainfall, etc.) which led to ecological crises (drought, and so forth). These were compounded by the use of wood as people's only source of energy. Over the years this brought about severe deforestation, which in turn caused soil degradation and, in consequence, desertification and hence a real energy crisis in both urban and rural areas. What followed was a fall in the quantity and quality of surface and subterranean water, aggravated by human activities such as over-pasturing, and not forgetting the impoverishment of degraded soil by the use of techniques that destroy ecosystems such as uncontrolled bush fires. The result was famine, erosion and extinction of medicinal plants, leading to a rise in the mortality rate.

b. Faults

Among the faults found in methods of combating these problems should be mentioned:

- under-exploitation of new energy types such as solar panels, cookers and ovens;
- little use of oil by-products, in particular kerosene and liquefied petroleum gases;
- lack of coordination in environmental education and little popular information about improved cooking facilities.

c. Prospects

In order to mitigate the serious deforestation that is the cause of soil degradation, what is needed is:

- a huge awareness campaign on the management and exploitation of vegetable resources, particularly on reafforestation through a programme of village forestry that legislates for the planting of trees, including fruit trees, and the establishment of orchards with funding from the industrialized countries, which are major consumers of African timber;
- an educational reorganization of charcoal-burners and exploiters of timber as cooperatives so as to make the application of the forest code applicable throughout Africa.

In order to resolve the problem of under-exploitation of renewable energy, it is necessary to:

- encourage their use, and the use of other substitute forms of energy;
- introduce a global energy policy based on local and/or regional policies, and encourage training and research in the technology of capturing and using regenerative energy.

4.4 Pollution and Cleansing

a. Findings

In rural areas:

Lack of drinking water, absence of basic rules of hygiene, sharing of accommodation with animals, use of polluting pesticides in prospecting for minerals, etc.

In urban areas:

Lack of cleanliness in hospitals, schools and markets, urination and defecation in the streets, dumping of household waste in gutters, domestic animals wandering freely in towns, irregular refuse collection, etc.

b. Faults

- lack of civic education and basic notions of hygiene;
- appearance of shanty towns that are not controlled by the authorities;
- no real attempts to oblige people to make returns of ownership of property;
- no building of public latrines and no protection for green spaces;
- anarchic dumping of plastic rubbish bags in the streets.

c. Prospects

Environmental education must enable people living in villages and towns to create frameworks for the discussion of the causes and consequences of the degradation of their environment. This should be done through cells set up in rural communities, shanty towns, working-class districts, factories, social centres, hospitals, markets, fields, etc., where specialists would be asked to explain certain principles of the recycling of used water, food waste, etc.

5. General Conclusion

Environmental adult education is not a luxury but an urgent necessity, on which depend both the ecological equilibrium of the Earth and the survival of humanity. Adults bear both the heavy responsibility for decisions affecting the environment of the planet, and the duty to educate the younger generation. Improvement in nutrition, sanitation and economic and social conditions, to which all peoples of the world aspire, depends on adults' awareness of environmental degradation. It is this awareness that may stimulate people to join actively in bringing about a 21st century that is environmentally viable.

**Health Education and Health Promotion Unit (HEP)
Division of Health Promotion, Education and
Communication (HPR)
World Health Organization
Geneva, March 1997**

6

Health Education and Health Promotion

1. Programme Purpose

The Health Education and Health Promotion Programme acts within the framework of the **Alma-Ata Declaration on Primary Health Care** and the **Ottawa Charter for Health Promotion**. It provides international direction, coordination and technical cooperation, the strengthening and development of infrastructures, and innovative methods, strategies and approaches for health education and health promotion. This it does at international, national and local levels, together with the Regional Offices and WHO Collaborating Centres, and in cooperation with the UN, including UNESCO, UNICEF and UNEP; NGOs; and the private sector. Its mission is to enable all people:

- to adopt and maintain healthy lifestyles and healthy behaviour
- to promote the creation of sustainable environments conducive to health
- to increase control over and to improve their health

The Health Education and Health Promotion Programme focuses not only on promoting healthy lifestyles but also on support to programmes that prevent and control disease and disability.

2. Scope of the Problem

Major global trends including globalization of trade, ageing population, rapid increase of urban population, increase in poverty, violence, development of new information technologies, the spread of tobacco use and HIV/AIDS present major challenges for health promotion and health education.

Despite progress in controlling certain communicable diseases, new ones have emerged and some old ones continue to affect the health of people in the developing world, providing a double burden. It is also noted that non-communicable, lifestyle-related diseases are now causing more and more deaths in the developing world too. Lifestyle-related diseases and conditions are responsible for 70-80% of deaths in developed countries and about 40% in the developing world. They interrelate closely with inequality and gender discrimination, with major social and health consequences.

By the year 2000, more than a billion children will be in schools. Another 150 million aged 6-11 years, and 301 million aged 12-17 years, will be out of schools. Reaching and educating these children is a top priority for the future of our societies.

3. Programme Development and Achievement

The Ottawa Charter for Health Promotion (Ottawa 1986), which has been translated into over 40 languages, continues to provide direction and momentum to the new public health movement not only in industrialized but also in developing countries. It has provided leadership and direction to an increasing number of countries around the globe both in policy and approach in public health development, with more and more university departments and institutions providing degrees and diplomas in health promotion. Health promotion also continues to influence UN agencies such as UNICEF, which has incorporated it into its new UNICEF strategy document — Health Strategy for UNICEF (1995).

The WHO Health Education and Health Promotion Programme acts effectively within the framework of the Ottawa Charter for Health Promotion, through strategies that:

- build healthy public policy
- create supportive environments
- strengthen community action
- develop personal skills, and
- reorient health services

Health Promotion is »the process of enabling people to increase control over, and to improve their health« (Ottawa Charter) through advocacy and enabling, mediating and intersectorial action. Health Promotion is a dynamic and evolving concept which involves people through the context of their everyday lives, e.g. home, school, workplaces, cities, etc. and promotes the achievement of the highest level of physical, mental and social well-being for all people.

Subsequent to Ottawa a series of conferences have acted as catalysts for continued action for health promotion and have served to focus attention on specific action areas of the Ottawa Charter. The Adelaide Conference and Statement (1988) not only launched »National Health for All Australians« but also provided excellent case studies and insight for the further development of healthy public policies internationally. The Sundsvall Conference and Statement (1992) provided valuable input to UNCED (Rio de Janeiro, 1992), and has led to three joint WHO/UNEP intercountry meetings on supportive environments for health: Nairobi (1993); Bangkok (1993); and Bahrain (1995), to consider priorities for action in participating countries. Financial and technical support is being provided to a healthy community initiative in Kilifi, Kenya; to developing an information video in Bombay, India; and to a health promotion hospital initiative in Bangkok, Thailand. The Bahrain meeting combined the EMR Healthy Cities Programme, the Gulf Cooperation Council and the follow-up on the Sundsvall meeting on supportive environments.

Preparation for **the 4th International Conference on Health Promotion: New Players for a New Era** has stimulated international collaboration and is providing a focus for action in preparation for the 21st Century. It is providing direction and leadership at a time of great change, stressing both the need for an integrated approach and a widening of our perspectives to incorporate new partners towards achieving the goal of HFA. Close collaboration is maintained with the renewal of HFA.

In preparation for the 4th International Conference on Health Promotion, which will be held in Jakarta, 21-25 July 1997, the WHO is in the process of evaluating health promotion achievements and outlining future challenges in the form of health promotion scenarios.

Health Promotion is clearly entering a new phase in which public/private partnerships are increasingly needed to complement the healthy public policy initiatives and organizational development approaches. The conference will contribute to moving the health debate from what we do to eliminate disease to — where health is created — to the creation and production of health.

»Investment in health gain is at the core of health promotion and it has become increasingly clear that the major part of this investment must be undertaken outside of the health sector«. (Kickbusch, 1st Health Promotion International, 1996 vol 11, no 4).

The Jakarta Conference raises such questions as:

- How can we reinforce positive trends to better health in a world of rapid change?
- How can we harness information technology to convince the world that health is everyone's business?
- How can we build new alliances to reduce the health gap and promote health for all in the 21st Century?

The preparation and holding of the 4th International Conference on Health Promotion, Jakarta 1997, mobilizes us to take stock and evaluate, to focus and clarify our thinking and to explore mechanisms to establish new types of partnerships as well as new tools for health promotion.

Networks for Health Promotion

The **Healthy Cities network**, which was pioneered by the WHO European Office, is an excellent example of health promotion in action, and has become a worldwide project. This settings approach to health promotion and health education is now being applied to a number of other settings including healthy communities, healthy islands, health-promoting workplaces, healthy municipalities and health-promoting hospitals.

The WHO Global School Health initiative continues to develop and grow in strength.

An **Expert Committee on Comprehensive School Health** was convened in WHO Geneva in September 1995. Its task was to document expert recommendations on policy and steps that WHO could take to improve the health of young people, school staff, and families through schools and communities. The recommendations of this Expert Committee, which include the importance of investment in schooling, the full participation of girls, support to teachers and the importance of school and community working together, provides clear guidance for this global initiative.

Starting from Europe, the **networking of health-promoting schools** has extended into other regions. Today, networks have developed, or are developing, in the Western Pacific, Latin America and African Regions of WHO.

The WHO Health Education and Health Promotion Unit of the Division of Health Promotion, Education and Communication is also developing country networks — the Mega Country initiative is a network of the 10 most populated countries, representing approximately 60% of the world's population, around key health promotion areas. Similarly, networks around existing economic or sociocultural and/or historical groupings — referred to as the »hub networks«, are also being developed in order to enhance their capacity for health promotion and to address more effectively major areas of health concern.

Physical activity is also being given increasing attention within health promotion. People of all ages can improve the quality of their lives through a life-long practice of moderate physical activity.

The Division of Health Promotion Education and Information has recently held a meeting of world experts in this field and is currently developing a programme on physical activity together with its WHO collaborating centres. Physical activity, reinforced by the recent Surgeon General's report in the USA, is becoming an area of promotion that holds great health benefits, even from moderate activity, for all age groups.

Health Education and Promotion Five-Year Plan of Action

Health Education and Health Promotion in collaboration with other WHO headquarters programmes, with WHO Regional Offices, Collaborating Centres, other organizations of the United Nations System, intergovernmental organizations (IGOs) and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) is contributing to the above policy orientations through a five year plan of action (1996-2001), which sets the following interrelated goals:

- developing policies for health education and health promotion;
- advancing new methodology for health education and health promotion through information technology;
- promoting health through schools;
- building capacity in selected settings, organizations and networks for health education and health promotion;
- fostering surveillance of healthy behaviour and lifestyles and related evaluation research.

6

Each goal has specific objectives and identified products to be produced in support of reaching the objectives. Among the products are included a health promotion bibliography and glossary of terms, a tool box of health promotion evaluation, a website for health promotion, training manuals, documents and tools for school health advocacy, guidelines on developing health promotion in specific settings, and the developing of networks of a global support system for health promotion and health education through use of new information technology, regular meetings, advocacy, publications, workshops and meetings, all of which contribute towards the achievement of the goals. The 4th International Conference on Health promotion has created worldwide interest, and given rise to the holding of a series of intercountry meetings; development of documents on key areas of health promotion, establishment of an evaluation network, setting of »future« goals, objectives and strategies, and identification of key partners and »players« to support their achievement.

4. Conclusion

Health promotion is providing direction and leadership in a world which is rapidly changing. This it is doing in line with the Ninth General Programme of Work of WHO and the overall mandate of WHO to provide technical cooperation with countries and to direct and coordinate international health.

The essential role of health education was clearly identified in the Declaration of Alma-Ata, recognizing health education as the first of the eight essential elements. The spirit of Alma-Ata was carried forward in the Ottawa Charter, (see WHA42.44 — Health Promotion, Public Information and Education for Health), and in the Ninth General Programme of Work, Where **promoting and protecting health** is one of the four priority areas:

- integrating health and human development in public policies
- ensuring equitable access to health
- **promoting and protecting health**
- preventing and controlling specific health problems

Health promotion with its integrating approach, its outreach to new partners and to the private sector, addressing as it does major global trends, lifestyles, behaviours, and issues with a settings approach, has an essential role to play in achieving the goal of HFA.

O.J. Sikes

Population Education for Adults

6

1. Linkages between Education and Population

The relationship between education and population processes is one of interdependence. While rapid population growth makes it difficult for education systems to provide high quality education for all, education may contribute to reduced rates of population growth.¹ However, in order for education to be more effective, attention needs to be given to the appropriate choice of educational contents in terms of their contribution to the development of decision-making skills, including decisions regarding one's own fertility intentions.

Population issues are appropriate subject matter for adult education. Precisely which issues make the most appropriate content depends upon several factors: the interests and objectives of the adult learners, the objectives of the educational activity and the needs of the learners in terms of how the new knowledge will be applied in their daily lives. When these needs, interests and objectives are congruent with each other, the groundwork is laid for a successful education programme.

2. Venues for Adult Population Education

Given that the various needs and interests of adult learners should be taken into account, it is important to recognize that participants in adult education

programmes are not a homogeneous group. They have different characteristics and different needs, which stem from these characteristics. Some may be engaged in literacy classes, some may be attending night school to earn a diploma missed in their youth, others may be involved in workers' education sessions on topics of interest to the labour force. Agricultural extension may provide rural dwellers with education intended to improve their lives and productivity/profit, while classes for senior citizens may enable them to learn more about and discuss history or current events that affect them directly.

These are only a few examples of the wide variety of audiences for adult education. Clearly, they do not share the same academic interests and needs. Therefore, the selection of population content will be different for each group. Some learners may be interested in looking at global issues such as migration and population growth, while others may be interested in population issues that will affect them directly, either now or in the immediate future, such as reproductive health and family planning. Adult education curricula need to respond to these needs and interests.

The United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) has supported various types of education activities for adults in countries around the world, including population and family welfare education in the work setting through the International Labour Organization (ILO), population and family life education for rural adults and young people through the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), family planning literacy classes through UNESCO and various approaches to adolescent reproductive health education through non-governmental organizations such as the Boy Scouts and others.

3. Key Points for Population Education in the Life Cycle

There are many ways to look at the life cycle and to conceptualize an educational response in this context. Since this paper is focusing on population education, the chosen frame of reference will be the cycle of reproductive life. After all, this cycle represents some of the most important events and stages in one's life: puberty, marriage, pregnancy, birth and the education of one's children as they move from birth through adolescence.

A myriad of influences come together to influence reproductive behaviour, influences that go far beyond the doctor's office or health clinic. But for the purposes of this paper, we will examine how the health and education systems in

any given country/community can work together to meet family and individual needs for population education, with a focus on reproductive health.

a. Pre-Conception Phase

Young adults may be viewed in many ways; as future leaders, as future (or actual) members of the labour force, and so on. In the context of reproductive health, it is also appropriate to consider them as future parents. This has numerous implications for their formal and non-formal education requirements.

One would hope that they would have had an opportunity to attend school, and that the school curriculum would have helped prepare them for their reproductive life. All too often, this does not happen. As a result, young adults usually need additional education regarding reproduction and sexuality as they initiate reproductive behaviour. This may take various forms. Sometimes premarital counselling or education programmes are offered by churches, government departments or non-governmental organizations, to assist these young adult learners in preparing for the reproductive decisions that await them.²

These programmes are vitally important for young people, as they help ensure their reproductive rights to information and services, rights that they and others who might attempt to influence their reproductive decisions may not be aware exist.³ In some countries health workers have turned away young couples seeking advice and contraceptives, because the health workers forgot their professional training (if indeed they were trained in any way other than superficially) and they relied on the popular traditional view that couples should have the first child as soon as possible after marriage. This happens, even though it is well documented that pregnancies that occur before the young woman's body is fully mature may be harmful to the health of both the young mother and her child.⁴ Young people need to know this. Well-designed education programmes will facilitate this kind of learning as well as learning how to prevent birth defects, the importance of prenatal care and diet (which should involve education of the young husband and, often, his mother as well), post-partum care and feeding of the new baby, and so forth.

To cite one example, learning about prevention of birth defects should occur before conception. The early stage of pregnancy, especially the first six weeks, is the period when the embryo is the most vulnerable to drugs and other exter-

6

nal factors that can cause birth defects when expectant mothers consume or are exposed to them. Women may be encouraged to take precautions against these threats once they know they are pregnant, but by then, damage may already have occurred.

If couples are planning a pregnancy and are aware of the heightened risks during the early weeks, they can take the necessary precautions (avoiding, e.g. drugs of any kind, alcohol, smoking and X-rays) before the pregnancy is confirmed. This is the most effective thing a couple can do to avert preventable birth defects.

Certain nutritional deficiencies can also contribute to birth defects. If a woman consumes 0.4 milligrams of folic acid daily, beginning at least one month before conception and continuing at least through the early stages of pregnancy, the likelihood of a neural tube defect in her child is reduced by half. Folic acid may be taken as a dietary supplement, and is also found in a number of foods that are popular in many parts of the world, such as lentils, black-eyed peas, oranges and chick-peas. Here, again, **planning a pregnancy**, and the education that leads to this planning, are keys to taking action that may prevent birth defects.

b. Conception and Pregnancy

Once conception has occurred, the couple will need information on prenatal care, including diet. In some cultures, tradition discriminates against women in terms of food allocation. Education has an important role to play here, because the diet of a mother-to-be is an important factor in the health status of her pregnancy. The entire adult family may need education about her nutritional needs, as older adults in the family often exercise control over these matters.

c. Birth

The next phase of the cycle, the birth itself, should be an occasion for joy. It usually is, if plans have been made, and if the newborn and its mother are healthy. It is also an appropriate occasion for another adult education intervention, one designed to help ensure that mother and baby remain healthy. These educational interventions are intended to protect the infant through education of parents in oral rehydration therapy, the need for infant immunizations and other protective measures and they continue with each clinic visit as the child grows.

d. Childhood and Adolescence

Prenatal care and education, and postnatal/well-baby care and education are fairly well established in health systems. However, the next phase of the reproductive life-cycle has to do with the needs of the child for early sexuality education and the corresponding role of the parent to provide this education. There are far too few **parent education** programmes to help prepare parents for this task.

In 1996, UNFPA conducted a global essay contest among young people to give them an opportunity to express their views on adolescent reproductive health. One of the most frequently cited views of young participants was that they want to learn from their parents, but they realize that parents have never been taught how to teach their children about sexuality issues. This is extremely important, not because children need to learn about anatomy, but because reproductive behaviour is closely related to values, and values, in the first instance, come from the home.

Parents are the child's first educators. It is important for parents to learn how to communicate with their children, whether they be pre-schoolers, children moving into puberty or adolescents who are trying to learn who they are and how to establish meaningful relationships with others. Notwithstanding the importance of their role as educators, parents are not born with these skills. Therefore, parent education has an important role to play in helping this large audience perform this function effectively.

Conclusion

There are a number of venues for education of adults regarding population issues: in the workplace, through cooperatives, youth clubs, health clinics and so forth. One key to the success of population education activities for adults is matching the population content to the interests and needs of the learners. Many of the adult learners are young adults entering reproductive life. Therefore, the cycle of events in their reproductive lives provides a framework for organizing education interventions. Coordinating such interventions so as to best meet the needs of adults in a timely manner is a major challenge requiring inputs from ministries of education, health, labour and agriculture as well as non-governmental organizations, as each of these contributes at different phases in the cycle.

6

Notes

1. Programme of Action adopted at the International Conference on Population and Development, Cairo, 5-13 September, 1994.
2. Angarita, Ana and Sikes, O.J. Review and Analysis of Premarital/Newlywed Education Activities in Mexico, Indonesia and the Philippines, United Nations Population Fund, New York, November 1990.
3. UNFPA, State of World Population 1997, Reproductive Rights and Reproductive Health, UN Population Fund, New York, 1997.
4. Adamson, Peter, Facts for Life, UNICEF, WHO, UNESCO and UNFPA, New York, 1993, pages 2 and 10.



CONFINTEA V

THEME 7:

**Adult Learning,
Media, Culture
and New
Information
Technology**

CLJ

Chris Cavanagh

Adult Learning, Media, Culture and New Information and Communication Technologies

Adult Learning, Media, Culture and New Information and Communication Technologies is a carrefour where a diversity of issues meet in multiple and over-lapping ways: changing learning environments, learning and teaching practice and the relationship of media and new information and communication technologies, and distance education and new information and communication technologies.

One explicit challenge that emerges from the discussions held during our preparatory virtual seminar is to understand the relationship of the medium to the message — a concern long recognized in this era of mass communication. A second challenge that runs through all parts of this dialogue is how to transform the many changes in adult learning (new technologies and new relationships) into opportunities for improving participation and practice.

The dynamic and interdependent nature of this carrefour results in overlap and layering. Many of the questions that have been posed in individual sections below are equally relevant under multiple sections. Each section acts as a frame that can be applied to another section's questions. This overlap is seen

as a creative tool that supports a dialogue that will allow us to build from a diversity of responses to a consensus of response.

The five sections are: Content and Culture, Access, Impact, Distance Education and Social and Political Agenda. The inclusion of »Distance Education« is a recognition that the experience of distance education has been, since its earliest days, a matter of integrating the use of information and communication technologies with the principles and practices of adult education. As such, distance education has an important leadership role to play amongst other fields of adult learning on the questions of media and new information and communication technologies.

1. Content and Culture

Learning: the Treasure Within, the Report to UNESCO of the International Commission on Learning for the Twenty-first Century, reiterates one of the pledges of the Jomtien Conference and states »The need throughout the world — for the question is not one that concerns the developing world only — is for everyone (adult learners) to be in command of the knowledge they require in order to understand the world in which they live. This pledge should be renewed and the efforts undertaken pursued.« (p. 116 English, p. 126 French).

In order to explore the full significance of this statement and to identify concrete means by which it can be fulfilled, the following hypotheses must be verified:

1. that indigenous or vernacular knowledge is recognized as having significance and value and can be used along with relevant exogenous knowledge (scientific, foreign, acquired beyond the local community) to produce useful materials for learning;
2. that the mass media and new information and communications technologies as tools for the dissemination, manipulation and, increasingly, interactive use of enormous amounts of information have been dominated, to this point, globally by a Northern and Western cultural bias;
3. that international and national strategies to increase the use of the technologies and media for adult learning must take into account the need for the diversity and integrity of language and culture and include a commitment to the support of indigenous/vernacular content;

4. that artistic and creative expressions of culture can not be evaluated solely in the »market place« and deserve support and encouragement by their own societies and through international cross-fertilization and recognition;
5. that the Internet is not a digital library and that much coordination, research and development in use, the economics of digitization and the impact on users, and improvement in interoperability and the exchange of files (voice, image and data) are needed as the network of information systems is put in place.

Questions

1. How can international organizations and national agencies (public, non-profit and for-profit) support the development and exchange of vibrant, learning resources to increase the diversity, richness and sustainable development of culturally sensitive materials and productions?
2. How must the culture of adult learning change to support local cultures (practices, languages, etc.) as new information and communication technologies increase the pressure to use a lingua franca (i.e. English)?
3. How can other viewpoints and societies gain some of the public and private space and capacity needed to promote their content and culture?
4. How can the facilities, expertise and resources of libraries, museums and cultural centres be maintained and integrated into the learning programmes of their communities; and at the same time, how can we cooperate in the digitization of materials held by these institutions so that they can be shared more widely by greater numbers of persons?
5. What cooperative programmes and strategies can we develop to assist writers, thinkers, artists and performers in learning to use the technologies for the creation/production of their work, the sustainability of their enterprise, and the dissemination of their work?
6. What agreements can be put in place to balance the rights of creators, producers, performers, and disseminators so that educators and learners have the benefit of accessing materials they require in an affordable, equitable and universal manner? As digitized information increases in quantity and use, what changes must occur to ensure rights of creators, performers, et al?

7

2. Access to Media and New Information and Communication Technologies for Adult Learning

In comparison with traditional media (television, radio and the press) new technologies have an enormous potential for communication, interaction and distribution of content. New technologies provide powerful tools to increase the opportunity of all citizens to have access to education, information and knowledge and to create materials as part of the learning environment. On the other hand, new technologies also represent the danger of reinforcing social disparity that could increase social exclusion, isolation, time acceleration, disappearance of local spaces and the end of private life. The Internet and communication technologies are being used increasingly by conglomerates/monopolies for commercial purposes; therefore, the trend will be toward charging for the privilege of using/downloading/copying materials.

Access is at the heart of these stakes whether it concerns access to equipment (telephone, computers etc.), access to communication links or access to content. We will address these issues by posing the following questions.

Questions

1. Access to adult education programmes, using both low and high technologies, is predicated not only on the foundation of basic skills, but also on the availability of the time, money, energy and physical ability to take part. Certain segments of the population of every society do not have those resources because of poverty, gender, age, location, illness or disability, language or cultural background. Are there ways in which the increasing power, penetration and decreasing costs of the technologies can reach these people to overcome these problems? And, if so, how can communities, groups and individuals ensure that their needs are being met, using the capacities of the new technologies?
2. Access to computers remains beyond the means of certain rural and remote areas. How can we ensure that their opportunities for adult education and learning continue to be supported and enhanced by the best practices, services and advances made in those areas where the technologies have been found to be useful?

3. As new technologies increase access to continuing and distance education, multiply the areas for training (e.g. home, school, media, community organizations) and lift geographic and distance barriers, what will the new conditions for learning be? How will learners and educators ensure that cultural and linguistic diversity remain a priority on the information highway?
4. Because the profile of use of the new technologies continues to be dominated by men and persons with higher education and income, are there particular programmes that could be developed to support learning amongst under-represented groups (e.g. women, poor people in urban centres) regarding the use of the technologies? Could new technologies allow for the establishing of initiatives such as intergenerational connections, for example? What conditions can be created that allow the under-represented to enhance their learning through technology? How do we ensure that those who can not take advantage of the mass media and new technologies because of gender, age, location, illness or disability, language or cultural background are not further disadvantaged and marginalized?
5. In certain societies, libraries, museums, institutes, associations and community centres have been used as the informal circle encouraging adult education beyond the school and formal programmes. The public library has been referred to as the poor person's university because with tax dollars the public library has made accessible materials in many formats for the use of individuals and groups. It has provided resources, expertise and facilities for people of all ages. Museums and science centres have become increasingly interactive and cognizant of the holistic use of the senses in learning about material culture. At the same time, governments are reducing their support to these community organizations, demanding that they make requests for specific projects and programmes without guaranteeing a minimum base of support for continued expertise and operation. Is there a conflict between purpose and practice among certain governmental agencies? How will the lack of support affect the adult learners' possibility of access to information otherwise inaccessible to him or her? How will the absence of library resources in the new technological environment affect teaching practice and the adult learner?
6. Concentration and monopoly reduce the »public domain« while reinforcing ownership by privatization, thus breaking the fragile balance between

keepers of intellectual property rights and users. Access to content is equally threatened. The added value sites where information is processed, analysed, prepared for archives and organized are becoming more and more common and are charging prohibitive prices. How will new technologies provide an equal opportunity for all citizens to have access to education, information and knowledge? How can we ensure that the use of these new technologies reinforces solidarity between peoples and communities?

7. Before an individual is able to use the content for learning they must have both access and ability. Must citizens' groups lobby for public access in libraries, schools, community centres and shelters to ensure that access includes the availability of computers and computer technologies, payment of the communication costs, meaningful organization of relevant material and training in the use of the facilities? If charges on content become more prevalent, should certain types of information be available free of charge (e.g. health, safety, basic educational materials, information relating to one's community) in public places?

3. Impact of Media and New Information and Communication Technologies on Adult Learning

The issues addressed in the following questions relate to the impact of media and new information and communication technologies on adult learning, and more precisely to the impact of materials development on learning, the pressures of technological change on traditional educational systems, the degree of popularization of new information technologies and the direct impact on the adult learner and the adult educator.

Questions

1. The implementation of traditional and new technologies will ultimately lift geographic barriers for adults wanting to be educated. How must adult learning change to assist people in making sense of information offered to them by mass media so that it becomes useful to them? How will this flow of mostly unilingual information impact on the adult learner? What will be the impact and outcome if no appropriate and relevant content is produced to promote, develop and maintain local cultures and languages as part of the basic learning needs of the adult learner?

2. The paradigm of lifelong learning and the use of media and new technologies will affect the practice of adult education. What will be the consequences of the media and new technologies on educational systems? Will teacher training institutions move beyond their traditional responsibility of training formal teachers? Will the lifelong learning paradigm create an implosion of education systems and cause them to answer to new demands such as basic training, technical appropriation, etc?
3. Given that it may take at least a decade before a new technology is effectively used on any scale by educational organizations, to what degree can we expect computer-mediated communication to be adopted? How will ongoing technical training be made available to both learners and educators and at what costs? Will this rhythm of change imposed by new technologies reinforce social disparity, marginalize disadvantaged countries and remote parts of all countries and widen the gap between the literate and the illiterate, the haves and the have-nots? What kind of partnerships can be established between educational institutions to support and maintain the evolution of appropriation to these new technologies? What is the effect of the convergence of technologies on the creation of content and the roles and relations of creators, publishers, distributors, users?
4. The adult learner and the adult educator find each other at the crossroads of continuing education and lifelong learning. How do we shift the understanding of learning from being a ritual that one engages in only during the early part of one's life? What perceptual changes will this new environment effect among teachers? How can teachers be encouraged to see themselves as lifelong learners and agents for transformation in a multifaceted technological environment?
5. Knowledge and the capacity to use computers and new information technologies have become a growing necessity in the employment arena. What is the effect of these new requirements on teachers and institutions?
6. What role do new technologies play in providing solutions to educational and communication challenges (costs, different learning styles, diverse teaching roles and methods — to name but the simplest) which are essentially social and not technological in nature?
7. What is the role of critical media literacy in today's adult education programmes?

7

4. Distance Education

Over 10 million adults in the world take higher education courses at a distance each year; at least another 10 million or so are following in-service education and training, continuing education, or vocational training courses at a distance. Ten mass distance education institutions (in China, France, India, Indonesia, Korea, South Africa, Spain, Thailand, Turkey, and the UK) currently enrol over 2.5 million students between them; several of these institutions have a global reach. At the other end of the scale are numerous examples of small-scale distance education projects, often based on a »virtual classroom« model using new communications technologies.

a. Diversity

Distance education systems are very diverse; in fact, about the only obvious feature they have in common is that they do not rely on face-to-face classroom or lecture room contact as the **main** medium of instruction: the majority of teaching and learning activities are separated in space and in time (although nearly all distance education programmes have an element of face-to-face contact, which may vary from 1% to 30% of total study time). In many cases, the diversity can be traced to the dominant influence of a specific underlying communications technology:

- postal correspondence: postal correspondence tuition still forms the main basis for learner-tutor contact in the vast majority of distance education programmes;
- newspapers: newspaper and magazine campaigns have been widely used as a component of distance education programmes in many countries;
- the telephone: audio- and audiographic conferencing, and video-conferencing, via telephone and satellite communications channels, have been increasingly used for artisanal, small-scale, teacher-led distance education;
- radio: used from the 1930's for distance education;
- television: which continues to be a dominant medium in a few large-scale institutions such as the Chinese Central Television University;
- electronic mail, computer conferencing, and the WWW, the current »new« technologies using the Internet, which are now attracting so much attention.

Diverse systems based on specific combinations of these and other technologies will continue to exist side by side. Many of these same systems play an important role in supporting autonomous self-instruction (e.g. self-instructional language kits, self-help books, popular science programmes and publishing, etc.).

Questions

1. What are the relevant lessons from the experiences of distance education for all forms of adult education as new information and communication technologies play an increasingly large role in course development and delivery and in learner-directed activities?
2. How could electronic mail, computer conferencing, and the world-wide web technologies be best integrated with more traditional means to take advantage of potentially lower costs, the rapidity of response, and the new possibilities for learners to conduct their own research?

b. Underlying Model

Despite the diversity of distance education practices, any distance education course, system, or programme, regardless of its size and the media used, can be usefully analysed into two operational sub-systems, concerned with:

- **learning materials** (print, audiovisual, CD-ROMs, kits, etc.) and their design, development, procurement, production, and dissemination; in big distance education institutions major economies of scale can be obtained by upfront investment in high quality learning materials provided they are (re-)used over several years by large numbers of students on a given course. In approximately 90% of distance education programmes, print materials form the main underlying »delivery« mode;
- **learner support** (counselling, advice, registration, tuition, monitoring, assessment, accreditation); these depend on interaction between the learner and other people, or between the learner and administrative systems), via correspondence tuition, face-to-face tutorials, residential schools, telephone, fax, synchronous conferencing, electronic mail, asynchronous text conferencing, and online access to automated administrative systems (e.g.

7

for course choice, registration, fee payment, submission of assignments etc); most learner support costs are directly linked to student numbers, and can spiral upward very fast as channels of communication and levels of interaction between learners and tutors, teachers, and other support staff increase.

This distinction helps to underline the separation of »teacher« roles that has occurred in many distance education programmes, where the people involved in course materials design and development (course developers), are not necessarily the same people who fill the academic/educational learner support roles (the tutors).

Questions

3. How will the pace of change from the predominance of print materials be affected by costs and traditional relationships related to accreditation/authenticity, publishers, and other stakeholders?
4. How can new technologies be used to help bridge this separation of design/development and delivery/practice?

c. Technologies

Distance education systems and projects have to make use of whatever technological opportunities exist »out there« to deliver learning resources to their students, and to provide facilities for inter-personal interaction and support for learners. In this respect, distance education institutions/programmes have to **follow**, and cannot lead, the technologies. The important thing is to identify the technologies that potential learners have access to, and to use them creatively. For example:

- In rural areas of many poorer countries where reliable postal services are non-existent the distribution networks for soft drinks (Coca-Cola, Orangina, etc.) can be used for delivering print materials and other resources to isolated villages.
- In Cambodia at the moment, a very successful distance in-service programme for training primary school teachers uses the existing teacher payroll records system, the Ministry's printing works, UNICEF trucks, and under-utilized regional training colleges, as essential components of their system.

- Radio and TV are obvious examples: when national distance education projects can get access to broadcast networks and facilities, and assuming that potential learners have access to receivers, then broadcasting can be used effectively as a distance education component.

Distance education institutions — however big their budgets might be — are not (and should not be) in a position to invent, develop, or even provide technologies: they have to use the technologies and other resources (e.g. local libraries, local tutors, Internet information resources...) to which their potential or actual students have access, as, when, and if these technologies/resources become available, accessible, and affordable. Even in cases where big institutions have set up their own communication networks (e.g. the UKOU's national computer network, or other institutions' dedicated TV or radio networks), the trend now is to buy in these services from external providers.

The discussion on the role of technology in distance education can be aided by considering two broad classes of, and roles for, technology:

- technologies for »delivery« of study materials and for facilitating independent study (books, self-instructional texts, audio cassettes, video cassettes, broadcast radio and TV, CD-ROMS, stand-alone personal computers... not forgetting pencils and paper!);
- technologies for inter-personal communication and learner support (face-to-face meetings, post, telephone, audio and video-conferencing, and, via networked computers, E-mail, computer conferencing, and multimedia desktop conferencing).

The mere deployment of technologies, however, does not guarantee that any learning at a distance will occur: the quality and extent of learning depends (far more importantly than in conventional education systems) on the motivation, orientation, and study skills of the learners, and on the quality, competence, and professional skills of the course developers and the tutors.

Questions

5. What changes are necessary to assist distance learners to develop independent study skills and autonomy?
6. How can distance education take advantage of the effect of new technologies in increasing learners' capacity for autonomous self-instruction?

7. How should course developers and tutors change their practice to better mediate their teaching effectively, and to develop their skills as facilitators and intermediaries?
8. How does the innovation of distance education compare to that in other fields of adult education?
9. What specific lessons in creative and innovative use of technologies does distance education have to offer other fields of adult education?

5. Social and Political Agenda

The debate on adult learning and new information and communication technologies cannot escape the fundamental issue of the right to learn. Does the introduction of new technologies make a difference regarding the equality of opportunities? What can the different partners do to improve the situation?

a. Right (and Access) to Learning

1. If all individuals have a right to learning, what infrastructures and strategies must be in place to ensure that adults have opportunities to learn that are provided as an integral element of national/regional and local development and are also recognized as issues of international concern and cooperation?
2. If it is recognized that an individual's educational attainment is influenced by the parents' educational level, how can organizations and governments cooperate to ensure that the 900 million illiterate adults receive basic education, and how can we share the knowledge and understanding gained through both research and best practices related to basic education?
3. Literacy, information, skills, and knowledge must be used to be sustained. Are there structural barriers within the educational system, the working environment, the local economy, the private sector, that inhibit or preclude the application and use of newly acquired skills and knowledge? If there are, what are they and how can they be removed?
4. What specific strategies, policies and programmes can be put in place to support the extension of access to computers for those who live in rural and remote areas, keeping in mind their needs and cultures?

b. Governments

5. How can international governmental organizations and governments work together to provide the basic education needed by 900 million illiterate adults, so that they can benefit from further opportunities for adult learning?
6. If it is true that only 0.1% of all aid goes to basic education (quote from the »Economist«, attributed to ActionAid), then how do international governmental organizations and national governments respond to the call to action and the urgency of the global benefits in increasing and sustaining lifelong learning?
7. If it is true that previous basic education and literacy campaigns have failed because they did not recognize the integrated nature of learning and the importance of relevance and application to the lives of the learners, how can national governments ensure that those departments and personnel responsible for health, agricultural, developmental opportunities, social services, welfare, etc. work together with education systems and services, the local community and non-governmental organizations to pool and exploit limited resources?
8. If it is true that the convergence of image, voice and data as well as the convergence of different communications and information technologies is leading to the possibility of very different kinds of futures for all peoples, it is equally true that no one model of social organization can be expected to dominate the planning of those futures. The strategies for access and content must be inter-operable and based on open standards and best practices, but they must be developed nationally bringing all the stakeholders, including the adult learners, together to plan and build the systems and services. Is there a strong role for national governments as enablers and equalizers? And how do international organizations assist in providing information and exchange useful to these national initiatives?
9. What role can organizational learning play in enhancing the capacity of organizations (governmental, non-governmental and inter-governmental) to support new models of adult learning?

c. Youth Involvement

10. It has been stated, and research has illustrated, that young people exposed to the new technologies learn to use them with ease and a sense of confidence and innovation. Is there an opportunity to use some of the younger

generation to assist in the training, installation, and sustainable integration of communications and information technologies, working with local groups and communities, to support adult education programmes? Could international organizations, for example, set up some sort of subsidized international »voluntary« system and service, complementing existing national and international systems and exchanges?

d. Indigenous Knowledge

11. It has been stated and demonstrated that indigenous knowledge has been downplayed, degraded, or ignored in many parts of the developing world. Yet it is understanding and knowledge of the distinctive but complementary roles of indigenous and exogenous knowledge that will end some of the destructive elements of present society and build bridges towards a brighter future for humankind in the global society. Are there specific policies and strategies needed to ensure respect for indigenous knowledge, in a world increasingly interconnected and economically competitive?

e. Non-Governmental Organizations / Civil Society Organizations

12. On the issues of training and use of the new technologies, the cultural values of the society can only be respected if the local and national communities are taking the lead; however, it would appear that young people and examples of best practices could be shared and transplanted for local cultivation. Could the role of international organizations be to work in concert with national governmental and non-governmental organizations and their for-profit and not-for-profit sectors and communities, in interdisciplinary or multidisciplinary and mixed professional teams, in order to avoid the split between the »technological haves and have-nots«, the »arts and sciences« and »individual and public responsibility«?
13. How do we continue to value and respect the role of the teacher/trainer while encouraging more involvement in the development and delivery of programmes from those outside the traditional educational structures?
14. How can we stimulate a perceptual change among teachers so that they begin seeing themselves as lifelong learners and agents for transformation in multi-faceted environments?

15. How can civil society encourage international consultations of social and community organizations to take into account different concerns, to display innovative experiences, to intervene on questions of access, to participate in the development of added value content, and to contribute to the development of democratic and social use of technology?
16. Should NGOs draw up and link inventories (national, regional...) of technologies and resources which can be integrated into distance education programmes?

f. Ownership/Privatization and Public Domain

17. The challenges for libraries and documentation centres will be enormous. In this context, the growth of privatized training could cast a shadow on distance training for the general public. How do civil society organizations develop public paths onto the electronic highway to maintain libraries as central institutions of our democratic societies aiming to ensure free and comprehensive access to numeric information as well as printed information?
18. Illegal accessing (e.g. hacking, copyright infringement) will increase if only one language is used as the vehicle for transmitting information. Cultural and linguistic diversity should have a place on the electronic highway. How can multilingual translations and the production of software in languages with different alphabets and diacritics be integrated into the present networks?
19. While multinationals (and the representatives with whom they work in almost every country, rich or poor, in the world) are taking over the planet's telecommunications infrastructure in order to make maximum profits from the digital revolution, how can adult education organizations exploit new opportunities for education, networking, information dissemination, and fruitful collaboration? How can adult education organizations work with multinationals to maximize benefits for adult learning?

g. Development of New Materials

20. The key factor in the success or failure of most distance education programmes is the extent to which the participants are, or can be helped to

become, independent learners, taking responsibility for their own learning (in the absence of direction, encouragement, and coercion from a classroom teacher, or of peer pressure from fellow-students). Less than 1% of the 30 million adults currently studying at a distance use or have access to »new technologies«: they are studying on their own, from print materials and/or TV and radio broadcasts of variable quality, posting their homework to a correspondence tutor and not getting any feedback on it for a month or more; and, if they are lucky, they may be able to go to periodic face-to-face sessions once a month, or to a residential »course« for a week once a year. They certainly will not have PCs with Internet access! How can small and realistic injections of new technology help in improving the quality of the learning materials (print, audiovisual, multimedia) prepared by course developers, in such a way as to enhance the learners' autonomy and motivation and help them develop more effective independent study skills? How can new technologies help to »push« the skills of course developers in conventional and distance education programmes to produce better quality learning resources for independent study?

h. Mass Media

21. Most media are driven by increased ratings and increased circulation. How can adult educators convince media professionals that they can directly benefit the field of adult learning?

The challenge of CONFINTEA will be to explore and propose ways to pursue the debate on the use of new information and communication technologies for adult learning and to promote international cooperation in this domain.



CONFINTEA V

THEME 8:

***Adult Learning
and Groups
with Special Needs***

00151

Paul Bélanger

in cooperation with Rosa M. Falgás

Adult Education and Aging. Trends and Critical Issues

8

In all regions the proportion of older people in relation to the general population is tending to increase; the lower rate of increase in the South is compensated for by stronger overall demographic growth in those regions. From 1985 to 2010 the worldwide numbers of persons aged 65 or more will go from 155 to 325 million in the developing countries, and from 131 to 188 million in the developed countries. There are close to 50 million people aged 80 or more in the world at present, and there will be more than 85 million in 2010. Biological aging is receding.

A New Vision of Aging

Until recently, the »third age« referred to a residual notion: the period that comes after active life, when one no longer worked, when one retired. This negative meaning was reinforced by main trends in medical science, which used to propose a mainly pathological definition of aging, which was principally thought of as a decline in physiological capacity.

Over the last two decades, an important transformation of the notion of aging has occurred within the social sciences and gerontology. A more differentiated and less pathological view has now been reached which looks for conditions

of »successful aging, for possibilities of personal development and for the potential socioeconomic and cultural contributions of older population groups.«

Of course the active learning life of older adults is highly conditioned by the quality of educational opportunities they have enjoyed during their childhood and adult life. Lifelong learning is a cumulative process, positive for some, negative still for many. But these social conditions can be changed. Preventive action can be taken. Such inequality does not lie in people themselves. Studies on learning capacities according to age show indeed no significant decline before 75 years of age. The elderly learn as well as the young, but according to different strategies, relying on their previously acquired knowledge and their ability to structure and analyze information on the basis of past experience. Success with older adults can be observed in all fields of education: vocational training, physical education, artistic training, language learning, etc.

The Issues

Despite these new currents, older people continue to be denied learning opportunities, or they reject them themselves on the basis of the belief that it becomes more difficult to learn with age. Even if older people are living longer and show real capacity for self-development, they find themselves being pushed aside more rapidly and permanently. Many older workers are made redundant because they are excluded from vocational retraining programmes under the pretext that these are ineffective at that age. The search for higher qualifications, in the context of high national unemployment, tends to happen through the substitution of younger employees, by denying generally less-qualified older workers the opportunity to retrain. There is a »formidable erosion of aging workers' right to work« (Guillemard 1988:25).

Many leave the workforce earlier, but others also leave later or need to work much later in life as a subsistence strategy in the fast growing informal economy. Women's participation in paid work has been increasing, but tends to entail fewer fringe benefits, including pension plans, thus creating new disparities in urban areas, after retirement age.

The dominant trend of the lowering of the age of leaving the labor market is in complete contradiction to the other trend of the lengthening of the population's healthy life expectancy. The population is living longer, but older people

find themselves pushed aside more quickly. While the elderly remain young, capable of learning and of facing new situations, they are taken out of working environments earlier and earlier. There is an increasing contradiction between the economic management of life-cycles and the sociological reality of the aging of populations. In fact the lowering of the age of leaving the labor force is occurring at the same time as the new gerontology is leading in the opposite direction.

The questions of the meaning of growing old, the subjective experience of aging, and what this now prolonged phase represents or might represent in a person's life, for a local community, for the following generations, or for society have been forgotten. The elderly even risk being alienated from their own aging and the capacity to live, consider, enjoy and tell it. The widening of the notion of productive activity does not stop at the social or the economic, it also looks to the field of cultural expression and creativity. In short, the relationship between aging and development is raised. A perspective on the future and a passion for goals are not only an affair of youth. Dependence versus development is a contradiction that is played out in aging as well.

The transformation of demographic relationships between age groups, the drop in the retirement age of the population in paid employment, the rise of »healthy« life expectancy, and the advocated recognition of the development potential of this social group do in fact create a new cultural space, offering adult education new frontiers. The arrival at retirement of an increased population of older people with new resources, objectives, and values is transforming the social demand for continuing education.

However, continuing education does not continue in the same way for everyone during the various ages of life, despite the advances in cognitive psychology and gerontology. The process of exclusion is accentuated with age: adult education, other than in certain countries such as Sweden, typically becomes a marginal reality after 65.

The lengthening of human life remains an ambiguous achievement in so far as it may mean being condemned to dependent aging, which the state must manage as a social problem, or it may create a phase of life which is also made up of learning, productivity and leisure and which has its own contribution to make. Educational interventions cannot fail to be measured against the alternative between a pathological and »Ersatz« culture of aging and another cultural orientation in which existential meanings of aging similar to those of work may be forged.

8

The 1997 Conference will be a unique opportunity to prepare the 1999 International Year of Older Persons, and to give them an opportunity to have a stronger voice in the global civil society. What is at stake is more than the right to learn of older adults, it is also their recognition as resource persons in the emerging learning societies.

References

- EAEA, 1995, *The Older Persons, A Resource for Adult Learning*, Monograph 3-6, Barcelona.
- Bélanger, P., *L'éducation des adultes et le vieillissement des populations: tendances et enjeux*. *International Review of Education* 38 (4), 1992, pp. 343-362.
- Guillemard, A.M., *La transformation de la sortie d'activité au niveau international. Vers un réexamen du rôle de la retraite?* Texte non publié, Paris, Sorbonne et CEMS, 1989.

Carolyn Medel-Añonuevo

Moving Across Borders, Cultures and Mindsets: Prospects for Migrant and Refugee Education in the 21st Century

8

The dominant media portrayals of emaciated African refugees escaping political persecution or frail Asian domestic helpers brought to court by their employers reinforce the stereotypes of refugees and migrants as poor and dependent on the mercy and patronage of the rich and the Northern developed states. The pronouncements of politicians that »the boat is full and cannot take more« not only supports the arguments of the New Right and its ugly face of racism, but also masks the reality of the immense yet unrecognized contribution of migrants to the economic and social life of their host countries.

Moreover, the sensationalist presentations of migrant and refugee conditions detract us from deeper reflection on the intersections of the colonial past and the dominant capitalist development framework that impinges on contemporary global labor demands and results in the unceasing impoverishment of large sectors of the world's population. In addition, by using migrants and refugees as scapegoats for unemployment and violence, many governments are able to divert attention from the real issues at hand.

Indeed the media's and many States' simplistic depiction of the complex realities of the migrant and refugee situation do not allow us an appreciation of the heterogeneity of more than 120 million women, men and children who cross borders for economic, political, social and cultural reasons. Neither do they facilitate an alternative framework that veers away from the »deficit approach« whereby migrants and refugees are seen to be lacking in resources, skills and culture. The consequent assimilationist and integrationist implications of such a perspective therefore continue to affect economic and social policies, educational provision and the mindsets of families and individuals, whether they be from the migrant and refugee community or the host population.

To top it all, the use of terminology such as »illegal migrant« more often than not paves the way for the legitimization of the violation of human rights of people referred to by this term. As governments insist on protecting national interests, ensuring the human rights of migrants becomes a precarious concern.

Migrant and Refugee Education: For Integration or Marginalization?

Like many among the host population, migrants attach much importance to education. It is a widespread belief that this is the way to find employment, to learn more about the society and its values, and of course, to improve one's life. Most of the time, the same could be said of refugees, who consider education a means of rooting them to some reality other than the fugitive existence that they are exposed to.

Learning the language of the receiving society is the most common educational response, as acquisition of language is seen as central to the integration of migrants. Usually funded by governments (in Western Europe, North America and Australia), these language classes are offered by a range of organizations, from NGOs to women's groups and church groups. Aside from the diminishing amount of resources that are being allotted for this, a critical issue that is constantly raised is the content and pedagogy of the classes.

Critics of traditional language classes point to the hidden curriculum, whether it be in the content (e.g. that the receiving country's culture is always presented as the best) or in the process (that migrant learners are perceived to be passive

acceptors of knowledge and values, and have none to contribute themselves). In response to this, Turkish and Asian women's groups in Germany, for example, offer their own German language classes but with a Third World women's perspective that helps facilitate an understanding of the intersections of class, gender and race oppression as it exists in Germany, for example. By doing so, Turkish and Asian women not only learn the German language (which is important to make sense of the external world) but most important, are able to critically »read and interact« with that society, hence promoting the notion of the »woman as a subject« instead of »woman as an object« or a »victim«.

Another type of educational provision for migrants is vocational courses which are aimed at equipping them with additional skills that will allow them entry to the labor market. However, because of incompatible educational levels, language skills, examination and aptitude tests, many migrants fail to benefit from these so-called »second chance« training programmes (Alaluf, 1982). Furthermore, it has also been argued that the kind of training that is provided to the migrants prepares them for occupations which the host population would not want to occupy themselves, and consequently serves to further marginalize the migrants. The access of migrants to certain vocational training programmes relegates them to the secondary labor markets and keeps them outside the main streams of production.

A growing area of organized educational activities is that related to political participation, citizenship and human rights awareness. In the Netherlands, for example, government funds are allotted to citizenship education so that newly arrived migrants learn the laws of the land as well as the nuances in the political life of Dutch society in their native language. Also, the Australian Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs funds Migrant Resource Centers, which facilitate increased participation of recently arrived migrants and refugees in community affairs. While it has been pointed out that such initiatives pave the way for a better understanding of the laws of the host country and therefore allow the migrant to be an aware and active citizen, it can not be denied that the discussion of the human rights of the migrant is not as strong as the emphasis on how to fit him or her into the political set-up and conform not only to the laws but to the dominant values of the receiving country.

Migrant human rights groups, NGOs and women's groups have therefore organized consciousness-raising sessions that include critical reflections on the laws of the host country and on the human rights of migrants and refugees. Furthermore, such discussions are situated in the growing impoverishment, sexism, racism in the

8

world in general and in the country in question. In Asia, many NGOs, women's groups and church organizations are involved in providing such education to migrant workers.

There are other emerging educational possibilities — self-assertiveness sessions, conflict resolution workshops, even counselling — that are meant to address concerns such as violence against women, internalized class, gender and race oppression, and focus on the agency of the migrant/refugee.

One also can learn from the initiative in the Philippines, in which Unlad-Kabayang Migrant Services Foundation, aside from facilitating an educational framework that puts the premium on the need for migrant workers to involve themselves politically and economically in the Philippines, also sets up mechanisms whereby migrants are able to systematically mobilize their savings, which in turn are used to set up cooperatives and other micro-enterprises. Starting with the point of view that migration is a temporary phenomenon, this NGO has developed a »reintegration perspective« which taps the active participation of migrant workers and their families.

Finally, in many Northern countries, communities and schools are engaged in multicultural and intercultural education sessions which are premised on the need for the host population to also learn from the migrant community, in the same way that migrants are expected to learn from them. It was during the American civil rights movement in the sixties that the discussion of multicultural education started, and the concepts of power and control were central to the process. More than thirty years later, there is a shift in the discourse, which now focuses on cross-cultural awareness so that a growing segment of those involved in multicultural education is severed from any social movement (Sleeter, 1996). She also explains that part of the reason for such shift is the increased involvement of white educators in this endeavor.

Issues and Prospects for the 21st Century: Are Education Efforts Geared towards Empowering Migrants and Refugees Sustainable?

Since migration and displacement are among the major challenges of the 21st century, education for those affected by these processes needs to be a critical area of concern for inter-governmental agencies, governments, NGOs, the

broader civil society and even the private business sector. In rethinking the kind of educational initiatives that have to be implemented, three major principles are offered to possibly help shape migrant and refugee educational strategies in the future.

1. Migrant and refugee education is a human rights issue and therefore concerns questions of democracy.

»Migrants, displaced populations, asylum seekers and refugees should be accorded rights and opportunities to participate in adult education. The basis for this education should be a truly global, holistic process, which includes both migrants and the majority communities. The goal of this education is to encourage intercultural competence throughout the entire community and development of a multicultural society.

At all levels of adult education, the migrants themselves should have equal access to educational systems, and be encouraged to participate actively. Educational institutions should use multilingual/multicultural teams able to integrate migrants in the education process. Governments should ensure that adequate funding is made available for courses and programmes for migrant education.

Adult education should promote the empowerment of minority populations. Particular attention should be paid to enhancing their awareness of their legal and social rights. They should be encouraged to use their 'hidden' qualifications, such as their language and their cultural and spiritual resources. Educational qualifications gained in their country of origin should be recognized as widely as possible.

The rights of migrants to participate in adult education should be underpinned by legislation which secures equal rights for migrants in general. Legislation preventing racial discrimination is particularly important, as is legislation governing and allowing the free movement of persons across international frontiers. « (Draft Declaration, 1997)

A suggestion from Dillard (1996) is that any viable multicultural education approach for the 21st century has to address itself to a fundamental question: »In what ways can we engage in more critical multicultural pedagogy and practice, utilize democratic principles such as equality, freedom and informed

8

participation to do so, and simultaneously seek to assist students (and teachers) in developing the abilities to become critical shapers of schools and society in our democratic nation.« (p. 231)

She also explains that »multicultural education is fundamentally a movement to substantively transform the prevailing social, economic, and cultural contexts of schools to seek more democratic practice and recognition of multiple views of the world within its context.« (p. 230)

2. At the heart of migrant and refugee education is the issue of identity and it therefore concerns the process of facilitating the migrant/refugee as a subject.

Ford and Dillard (1996) argue that »For people of color, who have been marginalized and made invisible throughout their experiences with Eurocentric curriculum and the often distorted images in larger society, the reconstruction process may take intensified time and effort. However these explicit efforts to reconstruct a positive ethnic identity are vital to the multicultural process.« (p. 234)

They point out that »Becoming multicultural is often defined as a process whereby an individual develops competencies of perceiving, evaluating, believing and doing in multiple ways« (Ford and Dillard, p. 232). Furthermore, Ford and Dillard criticize some curricula and pedagogy in multicultural education as »objectifying the self by centering on the social self and ignoring the personal self« as they maintain that the formation of multiculturalism must begin with the personal self or self as subject. Ford (cited in Ford and Dillard 1996) has identified four interactive and recursive phases that characterize a truly grounded self, which are necessary to becoming multicultural: a) construction of self as object; b) deconstruction through critical reflection; 3) critical social consciousness; and d) critical social political action (p. 232).

3. The living and working conditions of migrants and refugees are a development issue that is interwoven with peace concerns.

»Migration should be presented, in the educational setting, not as an emergency calling for crisis management, but as a structural and permanent phenomenon of human life. It presents the opportunity to develop a mutual, intercultural vision in a lifelong learning process.

Adult education for migrants should involve participation by the majority population, encouraging them to adopt a global point of view. Particular attention should be paid to the political, economic and historical factors which have caused migration movements. These include war, civil conflict, human rights violations, colonial domination and ecological disasters. Due attention should be paid to the role and responsibility of many countries, currently receiving migrants for the growth of such factors, and their results.

Reflecting this background, adult education should be seen as an opportunity for developing skills in conflict resolution, processing peace and creating the conditions for understanding. « (Draft Declaration, 1997)

»Peace, justice and democracy as valid goals for the 21st century can only be achieved through adult education strategies and processes which actively challenge racism, sexism, inequality, discrimination and political repression at all levels « (Guiding Principles, 1997)

References

- Alaluf, Mateo, *Migrant Culture and Culture of Origin*, Council for Cultural Cooperation, Strasbourg, 1982.
- Dillard, Cynthia, *This Issue: Multicultural Education — Cases and Commentaries*, in: *Theory into Practice*, 35 (4), 1996, pp. 230-231.
- Draft Declaration by Working Group on Migrants, Displaced Populations and Refugees, Hamburg, 1997.
- Ford, Terry and Dillard, Cynthia, *Becoming Multicultural: A Recursive Process of Self and Social Construction*, in: *Theory into Practice*, 35 (4), 1996, pp. 232-238.
- Guiding Principles of the Draft Declaration of the ASPBAE/UIE International Workshop on Migrant Workers and Refugee Education, Hong Kong, 1997.
- Sleeter, Christine, *Multicultural Education as a Social Movement*, in: *Theory into Practice*, 35 (4), 1996, pp. 239-247.

Marc De Maeyer

Education in Prisons: Key Words for Freedom

When it exists, prison education is often a pretext, an opportunity, and a suggestion of a way to keep people who are incarcerated busy «as intelligently as possible». When there is any, prison education rarely has an educational purpose and still more rarely a social purpose. However, experience of education conducted in prison shows that such projects do carry an educational, a social, and therefore a political purpose which can bring about both peace for society and rehabilitation for prisoners.

Findings

If political prisoners are discounted — and they are not considered in this article — it is often found that the majority of prisoners are, if not partially illiterate or semi-literate, then at least of an educational level below the average of the population. In both North and South, prisoners have had no contact, or insufficient contact, with schools and other institutions that provide education and socialization. And it is known that limited access to schools (for personal or social reasons) often sets off a process which, while obviously not being automatic, accentuates isolation, exclusion and marginality, sometimes leading to minor delinquency and then more serious offences.

If it is admitted that schools are agents of social integration, alongside other institutions such as the family and the community, it follows that a weakness

there may be a factor in some people's dropping out. In the context of our concern — »what to do with prisoners so that things go well« — that is one more reason to place education once more at the heart of an approach that is not only educational but also social.

It is also one more reason to think about such education in specific terms for the population to which it is addressed: it retains the same functions of social integration while responding to educational priorities, namely listening to the »recipients«, recognizing learners as whole persons and not as offenders (without denying what they have done), responding to vocational and technical demands, unlocking the past, and helping them to understand the present and envisage a future, while being aware of the difficulties, which are amplified by the prison environment with its various contradictory functions.

8

1. Initiatives and Institutional Frameworks

Often, prison education initiatives have been those of individuals or groups of citizens. Here especially, there is wide variation between North and South and between country and country. Governments and prison authorities have sometimes taken the lead in trying to systematize or generalize educational provision, but it is not sure, as will be seen, whether the motives and methods used are similarly inspired.

1. Since 1957, the Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners, adopted by the Economic and Social Council (Resolution 663 C XXIV) and approved by the General Assembly of the United Nations (45.111 Basic Principles for the Treatment of Prisoners) have stated that: »Provision shall be made for the further education of all prisoners capable of profiting thereby, including religious instruction.«

It is also a requirement that attempts should be made to integrate prison education as far as possible with the education system in each country. Particular attention is to be given to the education of young offenders during their time in prison.

It was not until May 1990 that the Economic and Social Council again adopted resolutions specifically referring to prison education (Resolution 1990.20).

2. In its Resolution 45.122 of 14 December 1990, the General Assembly of the United Nations states that:

»Mindful also that education has a potential role to play in ameliorating the conditions that give rise to crime and to the consequences of criminality...

Determined that education should play an important role in crime prevention and criminal justice through such means as education for the general awareness of the public, education of the young for crime prevention, education aimed at the total personal development of prisoners and other offenders and continuing education of the criminal justice personnel. Aware that comprehensive approaches are required for a lasting and systematic impact on criminal justice education with a view to attaining higher standards of fairness, efficiency and professional conduct of criminal justice personnel...«

As is seen here, education is called for to prevent delinquency, both before and after the event, so that fewer people find themselves in prison and that those who come out do not re-offend. From this point of view, imprisonment appears to be a neutral time, a blank sheet that has no impact and no uses other than as a strategy to maintain the social peace. Inmates are subjected to supervision rather than prisoners helped to socialize.

3. The Resolution of the General Assembly of the United Nations was inspired by a Recommendation of the Economic and Social Council which, in its Resolution 1990.20 of 24 May 1990 proposed that

»Member States,

- should promote prison education, i.e. by
 - providing penal institutions with educators and accompanying services and raising the educational level of prison personnel,
 - ...
 - encouraging the provision and expansion of education programmes for offenders in and outside prisons,
 - developing education suitable to the needs and abilities of prisoners and in conformity with the demands of society,
 - ...«

And that »Member States

- in developing educational policies, should take into account the following principles:
 - d. Education in prisons should aim at developing the whole person, bearing in mind the prisoner's social, economic and cultural background;
 - e. All prisoners should have access to education, including literacy programmes, basic education, vocational training, religious and cultural activities, physical education and sports, social education, higher education and library facilities;
 - f. Vocational education should aim at the greater development of the individual and be sensitive to trends in the labour market;
 - g. Creative and cultural activities should be given a significant role since they have a special potential for enabling prisoners to develop and express themselves;
 - h. Wherever possible, prisoners should be allowed to participate in education outside the prison.

Urge the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization and its International Bureau of Education, in cooperation with the regional commissions... to become actively involved in this process. »

4. As regards UNESCO, the Declaration of the Conference on the Right to Learn, issued by the Fourth International Conference on Adult Education, also applies to prisoners:

»The right to learn is:

- the right to read and write;
- the right to question and analyze;

If we are to avoid war, we must learn to live in peace, and learn to understand one another.

8

The act of learning, lying as it does at the heart of all educational activity, changes human beings from objects at the mercy of events to subjects who create their own history....»

5. Regional intergovernmental organizations have also addressed the matter; we shall quote from the Recommendation of the Council of Ministers of the Council of Europe, of 13 October 1989:

»1. All prisoners shall have access to education, which is envisaged as consisting of classroom subjects, vocational education, creative and cultural activities, physical education and sports, social education and library facilities;

...

3. Education in prison shall aim to develop the whole person bearing in mind his or her social, economic and cultural context;

...

5. Education should have no less a status than work within the prison regime and prisoners should not lose out financially or otherwise by taking part in education;

...

12. Creative and cultural activities should be given a significant role because these activities have particular potential to enable prisoners to develop and express themselves;

...

16. Measures should be taken to enable prisoners to continue their education after release;

...»

6. There are many other legal instruments that justify, and indeed encourage, education programmes in prison. The Declaration of Human Rights, the African Charter on the Rights of Man and Peoples, the San José Pact (the American Convention on Human Rights), and the Declaration on Human Rights in Islam are such instruments, which stress that education must be accessible to all, for the full development of all, and that prisoners, although they are not specifically mentioned, should therefore also have access.

2. The Possibility of Providing Education in Prison

The thinking underlying discussion of imprisonment might be summed up as follows: »For the purposes of punishment and protection of others, there are currently no alternatives to locking people up, and when they are locked up, they have to do something, there has to be some improvement and recovery.« This is the context for the call for education, and it is not without its contradictions.

There would certainly be some agreement with imprisonment, or at least with the statement that at the present time society is not prepared to invent or implement other methods of punishing offenders and protecting itself. Prison education therefore takes place in an environment that is artificial, to say the least, involving people brought together by chance greater even than that which brings learners together in all contexts outside prison.

There is, in fact no room for people's own preferences or pet personal projects, and no chance of getting away from it all. In prison, the time to be spent on education is not determined by the prisoner, while adult learners can decide more freely how much time to devote to it, given the constraints of family, social and occupational life.

Courses are given with the intention of »re-education«, which applies both to the social and educational dimensions. So much is clear: education will redo what has previously failed, and the failures will be reintegrated into society such as it is — on penalty of being sent back, not to the starting square, but to prison, where another programme of »re-education and socialization« will have to be tried, giving another chance for society to integrate all its members and to keep a firm hold on the social peace.

We have no intention of suggesting that these goals are worthless, suspect or even dangerous. All we want to stress is that this context of education is the extreme opposite of what is beginning to be the common view within the educational community and public opinion, namely that education is a tool which, rather than being something common that is offered to everyone, has to be what each person wants to bring about his or her own social goals, using his or her own motivation.

Some prisons are well equipped with educational materials, and have numerous professionals working in them; elsewhere, families have to bring food to

8

prisoners, and sometimes prisoners even have to leave prison every day to beg for food, and to find their way back inside as fast as possible in order to escape the vengeance of their victims. Whatever the situation, it will influence the social and hence educational dynamics. But, we repeat, that is not the whole story.

Prison education is thus encouraged in an artificial space and time, and the »successes« do vary, it has to be admitted, from one continent to another, one country to another, and one wing to another. But material conditions do not explain all the differences in treatment, let alone results. It is the socio-political function given to prisons that will determine the criteria for »success«.

3. Methods of Prison Education

Prisons are, by definition, places where everything is provided: accommodation, food, leisure activities, social organization, supervision and, in some cases, education. This last is provided with what is sometimes an overt justification and motive: education is an attempt to make and remake, to change — to re-educate. Prisoners' own expression of their demands is given short shrift, even though it is sometimes disruptive and incompatible with social order.

There is some hope that in future, the use of the means of education and expression mentioned below will be able to transform standardized educational provision into personalized programmes that respond to people's own intentions. Those means are:

a. Literacy courses

Many offenders have difficulties in reading and writing. There are programmes to help them. When prisoners do not belong to the dominant community, there are attempts to encourage them where possible to learn in their mother tongues. This does create organizational problems, but the difficulty of »opening up« prisons to the outside world can bring huge advantages: involvement of the cultural communities from which inmates come sometimes leads them to take an interest in the fates of those who will shortly be released and to provide points of reference and a sense of belonging.

Learning in one's mother tongue is not incompatible with learning the language of the host country; it is merely the first step. In such cases, learning

to read and write means learning to understand one's life, to develop the ability to reason and to conceptualize a purpose; it means putting oneself in the position of listener, learner and interlocutor. It means trying to understand one's past.

b. Libraries

Access to libraries varies considerably in prisons throughout the world. Where they exist, libraries are often just a place »where there are some books«. However, there are a number of experiences in which inter-library loans enable libraries to expand the number of books and to create places that are »living, dynamic and exciting«. But it should be remembered that most prisons in the world have no library, just like many towns in those countries.

Some prison authorities mistrust books: they can entertain, but they may also give information about rights — and ideas.

Reading clubs and newspapers can also offer either nothing more than hand-outs, or a chance to learn dynamically.

c. Theatre, Role-Play and the Arts

Taking part, writing and playing a role (one's own, that of an adversary, a victim, a judge, anyone) is to prove that one can say something, that one is worthy of saying it, even of respect for saying it. Self-esteem, role-playing and creativity with others are elements of both theatre and the theatre of life.

d. Group Activities, Discussion Groups and Sports

Group activities, such as talking about the reasons for imprisonment, about health, the family, society and culture, and winning the next match, presuppose learning and internalizing social rules. What is »other« and different does exist, and has to go on existing with its different opinions or its different football shirt. That is adult education: learning to listen to and make out messages, and then making up one's mind. It should also become common practice in prisons, between prisoners, between inmates in other prisons, and between prisoners and the world outside.

8

4. Expectations of Prison Education

The documents written on the question provide statistics and experience: literacy rates have risen from such and such to such and such a proportion; a large number of inmates have taken part in activities; some have won competitions; some, having pursued a course of training, have succeeded in finding work on leaving prison in spite of their pasts; and others have become teachers in prison. All that remains to convince everyone that education in prison is a »good thing« is for a former prisoner to become a warder, or even a prison governor.

But we have to examine for whom it is a good thing.

1. Education in prison is in the image of what prison is — a poor answer to a problem that it cannot solve. Prison education projects frequently contain this very ambiguity: they will not be approved unless they agree with the objectives of resocialization and normalization. Some would say that that is the aim of all education.
2. Not all learning is education, however. Some countries, it will be recalled, offer some offenders a choice between »traditional« imprisonment and a training course that is shorter but far harder and physically very demanding: blind obedience to orders, physical punishment, »esprit de corps«, and encouragement of public expression of disgust at what one has done. Some people would say that this is also education.
3. Not all reintegration programmes are so absurd, even though it has to be admitted that education serves the prison system rather than being an opportunity for personal preparation for the future: the future has nothing to do with prison, but it has to start out from prison. It is therefore outside that the immediate »effectiveness« of socio-educational interventions will be seen, when the prison gates open on another life, on life itself and the need to find one's feet in it again, or perhaps for the first time.
4. In prison, education is part of a conservative goal. And it is obviously not the first time that education has played such a role. It is therefore impossible to separate the struggle for education in prison from that for education that liberates the whole person everywhere.

There is therefore no answer to the question of what can be expected of prison education. The real question is what can be expected of prison, and it is only when that is answered that an answer to the first question will be forthcoming.

Despite the ambiguities, thousands and thousands of people learn in prison every day, and our deeper questioning should not obscure (or diminish the merits of) the tremendous work that is being done, or deny the progress, revelations, enjoyment and pleasure of learning that are experienced. Despite the ambiguity of education under such conditions, we should acknowledge the results of this formidable work so that we know what can be achieved when we call for adult education.

The following are some of the effects that have been seen:

1. Most reports on the «effects» of prison education are quantitative, and positive. The recidivism rate tends to decline; individuals have grasped the wrong they have done, and have made plans for their lives (and work); some have even taken university courses or become managing directors. Evaluation in terms of social and educational reintegration predominates. Prison education is described as positive if goals other than education are pursued by inmates, education being the stimulus, the starting point.
2. Prison authorities (and the whole of society) also make their own evaluation: peace reigns in prisons, inmates following courses and learning trades are rarely those that revolt or re-offend. Prison education is therefore also a good thing for the running of the penal institution and social peace.
3. At the macro-economic level, prison education, by virtue of the peace that it guarantees and the desire to integrate that it stimulates in individuals, gives reason to hope that it will be necessary to spend less on welfare programmes, social security and unemployment benefits, social work and policing, all of which would cost more if offenders left prison with no «education».
4. Evaluation can also be carried out in terms of cost, and by looking globally at the prisoners' careers: if it is supposed that each person should have at his or her disposal educational capital of x years, to be used at some point in life, and if it is admitted that prisoners have, willingly or not, not used all of what society allows each person, then it can be said that prison education, far from being an «additional benefit» granted to prisoners, is only the fair portion of their entitlement, and will be «better» used.

8

This reasoning rests on the finding that most prisoners generally have a level of education below the national average. The hazards of life and previous decisions have caused them to give up formal education earlier than others, or with less baggage and knowledge than others: the organization of prison education is thus a remedial operation, restoring what is due — it is distributive justice.

5. What Education, What Education and What Peace?

1. The paradox in the evaluation of prison education is that this takes place largely in the non-education sector. Prison education is evaluated in social and economic terms. Where there is a prison education programme, peace reigns and will go with the inmate when he or she leaves. That is what is said — and let us hope it is true.

The time spent in prison is one of training, of awakening or reawakening the desire to learn, and of showing evidence of it, and that can be verified in social behaviour. This observation is perhaps not as surprising as it seems: any educational goal always has repercussions on health, employment, the environment, leisure and participation, whether in prison or outside.

2. So far, we have not considered what is particular to prison education for inmates who are not native to the country in question. Little is available for them, especially for those who have been living for a long time in the «host country» and have kept their cultural references. What does «reintegration» mean for them, and what bridges can be built? In the industrialized countries, foreign prisoners often have a level of education lower than that of prisoners from the country in question.

In such cases, learning the language of the «host country» is an important skill. This is one of the few occasions when it can be stressed that an educational goal will be evaluated within the field of education.

6. Demands

The dream is that there should be no education in prisons — because there were no prisons, because «they» had found one or more other ways of ensuring social peace and security for all while still imposing some form of penalty

and education on delinquents, on deviants. The real dream is that there should be no wrongdoing!

This is not the case, so we still have to fight for education in prisons.

1. The first requirement is simple: there must be education programmes in prison; these facilitate the social rehabilitation of prisoners even if — because — this is also a pledge of peace. Such education has to be in the spirit of education for peace and health, and of learners' needs in a respectful relationship of sharing knowledge. This requirement is simple but demanding. The problem is, only a minority of prisons throughout the world have a minimum programme of adult education.
2. The second concerns how it is run: it is not a question of keeping inmates busy in the most intelligent way possible, so that they can, for a longer or shorter time, discover new centres of interest and hence promise to do better when they leave; the programmes have to be given the same attention as any other educational programme; they have to encourage the quest for information and the education of inmates rather than being an alternative to (poorly) paid work in workshops or staying on one's own in a cell.

It is certainly paradoxical to talk of encouraging creativity in prison, but it is to be hoped that some political and educational decision-makers will recognize the value of programmes that appeal to the imaginations of those who are primarily concerned.

3. In this context, taking away hours of education is as unsuitable a punishment in prison as it is outside; school punishment consists of detention, that is, staying longer in school!
4. Transfer from one prison to another can sometimes lead to a break from the new environment, which is admittedly artificial but may nevertheless already have provided some points of reference — including education.

Even if the education programme is exactly the same in the new prison and even if an inmate can be fitted in without educational difficulties, a transfer disrupts learning because the environment (the prison, the reason for transfer, the fellow inmates in a cell, the security staff, the teachers, the materials, and so on) changes, and with it the whole context of the education.

8

5. Frequently, in prison as elsewhere, people decide to learn »for« some person (children, spouse, etc.) rather than for a rational objective. In this context, teachers play a key role. Educational continuity has therefore to be guaranteed. The stability of education and supervisory teams is a basic requirement.
6. If we want to avoid the nightmare of wanting sentences to be longer so that they correspond to the length of education courses, it has to be possible to continue education undertaken in prison outside. For that to happen, it is not enough to arrange series of adaptable courses, but plans have to allow for a flexible system and for the material means that will enable ex-offenders to go on with their education after release without difficulty.
7. Prison education is often arranged by unpaid volunteers with varying degrees of education. This gives it a less formal character which must be preserved, although it must also be overseen by a professional team in a traditional framework of equivalency, evaluation and courses, etc.

Teachers in prison must have the status and privileges accorded to all teachers, whatever their teaching environment, including retraining and the role of interlocutor for decisions relating to their students, including prisoners. Teachers have a relationship with prisoners that can often be different — they are not checking up on inmates, they have to discover something else, they stimulate inmates' imagination, they are not there because of the past but for the future, they are not there because they belong to the world of criminal and penal justice and have to make sure that inmates survive, but because they come from a different sector, that of education and training for life.

8. Particular attention must be given to the whole of the prison staff, among whom security officers play an important role. Education is unimaginable in an environment that is more or less hostile to it. All the prison staff (principally those in constant contact with inmates) should be enrolled in continuing training — as should all workers. This training should comprise awareness of what education inmates need, not as an occupation that can be cancelled as punishment, but as an essential element of rehabilitation. It is also in their interests to live in a literate environment.
9. Other inmates who have followed the same rigorous training should be able to become prison educators.

10. The educators, whether they belong to the state structure or non-governmental organizations, should have the means of following up education when inmates leave prison, provided that the inmates wish it. These structures need to recognize that lifelong education also means education after imprisonment. There is education after prison!
11. Universities, particularly social science and prison education departments, should work with the groups of educators on the ground, providing inservice training, conflict resolution, evaluation, etc., both for educators and all prison staff. A literate prison environment is only possible if all those involved have the chance to contribute to it.
12. A lifelong learning society is a society in which people have a right to »recover« the credits of which they made insufficient or poor use in adolescence. The desire to learn should be something that all people acquire, whether in prison or not.
13. Educating also means revealing abilities. Inmates sometimes have long first-hand experience of life, or at least of survival — they must have done something to find themselves in prison, which does not erase those skills. Sometimes, as is known, prison is also a »school of vice«, in which petty offenders learn to be »serious criminals«.

Courses for prisoners should also take account of their skills. Without falling into the trap of suggesting that education will transform every dishonest safe-breaker into an honest locksmith, and every car thief into a driving instructor, society and the prisoner both have an interest in building on these skills. Prison and contrition will never completely destroy what once made the offender feel proud and honourable (wrongly, in the eyes of society). Education has to give them the means to set their own comprehensible moral rules that are compatible with the »social order«.

14. Prison life must not simply set aside certain hours for education; it should also enable inmates to study in their cells and to have access to educational materials. The forced coexistence of several prisoners in one cell is certainly not an optimum condition for individual study.
15. Certification must be the same as for the normal curriculum; it should not mention that qualifications were gained in prison.

16. Reading and learning material is often unsuitable. Prisoners have experience of life: reading and writing about it is interesting for them, and for others. The writing down of this experience can provide teaching materials that are particularly suitable for learning, and for social and civic education.

Even if such writing is in the form of fiction, it captures part of their experience and can be used as material in other prisons and educational environments. Material that relates to the culture of the learners is a starting point for discussion and reflection. It should be possible in this way to produce inmates' own »courses« in prison.

Conclusion

Prison education is certainly one of the sectors with which we are concerned that usually shows the greatest differences between industrialized and developing countries. In the one case, there is a justified struggle to improve prison education, and in the other, there is neither food nor water in prisons, so what is the sense of demanding education for all? However, it is a common struggle for dignity through culture, and education.

The written word finds its true social dimension when it is part of an approach that liberates and lets people define their own goals. However high and thick the walls, words will often sustain people, even when they have been particularly perverse.

Culture blots out neither differences, mistakes nor failures. It is a tool of analysis and advancement, and gives people a sense of direction, including people who have so far lived their lives in all sorts of directions.

The technical information and essential content of this article are drawn from »Basic Education in Prisons« (edited by Peter Sutton), UNESCO Institute for Education, Hamburg, and United Nations, Vienna, 1995.



CONFINTEA V

THEME 9:

*The Economics
of
Adult Learning*

Albert C. Tuijnman

Economics of Adult Education and Training

9

Although economists contribute many useful insights, adequate answers can be obtained only in a multidisciplinary framework, which requires the cooperation of educationists, psychologists, sociologists, and others. Topics addressed here include costs and finance, educational production, labor markets and adult education, manpower requirements, employment and unemployment, productivity and economic competitiveness, and the private and social rates of return to investment in adult education and industry training.

1. Concepts and Definitions

Economics is a broad-ranging social science discipline concerned with the study of how scarce resources are used in production to create value added, and how the benefits are distributed to satisfy the demand of individuals and groups in a society. The key concepts in economics are scarcity of resources, choice and desirability, production, and distribution.

The economics of education, which is a relatively recent branch of economics, deals with the production and distribution of knowledge and competence. Knowledge is not the same as competence, since the latter implies a capacity to organize knowledge and apply it efficiently and effectively. Competence is both a product of and an input into a complex production process.

The research and policy questions that apply to the economics of school education are in principle the same as those asked in the economics of adult education. In both cases the key issue is the allocation of scarce financial, human, and physical resources to a process of education and learning that is designed to produce beneficial outcomes: is the investment optimal, given that there is a choice of alternative resources that may be used? Is the learning process efficient, given that there are different teaching methods and approaches that can yield the same outcomes at a lower cost? Is the product cost-effective, given the costs, the intended uses, and the benefits thus generated? And are these benefits then distributed equitably among the individuals and groups in a society, given the needs and desires of people and the applied method of financing the learning process?

There are of course some differences between school education and adult education. The principle of voluntariness is important: Differences in maturity, motivation, learning style, and choice may interact with differences in the organization of the learning process. These differences may also have an impact on the costs, the method of financing, and the eventual distribution of the benefit accruing in the learning process.

Adult education is offered by a broad range of providers to highly heterogeneous audiences. This diversity introduces a number of variables that must be taken into account in economic studies of adult education, which may range from public basic education provided in the formal system of education to informal learning in the work place and the continuing education of highly skilled professionals.

A distinction is sometimes made between adult education for consumption and adult education for investment. Consumption education is directed mainly to personal goals, often in connection with the development of leisure. Education aimed at personal development or the enrichment of leisure is properly studied using other conceptual frameworks and variables than would be used in an analysis of the effectiveness of public or firm-based training programmes. Although the distinction between adult education for consumption and investment is essential, the practical usefulness of the dichotomy is limited because an educational programme is seldom undertaken only for consumption or only for investment. Yet despite this difficulty, the distinction offers a theoretical means of conceptualizing the field with which the economics of adult education is primarily concerned.

2. Costs and Financing of Adult Education

A wide variety of institutions operate in the markets for adult education and training. This diversity makes it nearly impossible to obtain accurate and consistent information about costs, which renders decision-making risky: the performance of one programme cannot be assessed against the costs and benefits associated with others.

The OECD recently launched two programmes to improve the availability and transparency of statistical information about the costs and financing of adult education. The first was in connection with the OECD-led project on the development of Indicators of National Education Systems (INES). In the INES project steps were taken to develop indicators of participation in adult education and training and to identify public expenditures on adult education. The second OECD initiative concerns the development of a framework and instruments for the collection of training statistics. The preliminary version of the «Manual for Training Statistics» (OECD 1995) distinguishes 30 cost components such as the labor costs of the trainers, the value of the trainers' marginal revenue products foregone, the labor costs of the trainees' replacements, the rent of physical facilities hired for training purposes, the financial cost of enterprise-owned physical facilities, the cost of training levies, and the fees or payments to external institutions for purchased training. Despite the urgency of the need for such information, it will take much time and effort before reliable and valid data on the costs of adult education and industry training become available at the national and international levels.

Information on the main sources of financing is also scarce. Public funds are raised through general taxation or, in some countries, through earmarked taxes on luxury goods, property taxes, lotteries and payroll taxes. Apart from public subsidies, adult education and training programmes are to a large extent privately financed. The main responsibility lies usually with the individual, who pays tuition fees and purchases books, equipment, and other materials, and the employer, who may subsidize tuition fees and often provides workers with time off from work for learning. A third category of finance is made up of private funds expended by trade unions, religious, cultural and other voluntary associations, and international donor agencies. However, little is known about the balance of the shares in total spending of central and local government authorities, firms, and individuals. The controversy over possible under- or over-investment in adult education and training is a result of insufficient data about who pays and who benefits.

9

3. Production of Adult Education

There are two main approaches to the economics of educational production. In the traditional approach it is assumed that schools and adult education institutions function much like private, profit-making firms. The objective of management in private firms is to maximize profit. There are several keys to achieving this goal, among these cost control, efficiency and cost-effectiveness. Cost control is an important element of public policy for adult education, while private sector training has relied more on improving the efficiency of educational production. In contrast, schools and institutions of adult education are considered «public sector» organizations in the alternative approach to the economics of educational production, in which less importance is attached to criteria of cost and efficiency and more to political and institutional issues such as allocation, control over content, and distribution. The emphasis in this perspective is on reproduction instead of production, and the preferred techniques are derived from a critical rather than a systems analytical perspective.

The process of adult education is, in principle, no different from any other production function. It is a mathematical expression that relates inputs to outputs. The input factors usually include financial, human and physical capital items, such as money, teachers, students, and buildings. An important issue concerns the distinction between manipulable and non-manipulable factors. Decision-makers can usually do little about the socioeconomic position or the capacity to learn of the adult population, but they can allocate more or less funds, and increase or decrease the supply of learning opportunities. Output variables are, for example, knowledge, different skills, values and attitudes. Whereas production functions purport to describe how inputs are transformed into outputs, the variables that explain how that transformation actually occurs are inferred from the relationships among other variables. Of the many criticisms leveled against the modelling of educational production, the lack of attention to process has been a main argument.

4. Labor Markets and Adult Education

Three theories are relevant to a discussion of adult education and the labor market: human capital theory, screening or filtering theory, and job matching theory. The last two question the linear relationship between investment in adult education and worker productivity, since such investment may lead to overschooling, which tends to lower workers productivity. Although the indi-

vidual tends to derive a positive return on overschooling, the costs may outweigh this return.

The individual benefits of education are emphasized in the human capital approach, using personal income as the criterion: adult education results in a higher wage because it increases the capacity of workers to perform their jobs efficiently. Two relationships are hypothesized: an effect of adult education on workers' productivity, and an effect of productivity on individual income. Studies conducted in this perspective focus on the relationship between education and personal income: the relevance of education for productivity is usually taken for granted.

The screening or filtering perspective holds that people invest in adult education because the qualifications which are acquired can show potential employers that they possess certain scarce skills and other personality traits, such as motivation and perseverance.

In this perspective, it is not productivity but self-selection that forms the basis for the relationship between adult education and individual earnings.

Information is a central variable in both screening and job matching theory. In screening theory the emphasis is on the comparative advantage of the individual, who holds vital information vis-à-vis the employer. In job matching theory, both workers and employers can derive useful information from workers' adult education. This information can be used by both parties to improve the match between the skills possessed by workers and the competence demanded by the job. The central hypothesis is that adult education has a positive effect on productivity because it raises performance-relevant competence and offers a signal for allocating the right people to the right jobs. Productivity only increases if the signals help to improve the job match and the new competence is actually used on the job. But if adult education widens the discrepancy between workers' competence and the skills demanded at work then the effect on productivity may be nil or negative.

5. Manpower Requirements, Employment, and Unemployment

The manpower requirement approach projects the demand for labor by various educational and occupational categories under various assumptions. Adult education has become part of the picture because of the so-called »two

percent argument». The argument is that the annual influx from external to internal labor markets — mainly school leavers and graduates — is about two percent per year. A labor shortage may occur if exits from the labor force as a consequence of retirement exceed two percent. Forecasts show that this may soon be happening in many industrialized countries. If such countries seek to upgrade the educational qualifications of their work forces then they should invest heavily in adult education. If a country were to invest much more in schooling than adult education, then it might take 25 years to upgrade the skills of only half the work force — by which time the skills of others would have become obsolete due to technological advances and economic restructuring.

Such forecasts have tended to be inaccurate, reflecting the use of untenable assumptions, poor data availability, weaknesses in applied methodology, and the unpredictability of the future. As a result economists have attempted to develop new approaches to the organization and functioning of labor markets in relation to educational production.

There is much support for the hypothesis that adult education and industry training help to explain the differences in labor market status between workers with similar levels of schooling and work experience, even if other variables such as cognitive ability, achievement motivation and personal work histories are held constant. Findings from Swedish research indicate that as workers get older, the effect of schooling becomes increasingly mediated by adult education and by personal work histories. It has also been found that job-relevant adult education of a formal type results in greater occupational mobility than on-the-job-training and informal learning at the work place. The explanation seems to be that competence acquired in formal education is easier to certify than skills acquired informally on the job.

Adult education is often seen as an instrument for enhancing employment security and facilitating mobility. However, there is some evidence that these two goals are at odds. Theory predicts that firm-specific training improves employment security. However, customized education also limits the free flow and turnover of labor. In contrast, adult education of a general type reduces employment stability but facilitates mobility. The pay-off from adult education in the firm depends on how long workers remain in the service of the employer. Trainees who receive firm-based education are on the average less mobile prior to receiving the education than other workers, and their mobility is further reduced by that education. Employment security apparently promotes in-

vestment in skill formation, and such investment in turn promotes employment stability.

The incidence of unemployment is generally lower, the higher the level of initial education. There is evidence that this also applies to adult education. It has been observed that workers with less than 12 years of schooling are 170 percent more likely to suffer unemployment, and they experience spells of unemployment 30 percent longer than workers with 16 or more years of schooling. Educated workers are moreover likely to search for a new job while still employed, thus reducing search costs, and to acquire and process information more efficiently than less educated workers; and employers and workers both search more intensively to fill more skilled slots. Further, the problem of insufficient information leading to a poor job match, which lowers the efficiency and productivity of schooling, is less pronounced in adult education.

9

6. Adult Education and Productivity

Productivity can be assessed in terms of the aggregate output of an economy, the output of a branch of industry or a specific work place, and the output of an individual worker.

Neoclassical theory is at the heart of most studies of the relationship between education and macroeconomic growth. These studies often hold that the output of an economy depends on the amount of capital and labor employed and on the flow of new technology. Education is usually not entered explicitly but it is assumed to influence both labor quality and technological progress.

A new theory of growth has been gaining in importance since the mid-1980s. Extended production functions take not only capital and labor but also knowledge into account. Studies comparing growth rates in different countries found that lack of human capital and education, not lack of labor or investment in physical capital, is what prevents economic growth in poor countries, and there is sample evidence that adult education adds to the stock of human capital in a population.

The effects of adult education on the productivity of firms are investigated in several studies. Studies of the relationship between adult education and the productivity of firms have usually emphasized the role of firm-specific training. Some authors support a positive correlation between training investment and

output. Yet the direction of this relationship is often unclear. Profitable companies, high-technology enterprises, and large firms with low turnover tend to invest more in training than low-technology and smaller firms. But studies unequivocally showing that this investment also raises the output of firms are scarce. One study finds that a 10 percent increase in training investment leads to a growth of three percent in labor productivity. Another study estimates that an increase in training expenditure yielded a 16 percent return in productivity after a certain period of time. For manufacturing firms in the United States, a third study finds that a 10 percent increase in the proportion of workers trained led to a 1.4 percent increase in total sales within three years.

It is often assumed that the positive relationship between adult education and personal income is indicative of differences in productivity between workers according to the acquired level of education. However, it is found in studies of firms that income, although predicted by the level of education, does not equal the real value of the marginal product. The theory of implicit wage contracts explains this in terms of the distribution of risk-taking between workers and employers. Another explanation is that employers who carry most of the costs of specific training will offer incomes lower than the value of the marginal product. Since the value-added of specific training falls in large measure to the employer, the return on adult education in terms of increased productivity is therefore likely to be greater than the return suggested by wage growth.

7. Benefits of Adult Education

The possible economic benefits of adult education can be measured in different ways and at different levels. Economic theory predicts that the microscopic or private returns and the macroscopic or social returns to an investment in adult education and training are interrelated.

a. Private Returns

Studies of average age-earning profiles in industrialized countries show that the relationship between formal education and earned income increases in strength up to a point between 40 and 45 years of age, and then levels off. The age at which this peak is manifested tends to be higher, the higher the level of initial education. There is evidence that adult education is also implicated: the turning point in earnings power arrives at a later age for workers with additional training compared with workers who lack training.

Estimates of the private rate of return on formal education show a great deal of cross-national consistency. Rates of return to primary and secondary education appear to be higher than those of higher education, especially the social returns. But private rates of return to higher education appear to have increased since 1985 in many OECD countries. Studies conducted in both developed and developing countries find that the return on training for young workers is at least as high as that on higher education.

One study finds a return to one year of adult education and training of 23.5 percent for all male workers, 26.5 percent for new hires and 37.5 percent for older cohorts. If the training investment is written off over a 25 year period, then the corresponding estimates are 12.8 percent for all workers, 16 percent for new hires and 26 percent for older cohorts. Thus the private rate of return on adult education is higher than the return on both schooling and higher education.

The direct effect of adult education on individual earnings is not significant statistically once job level is held constant in the equation, although the indirect effect mediated by job level is significant and positive. Job matching theory offers a possible explanation: that adult education only increases earnings if it improves worker productivity. Hence the pay-off to the individual depends on whether a qualification or other means of sending a signal to employers is obtained, whether the person can make effective use of the new skills on the job, and whether the productivity gain is noticed and warrants higher pay.

b. Social Returns

Screening theory predicts that the private returns from education will exceed the social returns, and that the larger the distance to compulsory education, the more the social rate of return diminishes relative to the private rate of return. Because workers sacrifice little or no pay to get adult education, and since both firms and society subsidize this education, the individual return is likely to be higher than the social return, although there is some indication that adult education and industry training influence aggregate productivity in an economy.

Investment in new technology should have raised productivity and growth, but in the industrialized countries the gains were generally disappointing.

9

Some economists have postulated that misallocated and insufficient skills explain, at least partly, why the cumulative input of capital, labor and technology has produced below-expected economic growth in some Western economies. Adult education has moved to frontstage because economic growth thus depends not only on tangible input factors but especially on their optimal allocation, given the strongly diminishing returns to investment in intangible capital. Because intangible capital is associated with people and organizations, productivity growth cannot be separated from workers' skills and the quality of interpersonal relationships in the workplace. With the human factor assuming such prominence, questions about the possible consequences of under- or overinvestment and the effects of the inequitable distribution of learning opportunities on the efficiency of educational production have come to the foreground.

8. Conclusion

There was until recently little interest in the economics of adult education. Adult educators have had a different perception of research. Hence the available empirical work on the subject has come mainly from research workers with a loose connection with adult education. A problem arises because the questions economists ask inevitably put an emphasis on education for investment. Consequently there is little evidence about the possible benefits of general or liberal adult education. Because decisions about the worthwhileness of an adult education programme should not be based solely on economic cost-benefit criteria, there is a need for adult education researchers to contribute other theories and criteria of effectiveness that may help to broaden the perspective.

Source: International Encyclopedia of Adult Education and Training, Second Edition, edited by Albert C. Tuijnman, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Pergamon, Oxford.

Manzoor Ahmed

Economics of Non-Formal Education

9

Major practical economic issues relating to the planning and management of education are how to maximize the efficiency of resource allocation and utilization, and how to ensure adequate financing for the educational needs of society. Non-formal education, by expanding the range of options for educational programmes and processes, also expands the range of choices for dealing with economic efficiency and financing issues in educational programmes.

1. Significance of Non-Formal Education

The basic principles of economic analysis in non-formal education are not different from those in other modes of education. It is now generally recognized that the significance of non-formal education lies in the flexibility and choices it opens up in educational programmes rather than in its serving learning objectives and learning groups which differ from those of formal education.

While in administrative and organizational terms, certain programmes may be labelled non-formal, the spread of the concept of non-formal education is that it opens the possibility of altering the »production function« — the combination of different educational inputs which produce an educational output. The production function is relatively stable in formal education. Note, for instance,

the preponderance of teaching personnel costs in education budgets, the narrow variation in teacher-pupil ratios, and duration of courses in multiples of a year. Non-formal approaches have shown that the conventional combination can be varied (by using e.g. distance learning, self-instructional materials, skill modules, apprenticeship training, self-supporting educational programmes, or peer-teaching), thus affecting costs, finances, and outputs of education.

There has, however, to be a general agreement on answers to a number of questions before the economic aspects of an educational programme can be meaningfully examined. These questions may be:

- a. How widely should educational opportunities be dispersed?
- b. How equitably should educational opportunities be made available, taking into account regional disparities, urban-rural differences, gender disparities, and socioeconomic stratification?
- c. What would be acceptable as to the content, quality, and purposes of the educational programme?
- d. How should the costs of educational services be shared and distributed?
- e. What patterns and flows of skills would be needed by projected socioeconomic development and how would these be provided?
- f. What should be the time frame for achieving the accepted goals and how should the process be phased?

2. Enhancing Efficiency

Enhancing efficiency of resources in education calls for the examination of the costs of programmes and their benefits. As non-formal education programmes do not exist on a large scale as a discrete category, the practical approach is to look at the cost patterns in mainstream educational programmes and explore ways of incorporating non-formal features.

2.1 Cost Patterns

A set of generalizations drawn from a series of 27 case studies of educational costs indicates the potential that may exist for greater efficiency:

- a. Personnel costs dominate educational budgets; in primary education they are typically over 90 percent in developing countries.

- b. There is a trend of continuous rise in the cost per student. As economic conditions improve and wages rise, the salaries of teachers also rise. The pressure for improvement in the quality of instruction and the diversification of content of learning also contributes to rising personnel costs. On the other hand, in recent years, economic recession and the burden of external debt have forced developing countries to cut back on educational budgets. High price inflation also has significantly eroded the real income of teachers in many countries. However, this situation is generally seen as an aberration in the trend of rising unit costs.
- c. The structure of educational costs is remarkably stable. The high share of personnel costs keeps the composition of educational costs relatively unchanged, even though total and unit costs continue to rise.
- d. In formal education, unit costs rise with each successive level of education, regardless of whether it is general or technical and vocational education.
- e. The academic calendar of formal education imposes a cost burden. Typically, classes are held for five or six hours a day, during which time only a part of the total facilities is used. Long vacations, holidays, and weekends take up almost one-half of the calendar year. The more expensive the facilities, such as those in technical and higher education, the higher the cost of wastage.
- f. Economics of scale are available to a limited degree in formal education. It has been observed that consolidation of primary and secondary schools has resulted in a reduction of unit costs, while the variety and quality of the school programmes have improved. The same phenomenon can be observed in technical education and universities. There is, however, a limit to this: economics disappear when the overheads of administration, management, and central services begin to be spread too thinly, and too large a concentration of people and activities adversely affects the social and psychological environment.

2.2 Reducing Costs

To what extent can the features of non-formal education be incorporated into mainstream educational programmes to achieve cost reductions without sacrificing results?

Lowering capital costs. In many non-formal programmes there is little or no capital cost involved. Programmes can make use of existing facilities during off-hours, or have physical facilities that are low cost because they are adapted to local needs and conditions, built largely with local materials, labor and techniques, and in some cases with contributions in cash and kind from the community.

However, any programme that reaches a large audience and expects to have a significant impact must be supported by backstopping facilities, although the per learner capital costs may not be high even in these cases. Examples of such well-developed central facilities are the Cooperative Education Center and Wings in Tanzania, the Mobral central facilities in Brazil, and the central facilities of open universities.

In the primary education system in developing countries, capital cost constitutes a significant new investment just to keep up with the growth of the primary school entrants. Variations in the total length of the school cycle and the annual and daily calendar, the entrance age for the cycle, and multiple shifts are non-formal features which can lead to savings in capital costs. Increasing interest in primary education by international development finance institutions such as the World Bank and the Regional Development Banks and their offers of assistance largely concentrated on capital investments have heightened the concern about high-cost and high-technology physical facilities which are inappropriate for local conditions, difficult to maintain, and fail to promote community involvement.

Efficiency in personnel costs. Opportunities for savings in personnel costs arise from the use of part-time instructors for a proportionate or less than proportionate part-time wage, volunteer instructors at no charge or a small charge, and local people with special experience or expertise who offer their services. These approaches require professional qualifications similar to those in formal programmes.

The flexibility of non-formal education makes it possible to use highly qualified personnel in supervisory, planning, and evaluation tasks for supporting and guiding the field-level activities, thus using relatively scarce talents to maximum advantage.

Self-financing. A number of non-formal programmes have been able to produce commodities and services in the programmes that can be sold outside or used to supplement the programmes' resources. Other types of programmes

can be largely self-supporting in that they need not rely on large outside subvention — the necessary materials being generated locally or provided by the learners themselves.

Marginality of non-formal education costs. Educational programmes minimize net costs when they are able to use existing resources and facilities without diverting these resources from other uses or when they require the investment of a relatively small amount of additional resources. A school-equivalence programme using existing school facilities during the evening and engaging school teachers as instructors on a part-time salary (without incurring teacher-training costs or full costs of producing instructional materials) can be run at a fraction of the cost of a regular school.

Educational programmes that rely on part-time volunteer personnel and existing facilities use resources that have already been developed at some cost to society but have not been utilized to the fullest extent. Distance education programmes that use existing infrastructure have to pay only a fraction of the real costs of establishing and maintaining communication facilities, such as radio and television, and the postal system.

Any educational activity that is part of a broader development programme also enjoys the benefits of cost-marginality. The larger programme provides physical facilities, equipment, and instructional and administrative personnel and, above all, a receptive audience.

3. Cost-Effectiveness

It is not very helpful, in the planning and management of education, to examine costs without looking at the outcome of the learning process.

3.1 Internal Efficiency

The relationship between cost inputs and direct learning outputs (such as knowledge, skills, and so on) embodied in the learner is known as the internal efficiency of the educational programme. The relationship between the benefits derived from an educational programme and the cost inputs is referred to as the external productivity, which also can be expressed in numerical terms as the benefit-cost ratio.

9

Although internal efficiency and external productivity are related, the relationship may not be linear. A programme can have high internal efficiency and low or negative external productivity, e.g. when a programme uses resources efficiently to teach the wrong things in terms of learners' real needs.

Evaluation of educational programmes often focuses on internal efficiency, didactic processes, direct learning achievements, the number of learners who complete the course, and the corresponding cost inputs. Assessment of the cost-benefit relationships requires the examination of internal efficiency: but the results of such an examination alone will not answer the significant cost-benefit questions. One method of cost-benefit analysis, the rate-of-return study, purports to demonstrate the economic return to investment. It has now become widely recognized that rate-of-return is an inadequate basis for educational decisions and can even be misleading. A host of factors extraneous to the educational programme itself determine how effectively the educational output is used for individual and social benefits.

The factors include the general ecological endowment of a geographical area, the economic dynamic and supplies such as agricultural inputs, raw materials and equipment for rural industry, and medical and family planning supplies; physical infrastructure such as roads, irrigation systems, and communication facilities, institutional infrastructure and so on. Overall national and local educational policies and strategies place the individual programme in a broader context and define its links with other programmes, but the full range of benefits from a programme cannot be fully quantified or estimated with precision.

3.2 Pragmatic Compromise

The practical necessities of educational planning and management can be served by a pragmatic compromise between the narrow internal efficiency approach and the impossible task of a total cost-benefit analysis. Judging a programme's value can be helped by juxtaposing the known cost inputs against the evidence that can be gathered of the achievement of the main objectives and intended benefits of the programme. It is certainly more useful for planners and managers of education to view cost-effectiveness as the relationship between costs and the stated objectives of a programme or whatever proxy measures or indication of their attainment are available than to equate it to the relationship between costs and the immediate process outputs, which, by themselves, are unimportant.

4. Mobilizing Resources

A major obstacle to achieving educational goals is scarcity of resources. In the last two decades, two successive world recessions followed by the international debt crisis have caused a decline in real terms in public budgets for education in the majority of developing countries.

Moreover, especially in sub-Saharan Africa and Latin America, the large proportions of government budgets already devoted to education leave limited scope for further increases in public spending. And however much the efficiency of resources is improved, the fact is that in most developing countries significantly more resources will be needed to meet their educational goals.

Taking only the needs of primary education, leaving aside other elements of basic education for youth and adults, and assuming that effective universalization of primary education is the goal, it is estimated that China and India need to increase their primary education resources by four to six times the current absolute amounts in ten years. Such an increase will mean at least doubling the present share of gross national product (GNP) devoted to primary education.

A major increase in educational finance does not necessarily mean that all or most of the increase has to come from public revenues. The rigid structure of formal education allows limited opportunities for use of unconventional resources. In contrast, the expansion of non-formal education or the «deformalizing» of formal education can spur greater contributions of various kinds from non-market and non-budgetary resources. By planning and operating educational activities suitable for local conditions and relevant to local development goals, the support and contribution of local people can be harnessed.

5. Conclusion

In summary, non-formal education approaches for youth and adults widen the possibilities of combining economic analysis with key educational considerations such as equity, relevance of content, and quality of learning. Non-formal education programmes, or the adoption of non-formal features in educational programmes, also expand the range of choices in analysis and action in respect of critical economic concerns such as reducing wastage of resources, improving efficiency and cost-effectiveness, and mobilizing larger amounts of resources.

Source: International Encyclopedia of Adult Education and Training. Second Edition, edited by Albert C. Tuijnman, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Pergamon, Oxford.



CONFINTEA V

THEME 10:

***Enhancing
International
Cooperation
and Solidarity***

Paul Fordham

Enhancing International Cooperation and Solidarity

10

1. Rationale

Future international cooperation to enhance adult learning opportunities must be different from past practice, both in the nature of cooperation itself and in the type of activities which are promoted. This is the argument of this paper. Cooperation has to contribute to an improved quality of life for all people and, above all, must increase their capacity to act within and for the betterment of their own communities. International »cooperation« has too often been seen simply in terms of flows of money from North to South or West to East; while »adult education« has usually been seen solely as the activities which happen under that particular label.

One strength from the past is that adult educators have always believed in the necessity of responding rapidly to change. For example, most adult education systems rely on the voluntary attendance of learners and must of necessity be responsive to the demands they make. The determination of programmes and curricula in cooperation with the intended learners, and with their full participation, is an important point of departure from the practice of most formal school systems. When the Delors Report speaks of going »beyond the traditional distinction between initial and continuing education« and of the need for each individual »to learn how to learn« (p. 22), that vision may be applauded, while at the same time asserting that universal »learning throughout life« is un-

is unlikely to happen unless the organizing principles of adult education — partnership and cooperation through learner participation at all stages — are extended throughout national education systems and also permeate international exchanges and relations. The interests of promoting lifelong learning for all will be best served by applying these organizing principles to all.

Since the 1985 Conference in Paris, there have been such dramatic changes to the world's political economy (increasing globalisation and political/economic changes in eastern and central Europe) that the implications for lifelong adult learning have not only to be recognised — as they are in the Conference Agenda — but also considered in terms of how to improve on present practice. In this sense, «present practice» includes both what happens within national boundaries and also the effects of changes there on international cooperation itself. If the organizing principles of adult education are to be applied throughout, then changes in practice at all levels (local, national, regional) have to be considered as well as how these are both interactive with each other, and with changes in the nature of international cooperation.

In 1985 there was still a tendency to imagine that the new «needs» of adult learners were all in the South, and that cooperation and solidarity was always a North-South affair: this view is no longer tenable. For example, the question of what is meant by citizenship, and how adult learning can help focus debate, is a live issue in both eastern and western Europe today; it can and should be informed by post-colonial experience in the South. East-West, South-South and North-North cooperation must also be part of any new vision for adult learning which serves all the world's people, including the excluded. Adult education's organizing principles must be brought to bear on the alleviation of poverty, raising the status of women and the inclusion of those left behind by globalisation in its present form; these remain priority concerns for many adult educators.

2. Extending the Meaning of «Adult Education»

The change of terminology from «adult education» to «adult learning» needs some explanation. First, creating and facilitating adult learning opportunities is much more than the work done by those who describe themselves as adult educators. There are still many educators of adults who see themselves primarily as «agricultural extension worker, health aide, nurse...forest ranger, small business adviser, banker, journalist...» (draft CONFINTEA Agenda para. 11).

This diverse group can be united by the common purpose of promoting adult learning as an essential means of extending the well being of all the world's people. Adult education which is promoted within educational systems is still needed; but it has to be supplemented by structured and purposeful adult learning opportunities which also happen under different labels.

It is increasingly recognised that adult learning for specific purposes happens both inside and outside educational systems, whether or not these have an «adult» label attached to them. Development planners began to use the term «non-formal education» in the 1970s in an attempt to widen perspectives beyond basic literacy and numeracy for adults; but this was only partially successful. It did succeed in extending beyond the school the views of some educators. But attempts to establish non-formal systems of education did not achieve the kind of popular participation, learning and social transformation for which many advocates had hoped. Frequently, NFE became a new term for government departments whose main business was adult literacy. And the functional part of adult literacy is still often seen as the business of a different and probably rival department like health or agriculture.

Even within projects of the larger international NGOs, attempts at facilitating adult learning are frequently seen as the territory of separate education departments which have little influence on, say, the water engineers or the agriculturists. In some cases a well thought out mission statement for one organization may actually impede joint planning if not specifically included within it. The new vision for adult learning must go beyond these and similar failed efforts at «cooperation» or «coordination» within and between agencies. It must start from the definition of a problem to be overcome or an issue to be addressed (poverty, unemployment, discrimination against women, environmental degradation, citizenship, good governance, youth or minority alienation and so on); and it must then pose the question of how planned adult learning can help. Who will provide the inputs, and the stimulation which motivates adults to learn effectively, then becomes part of the early planning stages of any programme or project. How a simple definition of problem or issue can be translated into a practical programme of action is a major question for this Conference. How far can present organizations of adult education be part of this process and by what means?

Programme agencies (e.g. the World Bank) are sometimes worried by high dropout rates from programmes or what they see as a weakening of the will to learn. But the reason is just as likely to be that the programmes being offered have

no meaning for the learners because the problems to be overcome or the issues involved have not been defined or clarified. For example, after a literacy programme, learners are frequently offered something called «post-literacy»: often a kind of adult primary school. What may be much more appealing and motivating as the purpose of learning would be practical instruction in building skills, or how to conserve water supplies or capacity building for the management of local enterprises or of local government. One serious issue here is that this can only be done by the kind of inter-professional and inter-agency cooperation which is so often lacking in practice. It is the professionals and the agencies involved who must be motivated in the direction of joint action; and unless they prepare for this at the programme planning stage, experience shows that it is unlikely to happen.

The common purposes which derive from a broadly based definition of problems and issues, extend across all aspects of life and all sectors of social and economic policy. The new vision of adult learning must be both holistic to embrace all aspects of life, and cross-sectoral to include all areas of social and economic activity.

3. Adult Learning: Past Practice and a New Vision

a. Social Policy Frameworks

One very important issue for governments to consider at an early stage was highlighted by the 1995-96 IIZ/DVV evaluation of its African scholarship programme. This shows the policy vacuum which has been created by past failures of both action and conceptualisation in programmes labelled «adult education». The scholarship programme aims to facilitate the training of «adult educators» and quite rightly asserts that the goals, forms, and methods of adult education should be determined according to the historical and cultural reality in any given country. However, an analysis of the social policy frameworks in all ten countries (Botswana, Ghana, Lesotho, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, South Africa, Swaziland, Tanzania, Zambia, Zimbabwe) shows that only in one or two of these countries is there a clear outline of policy which goes beyond equating «adult education» with adult literacy. In some cases, where adult literacy is not a priority, or where it is the job of a separate and frequently underfunded department of government, even this simplistic clarity is lacking. Trainees are often trained for a field of operations which exists only in the minds of their

tutors and may be based on out of date experience, sometimes from another time, place and culture. If the government's social policy framework is either lacking or too narrowly conceived, then trainee »adult educators« may be well trained; but only to work within a policy framework which does not yet exist.

Moreover, it is not just governments from whom new policy frameworks and political will is required. Other actors from civil society must also be involved, including business enterprise and the whole range of relevant non-governmental organizations, including those whose main concern is with the poor and the excluded. Cooperation, nationally and internationally, should extend to all actors and groups -old and new- who are involved in the education of adults. There is much careful advocacy work to be done before the new vision for adult learning is generally accepted. And this advocacy will only be effective if the international understanding achieved at the Conference is then made visible and debated at all levels where planning decisions are made.

b. Changing Professional Practice

Where policy frameworks are in the process of very rapid change, as in South Africa or in central and eastern Europe, or where policies are still too narrowly defined (e.g. adult education = adult literacy), it is especially important for those who do identify themselves as adult educators to stand back a bit from past practice when they engage in new dialogues with policy and other decision makers. In particular they have to move away from thinking of themselves solely as direct providers of learning programmes, important though this is, and of becoming in addition, catalysts and change agents helping to alter the attitudes and programmes of others.

In the UK in the 1980s the Government funded a temporary (seven year) adult education programme for the unemployed and unwaged (the REPLAN programme). It made no assumptions about what kind or form of learning was appropriate, largely because relevant experience lay with small community groups and the unemployed themselves and not with established professionals. It had a small core staff, but no programme funds of its own, except for pump-priming grants to be used by existing course providers, community organizations and associations of the unemployed. Towards the end of the programme's life, external evaluators were appointed who initially tried to identify discrete »courses« for the unemployed which REPLAN had established: there were none. What REPLAN field staff had done was to act as catalysts amongst

existing course providers and other civic institutions. What then happened was a diversion of some existing resources to facilitate relevant adult learning amongst unemployed workers. This could be: up-graded skill training for existing employment opportunities; new areas of skill acquisition in areas like information technology and computing; or more general education which helped in a re-orientation of life skills and purposes to the new contextual reality — such as the collapse of a long established industry like steel or coal. There was no attempt to change existing structures, but a very determined attempt to change attitudes and policies. Because the programme started from a position where its own initial ignorance was recognised, the educators had to consult with NGOs whose main business was small scale welfare, advice and advocacy for existing groups of the unemployed themselves. One of the early results was a somewhat explosive information exchange which succeeded in changing the practice of each set of partners. The end result was an increase in programme provision for the unemployed; but it was brought about by deliberately seeking out and cooperating with other agencies whose primary concern had been welfare or advocacy rather than adult education per se. In the end, everyone benefited. Similar kinds of inter-agency cooperation are needed internationally as well.

Where attitudes are slower to change than the policy frameworks within which educators work, then adult educators may find themselves offering out of date, or out of touch, solutions. For example, in many countries, workers in all development sectors now operate within a framework where international agencies require a «log frame» approach to planning as the basis for international cooperation between donors, governments and local NGOs; this is usually ignored by academic adult education trainers. Newly recruited staff must quickly understand the mission statement of their organization and know how to: assess needs; prepare work plans; mobilise and motivate learners; prepare appropriate documentation and evaluate results. While the approach is intended to facilitate international cooperation and to improve efficiency, it can result in inflexibility and a rejection of process objectives as somehow less legitimate (because less easy to measure) than objectives which measure outcomes. Application of adult education principles at the planning stage would help to reduce the dangers of inflexibility.

It is not easy for those attuned to be programme developers and providers of courses solely within education systems, to change role from time to time and become catalysts for policy change and programmes in other organizations. Or to assume an advocacy role in favour of new kinds of cooperation. And of

course small groups of field staff cannot do so unless there is some policy change within governments or the more powerful civic institutions engaged in education like universities or big corporations; a start has to be made with them. At the same time, the creation of new bureaucracies or the reinforcement of old ones is unlikely to be effective.

c. Planning Adult Learning Outside Existing Educational Programmes

The 1990 Jomtien Conference on Education for All called for every person — child, youth and adult to be given opportunities for basic education; but post-Conference implementation concentrated almost entirely on basic education for school age children. If the Conference rhetoric and intentions are to be believed, this cannot be because adult learning is not seen as important. Perhaps it just seemed too complicated or too difficult. »Non-formal« education, seen by many at the Conference and in the associated papers as the area to be developed, was also still seen solely as a diverse but separate system of educational initiatives, not as an integral part of programmes and projects with other, non-educational, primary purposes.

There was, however, one NGO paper at Jomtien which began to elaborate a new vision for adult learning in development. It started from the premise that in development programme planning and implementation, learning for individual development and social mobilisation is largely ignored.

»Development interventions take many forms. They may be small or large engineering projects that concentrate on the improvement of infrastructure (e.g. roads, water supplies); they may be concerned with farmer productivity... or they may have... some overt educational aim (e.g. literacy courses, health education). Whatever the type of intervention, nearly every development programme... could provide opportunities for adult learning that stress capacities of analysis, evaluation, problem solving and decision making...

If there is to be any hope of sustainable development, then every person affected must be enabled to take (the)... personal and collective decisions (which) can make or break a programme... Learning enables action based on an understanding of the how and why of events and their relationship to particular local circumstances. For example, water and sanitation sys-

10

tems are used and maintained because people learn how to use them and learn their usefulness. Such learning happens only when a community is provided sufficient and sufficiently useful, opportunities to learn about hygiene and its relation to health; how to design and maintain water monitoring systems; skills in using local resources for repairs; and, most important, the conviction that the system is theirs to be used for their own good as they see it.

Learning works in such cases because it both enables and requires genuine participation. It promotes empowerment as people realise they can produce and direct change, and it promotes a sense of ownership...« (from Chapter 6, *Education for All: An Expanded Vision*, Monograph II, World Conference on Education for All, UNESCO)

An example of policy change involving planned adult learning but which is outside existing educational programmes, comes from Papua New Guinea. Here the European Union has been active for some years in the construction of school buildings; but past practice has been to rely solely on the expertise of centrally based officials in the relevant ministries. It was they who determined the planning priorities in consultation with the EU and its visiting consultants. A major and continuing problem is that the buildings are not properly maintained and little respect is shown to them by the end users — the teachers and the pupils. A new way through this dilemma is the negotiation of «community contracts» for primary school construction, which started in 1996. There is a strong adult learning component in this approach, which involves parents and other village level leaders in deciding on priorities, selection of sites, management of materials procurement and construction, and responsibility for future maintenance. This is only one small example in the whole range of EU international cooperation for development and the EU as a whole has yet to be persuaded of the value of the new approach. Certainly training for the local adult population will be necessary if the functions elaborated in the previous paragraph are to be carried out effectively. This training will need to include the key skills of analysis, evaluation, problem solving and decision making — qualifications mentioned at the Jomtien conference but never carried through as part of the follow-up programmes. Adult educators should be the most effective people to deliver this training, using the well established principles of adult education referred to in 1. above.

Even without training, the process of negotiating community contracts has already changed local attitudes to the point where the EU Delegate was in 1996 confident that the process itself is more effective than central planning in determining what local people want and will respect. It asked prior questions

about how to achieve effective project implementation and started by involving all the potential stakeholders, not least the local communities. It has certainly resulted in a stronger sense of user ownership and therefore of responsibility. In the long run it is also likely to be more cost effective; but this will depend on a new kind of adult education to be part of the implementation stage. Without the new attitude which creates time and space for the beneficiaries to develop their own knowledge and capacities, buildings would continue to be vandalised and costs would continue to rise.

Learners as Part of Programme Management

If strategies are developed which build on this kind of approach to adult learning, then the temptation will be avoided to build up different structures or build up better bureaucratic systems which can then be »coordinated« or between which »cooperation« should be encouraged. It is to find a more effective starting point which is the main reason why, in the Theme 10 Agenda, it is recommended that an adult learning component should be incorporated into the planning of all development programmes. There must be a move beyond the idea of a non-formal education for adults, the provision of which is separated from the programme management itself. Adult learning must become part of that programme management.

An example of learners becoming part of management is the »*Mahila Samakhya*« programme, started in the Banda district of India in 1989 and still on-going. It aims to empower women in an area where gender inequalities are extreme and was conceived initially as an education programme which would enable rural women to move from passive acceptance of their life situation to one of active self determination. As an adult education programme it was initially no more successful than many similar initiatives and was criticized, *inter alia*, as lacking in gender sensitivity: in other words it was run by men with their own pre-conceived notions of what was needed by the intended beneficiaries.

After some fifteen months the focus shifted away from education per se, towards developing an understanding of the life situation of rural women; this led to a total re-evaluation of what was relevant adult learning in this context. Intensive residential courses for village level animators looked at women's own experiences vis-à-vis gender, caste and class. These in turn led to the identification of two areas of need which would improve the life circumstance of the women involved. One was a demand that women themselves should learn the

technology needed to operate and repair the hand pumps which could relieve them of the drudgery of searching for and carrying clean water (50% of pumps in the area had been inoperative for more than six months). The second was a demand for literacy which could help empower women in their interaction with the government bureaucracy. It was only after there had been debate and awareness raising at the village level that women were sufficiently motivated to want to learn to read and write. (Case study published in Werner Mauch / Uta Papen (1997) »Making a Difference: Innovations in Adult Education«, UIE)

In this example, the problem was clearly defined at the outset, but it was assumed at the planning stage that an adult education programme would work without involvement of the intended beneficiaries either at the planning or implementation stages.

In a paper prepared for an African seminar organized by IIEP and DSE as part of a North-South cooperation programme, Sheldon Shaeffer approaches the same issue from the perspective of »participation«. He argues that involving the intended beneficiaries in management, not only ensures relevance, appropriateness and sustainability, but also becomes part of the solution to previously defined problems. At the individual level this leads to: new attitudes, knowledge and skills; and greater awareness, self reliance and effectiveness. At the community level, there is greater control over information and technologies (as in the »Mahila Samakhyā« example), the formation of alliances and networks, the generation of new ideas and more effective management of local resources. Desired participation is defined as real decision making at every stage of development — the identification of problems, the study of feasibility, planning, implementation and evaluation. (IIEP 1992 »Collaboration for educational change in non-formal basic education«, Report of an IIEP Seminar/Workshop, Nairobi January 1992)

e. New Investments for the New Vision

If this is to happen, then »assistance« must give way to »investment« in a whole range of initiatives which develop the potential of human resources, many of which are either unused or underused. When we talk of a holistic view of adult learning, we are not talking only of »cooperation« or »coordination« between existing organizations and programmes, desirable though that may be: we are talking about changing attitudes both to the programmes themselves and to all the actors who are involved in the processes of social,

economic and political change. We are also talking about involving non-traditional actors for whom debate about the significance of adult learning may be a new idea.

For example, managers of private corporations will be familiar with the importance of effective training and re-training of their own employees. A few (e.g. the Ford Motor Company in the USA and the UK) may be involved in workplace education which empowers and enables some employees to seek new jobs and new directions in life. Adult educators have been closely involved on both sides of the Atlantic in promoting and developing the Ford employee development programme. Their advocacy in favour of broad based adult learning opportunities within this multi-national corporation has been crucial to the success of the programme. More advocacy for this kind of international cooperation in the global market place is part of the new vision for adult learning. It should also include support for education outside particular companies as part of their acceptance of corporate social responsibility.

Business leaders, NGOs whose purposes are not primarily educational and potential adult learners themselves; these are some of the new actors who should be involved in international cooperation and exchange in the interests of facilitating adult learning. Above all, the intended beneficiaries themselves must be participants in planning managing and implementing the change processes for their own communities. How can partnership become an organizing principle in maximizing opportunities for adult learning? What kind of advocacy will be necessary if this kind of participation is to be achieved?

4. International Cooperation in Solidarity: from Assistance to Partnership

a. One Way Assistance Flows

Past practice has not always been helpful, either in ensuring popular participation or in maximising adult learning opportunities. The one way flow of money from North to South (and more recently from West to East in Europe) has been accompanied by a one-way flow of technical expertise which is closely linked, professionally and ideologically to the flow of money. One reason is the need seen by donor agencies to justify their own programmes to their own citizens by claiming that this leads to more employment for their own people or more

10

business for their own economies. Another is the perception this reinforces, that expertise really is located mainly in the richer countries and that local knowledge is of little account. Such a culture of dependency inhibits the development of confidence in the worth of indigenous skills and cultures; it also limits the ability of local groups and communities to act for themselves and to accept both ownership and responsibility for new developments. Even where »partnership« is the accepted mode of organization, there can be misunderstandings which result from one-way assistance flows and lack of involvement of all the actors. The mind set may still be of a top-down assistance flow.

Having recognized the problems of the past it is also necessary to be realistic about the future. The power politics involved in international cooperation will not go away. While there is assistance from weaker to stronger or richer to poorer, there will be a tendency for dependency relationships to develop unless positive steps are taken to counteract them. Solidarity will only come by working together in partnership for the promotion of common purposes. For example, if the new East — West cultural cooperation is simply seen as a side effect of economic penetration or the exercise of political influence, then it will also result in dependency (and resistance to it). Advocacy for more adult learning opportunities must also include advocacy for the application of adult education principles and procedures which extend learner participation into programme planning and implementation, as well as simply coming to learn what someone else decides to offer.

Another problem to be addressed is that cooperation is still mainly between governments at a time when many are withdrawing from social commitments to local communities. Governments themselves now recognize that they cannot act effectively in all spheres. And at a time when NGOs are increasingly active in promoting new kinds of adult learning, there is now need to ensure that the partners to international cooperation are multiple not single actors. There must be involvement not only of government agencies across sectors but also of: development NGOs, women's organizations, trades unions, business corporations, human rights groups, environmental groups and other activists. They are all players in a holistic human resources development. One of the characteristics of successful adult education is that it is contextualised and based on local culture or experience. The recognition of the importance of local experience and diversity is crucial. And this local experience should involve the kind of democratic decision making at village level now being attempted by some agencies.

However, there are some hopeful signs of change in local project planning and implementation from a number of different countries which point the way to more widespread changes. One example is the »Education for Community Health Action Programme« (ECHAP) in Kenya which involves close collaboration between a local NGO and several international agencies. Most importantly, there is direct involvement at the planning stage of the intended beneficiaries.

b. Partnership within Regions

Of course, the continuing disparities in wealth between countries and between regions of the world will not easily disappear, and assistance flows from richer to poorer will still be required. Nevertheless, there is already effective cooperation within continents which is not always defined solely by the flow of funds. Programmes of the various regional associations for adult education (CEEAL for Latin America, ASPBAE for Asia and the Pacific, and EAEA for Europe* bear witness to this.

International cooperation is seen as a key factor for the economic, social and political development of the European Union. The EAEA has been active for the past five years bringing together more than 140 adult education organizations from 24 countries in order to exert influence on the educational policies of the Union. The Union itself recognizes that the common problems of member states may best be tackled through transnational cooperation. When considering applications for financial support, the Union gives preference to those where several partner states are involved.

c. Partnership within an Assistance Framework

Investment in adult learning will only increase if investors are convinced of added value and enhanced effectiveness towards whatever purposes are important to them. Globalisation requires global understanding of the synergy which is possible when different kinds of adult learning are perceived as having multiple benefits. When women are empowered by education for small business development, they can also gain knowledge which makes them better parents. When employees are trained for management in corporations they can make a more effective contribution to capacity building or good governance in their communities. The synergy will only be effective if there is effective advocacy

regarding the possibilities. Such advocacy has to involve all actors in a new definition of »partnership«; this should involve its use not merely as an ideal form of interaction but, as with »participation«, an organizing principle to be used in all circumstances.

Especially where the policy frameworks have changed very rapidly, this organizing principle should help to avoid the dependency (and unnecessary conflicts) sometimes involved in flows of funds from richer to poorer countries. In eastern and central Europe there are well established adult education organizations which worked within the old communist political framework. They not only have to learn their own new attitudes, both to accommodate to, and to influence change; but they also have to be effective partners in the many new initiatives for international cooperation. Programmes already exist where the EU is helping to stabilise both political institutions and economies within the existing framework of change. Within these general programmes, adult education organizations can apply for funds to support partnership programmes for neglected and handicapped groups and to support similar programmes to strengthen democracy. Just because these are all in sensitive and problematic areas of national policy, it is important that the partnerships developed are balanced and serious as between professional equals, rather than a West to East knowledge transfer which accompanies the flow of funds.

d. Partnership and Solidarity

If partnership becomes an organizing principle, it will be necessary to move away from attitudes where NGOs are frequently seen solely as agents for the delivery of programmes to other people, rather than including all groups which represent the beneficiaries of learning opportunities. The democratic participation in adult education which has been an organizing principle in many countries, and in the regional and international agencies of adult education must be extended to all the actors. Both organizing principles are at the heart of enhancing learning opportunities for all. The will to learn can only be weakened if the intended beneficiaries are excluded from the planning processes and from decision making at all levels.

This is where the word solidarity has also to be given new meaning. Because all the various actors are themselves learning to come to terms with a new vision for the education of adults, they have to begin from a recognition that other actors in other contexts and cultures may have more relevant knowledge

than they do. For example, in working against the spread of AIDS, it is not enough to provide technical information about the dangers of unprotected sexual activity. Health educators, including doctors, must first learn from the public about social customs and attitudes; only then can strategies be devised that will work in their particular context.

At the IIEP/DSE seminar mentioned above, seven major »actors« were identified as collaborating partners in adult education for development: adult educators and extension agents; universities; the private sector; local government; donor agencies; NGOs and governments (who alone could provide the enabling and policy framework, but were not always the best agency for implementation). All these actors must develop a sense of solidarity, a sense that they share common goals and will therefore develop common ways of thinking, feeling and acting.

e. Conditions which Facilitate Collaboration

The same seminar also considered the conditions which facilitate participation and collaboration and the structures and procedures which might be necessary to ensure them. While these ideas, and the case studies which back them up, come mainly from east Africa, they provide a helpful analytical framework within which others can work and, if necessary, modify according to local circumstances.

Facilitating conditions include: respect for traditional decision making and collaborative systems; willingness of central governments to surrender some control in favour of the other actors; teamwork and multi-sectoralism; a high level commitment to change; willingness to trust NGOs; and the need to accept that the local communities themselves have something important to say about education and development issues.

Structures and procedures to facilitate change include: a shared vision for each programme amongst all the actors; open dialogue and communication; decentralisation and local authority to adapt existing structures and procedures; encouragement of participation by all the actors; and greater focus on the process of change rather than just on pre-determined targets of achievement.

If all this is to happen then there will be a need to re-train people, re-structure organizations, define new roles of the actors at various levels, seek a best mix

of responsibilities among partners in the development process, and change both institutions and attitudes, rather than merely building or strengthening their capacity.

5. Learning to Change: Proposals for International Action

Various proposals for international action are included in the Agenda paper. There will be no global concern for adult learning without international co-operation and solidarity. Nor will it be possible to maximise adult learning opportunities unless international cooperation ensures they are included in all development programmes, either within or across sectors. If partnership and participation are made organising principles of international cooperation and solidarity, then one test for success should be whether or not the application of these principles in practice results in mutual learning rather than simply a one way flow of ideas. From the perspective of this paper comment on three outstanding issues seems especially important as being relevant to the arguments advanced.

a. Making Adult Learning a Matter of Global Concern

The most important positive outcome of CONFITEA must be commitment to an action programme which ensures greater recognition for the importance of adult learning in improving the quality of life in all its aspects. This will not happen unless the ways and contexts within which adults learn are redefined and re-assessed. There should be no expansion or creation of bureaucracies, either within existing or new adult education systems; such an approach has failed in the past and, if attempted would probably fail again. Rather, circumstances have to be created, locally and globally, where the potential of adult learning is increasingly recognized, whether this be in the context of a rural development programme or within the area of influence of a multi-national corporation or of a small NGO.

But there is also another kind of commitment. The effects of a globalised economy and the information revolution combine to make more difficult the alleviation of poverty and moves towards greater equality both between and within countries. The poor and the excluded are often information poor as

well as poor in food supplies, other material resources and consumption goods. And the number of those excluded from the global economy is increasing, even in rich countries. As far as information is concerned, it is of little use talking about exchanges on the Internet if the telephones do not work or are non-existent. Moreover, inequalities are not only morally offensive, they make it much more difficult for the rich to accept that the poor also have their share of wisdom and for others, including the information rich universities, to have access to it. Rapid information exchange across the world is technically possible; but it will not bring peace and harmony if two thirds of the world's population are excluded from the new information society.

Commitment must therefore be a two sided affair. On the one hand, there is need for global advocacy about the potential of adult learning in human resources development. On the other, this must not be allowed to exacerbate but rather reduce the growing inequalities resulting from globalisation, national indebtedness, gender inequalities and other barriers to economic growth or political reform.

b. Exchanging and Creating Knowledge

»Exchanging experience« can sound almost as tired a cliché as »improving coordination« when it comes to creating a plan of action. Of course all people want national and international organisations to work together in the pursuit of common goals. However, the unanswered questions are often about what purposes are to be served and what organisations should be involved. If it is agreed that adult educators are united not by a common identity, but by the strategies they employ and the purposes they serve, then a start should preferably be made by exchanging and creating knowledge around common purposes. What is shared is a commitment to the promotion of adult learning as a means of advancing human well-being. However, within this is the great diversity of purposes which cut across all sectors of activity and all countries and cultures. Examples might be: how can adult learning be used in small NGOs which seek to increase women's self employment; what is its role in a rural water development project; what is the best way of developing human resource capacity within an inner city project; how can a multi-national corporation best contribute to learning which increases political participation, equality and stability across the countries in which it operates? And in promoting the exchange of people and ideas, it is not only a question of who learns from whom, but of the mutual learning which is possible when there are purposes

and some experiences in common. Perhaps the best recent examples are to be found in the exchanges organized by women's groups. But because of differences in wealth and therefore access to travel opportunities, true reciprocity is often difficult.

An enabling environment should therefore be created which ensures greater visibility to the potential of adult learning in all human endeavour, and also the special purposes (within and across sectors) which may be dominant in particular places at different times. A great international conference can only kick start the process. One outcome of CONFITEA should be an agreement to fund regional and sub-regional workshops to promote its central themes; the advocacy initiated in Hamburg will have to be carried through to convince all Governments, NGOs and multi-national organizations. The Conference can only be considered a success if its themes are seen to be influential in all future development planning, or forward investment policies, both public and private.

Creating knowledge can be even more exclusive than exchanging it. Research money is scarce, and also a source of prestige and influence for the (usually rich) institutions which attract it. For example, scholars and development workers in the South have plenty to say to their colleagues in the North. The trouble is that they are so often absent from relevant information exchanges and conferences. As the NGO consultation seminar (November 1996) asserted:

«...there is a need to create alliances which enable NGO research in the South to figure more prominently on the research and academic agendas of the North... funds and opportunities must be found to include... (them)... in international gatherings...»

And this would also be in the interests of the North. Broad alliances of local people, NGOs, local institutions and others in the South, or the new eastern and central Europe, will enhance analytical power and a sense of ownership. This helps to ensure that the results of the research will actually be used. When combined with the research resources of the North, the resulting synergy serves the interests of all partners. Part of the research alliances must be to build up and re-classify documentation on adult learning so that it becomes both more accessible and is also usable by those interested in the themes promoted by CONFITEA V.

c. Monitoring and evaluation

Regular and sensitive monitoring is perhaps more important than summative evaluation, especially where international cooperation is involved. Funding agencies all have to be accountable to those who provide support and will

therefore require the evaluation of programmes. Often a final evaluation is done by some outside agency after the activity itself has ceased or is being wound down. But monitoring not only provides essential information for the improvement of an activity while it is happening, it can also more easily involve participants themselves.

If learning opportunities are provided according to the organizing principles of partnership and democracy noted above, then evaluation becomes a process which involves all the learners; it both enhances and is part of the learning itself.

This kind of evaluation can be problematic, especially for those used to evaluation which is entirely external to the participants and sometimes to the implementing agencies themselves. Its promotion should be part of the advocacy needed following on from the Conference itself.

10

6. Summary

Rationale

- Future international cooperation must be different from past practice, both in the nature of cooperation itself and in the type of activities promoted.
- Cooperation, partnership and participation among all the actors are guiding principles in most adult education systems. They must become the guiding principles for all international cooperation in this field.
- World events since 1985 — especially increased globalisation and the changes in east and central Europe — have dramatically altered the context in which adult educators work. Changes in practice at all levels, and their mutual interaction must be addressed, if these guiding principles are to be applied internationally.
- International cooperation is not only North-South but also E-W, S-S and N-N as well.

Extending the Meaning of »Adult Education«

- The starting point is recognition of the great variety of professionals who are involved — ranging from health aides to bankers — but for whom education may be secondary to their primary function. (Agenda for the Future Part I)

- Another necessary recognition is that planned adult learning happens both inside and outside educational systems; and it takes place both within and across all development sectors.
- The new vision of adult learning must start from a definition of problems to be overcome or issues to be addressed. The question to be put in all programme planning is how planned adult learning can help, as an integral part of the programme.
- Learner motivation and the «will to learn» result from programmes which learners themselves are active in planning and designing. Inter-agency cooperation across sectors is a pre-requisite for successful learner motivation.

Adult learning: past practice and a new vision

- In many countries there is either a policy vacuum for adult education or it has been too narrowly defined and in official thinking is confined solely to adult literacy.
- The professional adult educators may need to supplement their role as direct providers of adult education and, in addition, act as catalysts within the programmes of other agencies.
- International agencies now require a log frame approach to planning. Application of adult education principles at the planning stage would help to reduce the dangers of inflexibility in international cooperation.
- There is potential for adult learning in all projects which aim to bring about social, economic or political change. Cooperation both within and between countries should seek to maximise these opportunities and, at the planning stage, to build in an adult learning component to all development programmes. «Non-formal» education then becomes an integral part of programme management, not a separate system.
- This investment in adult learning should include the key skills of analysis, problem solving, decision making and evaluation. This kind of adult education can make a major contribution to human resources development in both industrialised and developing countries.
- Genuine participation in development requires that learners become part of programme management. It must also involve a devolution of authority

from central ministries and major agencies right down to the intended beneficiaries themselves.

- All the non-traditional actors must be involved in international cooperation and exchange. These include managers in the private sector as well as small political or social welfare organizations (e.g. of unemployed workers in all countries, women's groups or NGOs like the «civics» in South Africa.) As the «Mahila Samakhya» example illustrates, specific education programmes often arise from planned improvements in other sectors (e.g. in this case a demand for women's literacy after the provision of clean water).

International Cooperation in Solidarity: From Assistance to Partnership

- Cash flows and accompanying experts from North to South or West to East still tend to dominate; although the resulting culture of dependency may be mitigated by encouraging more democratic participation at the planning stage of programmes and projects.
- Governments and international agencies have been the chief actors in cooperation, but these must now extend to a whole range of NGOs representing, *inter alia*: women, trades unions, private business, human rights and environmental organisations. The new actors must also include village level groups who become active partners in decision making and management.
- Regional cooperation is a key factor in extending adult learning opportunities. In the European Union, the EAEA has been particularly active in bringing various actors together and trying to influence the policies of the Union.
- Investors must be convinced of the resulting added value from enhanced adult learning opportunities. Globalisation requires global understanding of the synergy possible where multiple benefits are involved.
- Even where the idea of partnership is accepted, the «partner», even an NGO, may still be little more than a passive recipient. Both reciprocal partnership and democratic decision making must become the organising principles of international cooperation.
- Partnership as an organizing principle in international cooperation helps to avoid dependency, even where one way assistance flows remain in place.
- Implementation will require that all involved people be re-trained, organizations re-structured and roles re-defined for all the actors.

10

Learning to Change: Proposals for International Action

- If all the objectives of the Agenda are to be achieved, then follow-up to the Conference must concentrate on the creation of an enabling environment in all countries (including at the level of local communities), regions and at the global level. If the potential of all human beings is to be realised, then access to information and to learning opportunities must be reflected in appropriate and probably new/revised social policies for the education and training of adults.
- Mutual learning between and within all the partner organizations will be a significant test of whether or not the organizing principles of partnership and learner participation have been implemented.
- Governments must provide the frameworks; but the necessary multiplicity of all actors must be recognised and become part of new international partnerships for North-South, East-West, South-South and North-North cooperation. Governments, NGOs, ordinary citizens and civil society in all its variety (e.g. business, trades unions, the media, religious, political and cultural groups) must be fully involved.
- Commitment to advocacy about the potential of adult learning must be accompanied by a commitment to reduce the growing inequalities resulting from globalisation.
- Research by NGOs and others in the South must be made visible in the North by all means, including more reciprocity in international exchanges.
- Learning opportunities provided in accordance with the organizing principles of partnership and democracy mean that evaluation of international cooperative programmes should become a process which involves all the learners.

»Political will« (in the sense of policy statements or changes by governments) will be a necessary but by no means a sufficient condition to change attitudes among all the actors, actual and potential. All must be involved in the debates, workshops and exchanges which should become part of the follow-up to the Conference.

Note

- * Consejo de Educacion de Adultos de America Latina, Asian-South Pacific Bureau for Adult Education, and European Association for the Education of Adults

UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL,
SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

**FIFTH INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE
ON ADULT EDUCATION
(CONFITEA V)**

Congress Centrum Hamburg (CCH)
Hamburg, 14-18 July 1997

**ADULT LEARNING:
EMPOWERMENT FOR LOCAL
AND GLOBAL CHANGE
IN THE TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY**

A DISCUSSION GUIDE

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

219

The context

1. The Fifth International Conference on Adult Education is intended to highlight the importance of adult learning in empowering people and forging a worldwide commitment to adult and continuing education in the perspective of lifelong learning.
2. On the eve of a new millennium and at a time of dramatic developments in nearly all aspects of life, it is especially appropriate for the Conference to seek to look into the future and signal necessary changes in policies, priorities and approaches that would enable individuals to continue to learn throughout their lives in order to meet the challenges of an emerging global society as well as the diverse requirements of communities and cultures around the world.
3. This document presents a **selective** list of major issues and questions raised in the regional consultations held to prepare CONFINTEA V. It is intended to serve as a **discussion guide**. Delegates and participants are, of course, free to raise other issues that they feel require international reflection. The emphasis in this document is on posing questions and identifying issues, not on answering them. It should be read in conjunction with the **»Retrospective View of Adult Education since 1985«** (ED-97/CONFINTEA/3), which provides background information and a discussion of emerging trends in policy and practice, and the **»Agenda for the Future«** (ED-97/CONFINTEA/6), which sets forth a sizeable number of issues and challenges under ten major themes that it invites the Conference to consider. While the issues raised in these documents apply, in varying degrees, to all countries, it is necessary to recognize that there are significant differences among countries and regions in the concepts, policies, priorities and modalities of adult education.

Role of Adult Education in Lifelong Learning

4. The concept of lifelong learning, in the development of which UNESCO has played a leading role, is now widely accepted as providing a useful framework for the organization of education within society. Yet, with a few noteworthy exceptions, countries have **not** undertaken comprehensive efforts to re-conceive and restructure their education systems into frameworks for

lifelong learning. The Conference may thus wish to examine the results achieved in those countries that have made serious efforts to construct systems of lifelong learning. It may also wish to reflect on the implications of policies of lifelong learning in promoting equity and access to quality provision, and in creating environments supportive of individual and collective learning initiatives:

- **What are essential elements in policies aimed at promoting lifelong learning?**
- **What, in particular, does the implementation of lifelong learning imply for legislation, planning, co-ordination, staffing, financing and evaluation of adult education?**
- **What measures are required to build greater synergy between the education of children and that of adults?**

A DISCUSSION GUIDE

The State of Adult Education

5. During the regional consultation meetings leading up to CONFINTEA V, the situation of adult education was heatedly debated. In some countries, especially a number of industrialized countries, it was asserted that the number of adult learners and the array of adult learning activities was expanding rapidly. By contrast, in many other countries and particularly in the developing regions of the world, the situation described by many participants was one of crisis: of lack of legitimacy and declining interest in adult education on the part of both decision-makers and funding agencies.
6. These views, while sharply contradictory, may both reflect an element of truth. There is, indeed, an enormous and growing volume and variety of adult learning financed, mainly, by employers and directed at upgrading the skills and competencies of their employees. This is the case especially in technologically advanced industries, located mainly in developed countries. Certain developing countries have also managed to provide a wide range of training opportunities for youth and adults. There also appears to be a growing variety and volume of adult learning taking place beyond the traditional boundaries of adult education: e.g., in health, agriculture and other fields.

7. Yet, there is also a large and growing part of humanity, numbered in the billions, without any effective access to adult education. This includes the nearly 1,000 million adult illiterates, the hundreds of millions of individuals with less than a primary education who have an urgent need to develop their vocational and life skills, as well as countless women and men, in both industrialized and developing countries, who live in constant danger of being left behind in a rapidly changing world, but have no access to the training that could ensure their continued productivity, employability and intellectual satisfaction. Thus, in adult education as in other realms of life, there is a growing polarization of the population: a division into **haves and have-nots**, those with abundant access to education and training and those with little, if any, access to such opportunities. This is an issue of fundamental concern to which the Conference may wish to give careful attention. If adult education is to play an effective role in poverty reduction, it is essential that it more effectively serve the poor and excluded as well as those who have access to education and employment. Adult education must not only provide the poor and disadvantaged with knowledge and skills, it must also be a means for their empowerment and for facilitating their active participation in all aspects of the life of their society.

8. Striking disparities — which exist both between countries and within them — are emerging in all regions of the world. Yet, while adult education is often seen as an essential element in correcting growing disparities, in many countries it appears, instead, to have become a factor that contributes to them:

- **What examples are there of experiences that have succeeded in reaching those in greatest need and providing them with the education and training they require to live and work in societies undergoing rapid change?**
- **What action can Member States take to remedy disparity in access to adult education? What is required, for example, of governments, employers, unions, non-governmental and community organizations?**
- **What are the barriers that prevent the participation of certain groups in adult education and how might these be reduced or overcome?**

9. In most societies, the majority of those who are excluded are **women**. While progress has been made during the past decade in providing more equal educational opportunities for women, this problem is far from being fully resolved and demands continuing alertness and persevering efforts to promote gender sensitivity and make adult education more available, convenient and attractive to women:

- **What measures have proved effective in overcoming gender bias in adult education and offering equal opportunities to women and men?**
- **To what extent and in what ways can adult education contribute to overcoming gender bias and discrimination in other aspects of society?**

**A
DISCUSSION
GUIDE**

Broadening the Scope of Adult Education

10. The report of the Delors Commission **»Learning: The treasure within«**, calls for education conceived in the framework of learning throughout life and constructed upon four fundamental pillars of learning: learning to know, learning to do, learning to be and learning to live together. Yet, most adult education focuses on learning to do — particularly how to earn a living — and, to a lesser extent, learning to know. Yet, even here, the need to train people for employment and increased productivity is far from being fully satisfied. Relatively little adult education is directed to teaching us to live together by developing the capacities for democratic participation and the skills for conflict resolution. Even less provision is devoted to learning to be: to developing the human personality in all its richness and complexity, learning to embrace our responsibilities as individuals, as members of a family and of a community, as citizens and producers and as creative and moral beings.
11. The Conference may wish to make recommendations on the content and balance of available opportunities for adult learning. Provision for vocational and occupational education, provided mainly by private employers, is increasing rapidly in technologically advanced industries and countries:
- **But how can more adequate provision be ensured for civic, cultural and humanistic education?**

- What is being done to broaden the scope of adult education in order to meet the changing learning needs of individuals in dealing with family situations, in participating in community affairs and in becoming better parents, neighbours and citizens?

The Changing Role of the State

12. The role played by the government in adult education has considerably evolved over the last decade, becoming more strategic and indirect in many societies. In general, the State continues to play a more direct role in the organization of adult education in developing countries, but even here it often acts in cooperation with other partners. In the industrialized countries, the State increasingly works behind the scene: enlisting and supporting other partners, providing financial support to programme participants or providers, and policing the market for the commercial provision of adult education in order to ensure honesty and, in some cases, quality. Yet, in the final analysis, adult education is a responsibility of the society as a whole and, thus, a matter in which government has an essential role to play, especially as concerns the provision of learning opportunities for the most vulnerable members of society and the promotion of learning aimed at civic and social ends. The Conference may wish to explore the changing role of the State in adult education and possibly to formulate recommendations concerning the role of government in monitoring and coordinating the provision of adult learning by different government services and social partners.

Building Partnerships

13. One of the most positive developments of the past decade has been the growing number of organizations and entities that have become involved in adult education and the vastly expanded array of adult learning opportunities that they are providing. Non-governmental organizations, professional and community associations, employers, unions, interest groups and many other entities that have not traditionally been involved in adult education have begun to play an important and growing role. Often, their motivations are simple and straightforward: for commercial firms, continuing education and training of employees has become an issue of survival in a competitive world. For others — health authorities, for example —,

adult education is the most effective and economic solution available: an ounce of prevention being worth a pound of cure. Even traditional educational institutions, such as libraries, have sought to reach out and make better known and more available the learning resources and services they offer. In most societies, particularly in the industrialized countries, the growth of non-public provision has been far more rapid than that of public provision and, in certain cases, has served to off-set declines in government support:

- **What measures could encourage the private sector — including both employers and representatives of employees —, NGOs and community organizations to become even more actively involved in the planning and implementation of adult education programmes?**
- **What measures are needed to support the efforts of various partners, especially NGOs and community organizations, to assume a growing role in the provision of adult learning opportunities?**

14. Increasingly, people who do not classify themselves as adult educators are actively involved in contributing to the education of adults: e.g., agricultural extension officers, doctors and nurses, environment protection agents, etc.:

- **To what extent do such individuals require training in adult education? To what extent are they receiving such training?**
- **How can the involvement of different development sectors in adult education be encouraged, co-ordinated and supported?**

Developing Adult Education

15. While the Conference will deal mainly with the actual and potential impact of adult education upon society, it is also important to review the requirements of adult education as a field of professional activity in order to ensure that it will be capable of playing the new roles and bearing the new burdens that it is being asked to assume in an age marked by an explosion of knowledge and dramatic changes in the way individuals work and live.

A DISCUSSION GUIDE

In order to confront the changes of the coming century, people will need to learn to continuously adapt their skills, change their habits and attitudes and acquire a better understanding of the milieu in which they live. Successful change requires continuous learning: this fact will underscore the growing need for adult learning in the 21st century. These developments raise many far-reaching issues:

- **What measures — e.g., increases in public and private investments in adult learning, policy reforms, institutional changes, etc. — would be most effective in enabling adult education to adapt to the challenges of tomorrow? How can the needed level of commitment be engendered and sustained?**
- **What steps are required today to ensure that trained staff will be available for future programmes? What steps must be taken to establish efficient mechanisms for coordinating, monitoring and evaluating adult learning programmes and outcomes?**
- **How can adult learning, formal and non-formal, be certified and thereby legitimized and encouraged?**

16. Increasingly, adult learning is influenced by the mass media, especially television. In the future, information technologies, in many forms, can be expected to play a growing role and have an increasing impact on adult education and learning. These developments raise numerous questions, opportunities and concerns:

- **What is the impact of the mass media and new information technologies on the views, attitudes and values of adults? What steps might be taken to enhance the positive educational impact of the media and reduce its negative implications?**
- **What are some examples of the successful use of information technologies in adult education? What do they suggest about the use of such technologies in the future? How can adult educators be trained to make better and more effective use of these technologies? To what extent is such training already being provided?**

17. University programmes and centres of adult education have traditionally provided the professional support required by adult educators, including

the training of specialists, expert advice on problems, and research into key issues such as the motivation of adult learners, methods of instruction, ways of evaluating outcomes, etc. The Conference may wish to assess the situation, needs and prospects of such centres in different countries:

- What is the status of such programmes? What trends are affecting their role and work?
- Are existing centres able to meet the growing need for expertise?
- What are the most fruitful forms of relationship between university centres and practitioners engaged in adult education activities in various fields?

A DISCUSSION GUIDE

Promoting International Cooperation

18. One of UNESCO's primary goals in sponsoring the International Conference on Adult Education is to promote cooperation among countries, organizations and practitioners of different nationalities. The Conference may wish not only to look forward to the coming century, but also to re-examine the progress made and problems encountered in past efforts to promote international cooperation. Given UNESCO's constitutional mission to build **»the defenses of peace«** in the minds of individuals, the Conference may wish to give special attention to the role that adult education is playing — or might play — in building dialogue and understanding between nations, cultures and peoples:

- Why are the numerous commitments repeatedly made by governments and international bodies to support adult education often not met?
- Are there significant gaps in existing arrangements for cooperation that need to be filled? How, for example, can more effective cooperation between international organizations be achieved?
- Why does adult education, given its recognized and enormous potential, not enjoy a higher position on the agenda of international cooperation?

- What concrete steps might be taken to ensure that adult education receives higher priority in the future?
- What approaches or innovations in bi-lateral and multi-lateral cooperation would most effectively contribute to building national and local capacities for adult learning, especially in the Least Developed Countries?
- What concrete measures are being taken at national, regional and international levels to secure funding for adult education and to protect it against the negative impacts of structural adjustment and debt burdens?
- What can we learn from the examples of adult education programmes geared to building a culture of peace and to developing relations of mutual respect and harmony among peoples and cultures? In particular, how can adult education enhance the capacity of societies to peacefully resolve conflicts and confront the problems of economic transition?

Conclusion

19. The questions and issues set forth in this document were raised in the regional consultation meetings convened to prepare CONFINTEA V. They are intended to launch — but certainly not to limit — Conference discussions and debates. As already noted, the situation regarding adult education varies enormously from country to country and region to region. The challenge confronting CONFINTEA V is that of finding common ground and formulating proposals that highlight the crucial importance of adult learning and forge a worldwide commitment to the promotion of adult and continuing education as an essential part of lifelong learning.

List of Authors

David Adams is a Senior Programme Specialist working on policy formulation for research and training in the UNESCO Culture of Peace Programme, based in Paris. He is qualified in physiology and psychology, and has researched on consciousness development.

Manzoor Ahmed has held a number of senior positions in UNICEF and the International Council for Educational Development, having previously held academic and government posts in Pakistan and Bangladesh. He has written widely on educational planning and rural development.

Paul Bélanger has been Director of the UNESCO Institute for Education in Hamburg since 1989, having been Director of the «Institut de recherche appliquée sur le travail», and of the «Institut canadien d'éducation des adultes» in Montreal. He is the author of many international studies on adult education.

Chris Cavanagh is President of the North American Alliance for Popular and Adult Education. A popular educator, writer and storyteller, he specializes in community-based education and the Internet.

Darlene E. Clover has been engaged in the field of education and the environment for many years. She works for the International Council for Adult Education's Transformative Learning Centre programme, which is responsible for environmental education.

Michel Delorme is a member of the «Alliance des radios communautaires du Canada», which aims to provide high-quality French community radio in Canada.

Marc De Maeyer is a sociologist and philosopher who is coordinating the prison education and international cooperation working groups at CONFINTEA, and is responsible for reports on the regional preparatory conferences. He is the director of a film about literacy learning in 15 countries, «Le sujet et la lettre».

Gwynneth Evans has been working at the National Library of Canada for over 20 years, after a career in teaching, including adult education. She has been involved in NGO literacy programmes in the Caribbean and Africa, and has contributed to a World Bank study on educational books in Sri Lanka.

List of Authors

Rosa María Falgàs i Casanovas is a sociologist with a background in adult education for, and with, the elderly. She coordinates European projects of the General Adult Education Department of the Government of Catalunya, and acts as a vice-president of the Federation of Adult Education Associations of Spain (FAEA), of the European Association for the Education of Adults (EAEA), and of the International Council for Adult Education (ICAE).

Paul Fordham is currently Honorary Professor at the University of Warwick, UK. He was Director of Adult Education at the University of Southampton for 18 years, having previously worked in Uganda and Kenya. He has acted as educational consultant in many countries.

Jean-Paul Hauteœur is a Senior Research Specialist for the UNESCO Institute for Education who lives in Montreal, Canada. He coordinates research on literacy in industrialized countries and edits the »Alpha« research series.

Marc-Laurent Hazoumé is a Senior Research Specialist at the UNESCO Institute for Education in Hamburg, having taught at the National University of Benin and held senior positions in that country with the National Centre for Applied Linguistics, the Ministry of Education and the National Institute of Educational Research and Training.

R. Barry Hobart is a Consultant to UNESCO / UNEVOC in Berlin, having been Professor and Head of the Centre for Human Resource Studies and Adult Education at the University of South Australia. He has acted as consultant on work and adult education in some 15 countries.

Susanne Jeanson is a literacy worker with the »Fédération canadienne pour l'alphabétisation en français«, which links Canadian provincial literacy organizations working in French.

René Karottki is a Danish Folk High School teacher who has worked with the UN and other bodies on international programmes in adult education, the environment and development.

Tony Kaye is a course designer and researcher at the Institute of Educational Technology of the British Open University, specializing in online courses, and has been involved in distance education in Africa, Asia and Latin America.

Linda King de Jardón is Deputy Director and Senior Research Specialist at the UNESCO Institute for Education in Hamburg. Previously, she worked in Mexico for the MacArthur Foundation and the ASHOKA Foundation, and the National Institute of Adult Education. Her publications concentrate on adult education and indigenous peoples.

Ove Korsgaard was a teacher and principal in Danish Folk High Schools for over 20 years, and chairman of the Danish Association of Folk High Schools.

He is now a researcher at the Royal Danish School of Educational Studies. His publications focus on body culture and adult education.

Walter Leal Filho is a Professor at the Institute of Environmental Communication, University of Lüneburg, Germany, teaching international issues and coordinating European projects. He is the editor of a book on lifelong and environmental education to be launched at CONFINTEA.

Carolyn Medel-Añonuevo is a Research Specialist on Women's Education at the UNESCO Institute for Education. Previously, she taught sociology at the University of the Philippines and was Director of the Center for Women's resources, a NGO in that country.

Adoum N'Gaba-Waye is a Consultant to the UNESCO Institute for Education and a post-doctoral researcher in African prehistory at the University of Hamburg. He is the author of environmental and literacy teaching materials for a number of African countries.

O.J. Sikes has been Chief of Education, Communication and Youth, United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) since 1975, having previously launched UNESCO's worldwide population education programme in schools and pioneered the community organization approach to family planning in the United States.

Albert C. Tuljman is Principal Administrator at the OECD, specializing in comparative education, and has also acted as a consultant to the European Commission and UNESCO. He has published numerous books and articles on adult education and comparative measurement in the social sciences.

**List
of
Authors**

NOTES